Report

drawn up on behalf of the Committee on Public Health and the Environment

on the proposal from the Commission of the European Communities to the Council (Doc. 303/73) for a directive concerning the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to the composition of petrol — Problem of the lead content of petrol

Rapporteur: Mr W. MULLER
By letter of 19 December 1973 the President of the Council of the European Communities requested the European Parliament, pursuant to Article 100 of the EEC Treaty, to deliver an opinion on the proposal from the Commission of the European Communities to the Council for a directive concerning the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to the composition of petrol - Problem of the lead content of petrol.

The President of the European Parliament referred this proposal to the Committee on Public Health and the Environment as the committee responsible and to the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs for its opinion.

On 30 October 1973 the Committee on Public Health and the Environment appointed Mr Willi Müller rapporteur.

It considered this proposal at its meetings of 19 February 1974, 3 February, 21 April, 26 May, 30 June, 2 October and 20 October 1975.

At its meeting of 20 October 1975 the committee adopted the motion for a resolution and the explanatory statement by 18 votes to 1.

Present: Mr Della Briotta, chairman; Mr W. Müller, rapporteur, Mr Adams, Lord Bethell, Mr Brégégère, Mr Corona (deputizing for Mr Schwabe), Mr Didier, Mr Duval, Mr Evans, Mrs Kruchow, Mr Noé, Mr Nolan (deputizing for Mr Herbert), Mr Nyborg (deputizing for Mr Liogier), Mrs Orth, Mr Osborn (deputizing for Mr Spicer), Mr Premoli, Mr Rosati, Mr Springorum and Mr Vandewiele (deputizing for Mr Martens).

The opinion of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs is attached.
C O N T E N T S

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. EXPLANATORY STATEMENT</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Opinion of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs 20
The Committee on Public Health and the Environment hereby submits to the European Parliament the following motion for a resolution, together with explanatory statement:

MOTION FOR A RESOLUTION

embodying the opinion of the European Parliament on the proposal from the Commission of the European Communities to the Council for a directive concerning the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to the composition of petrol - Problem of the lead content of petrol

The European Parliament,

- having regard to the proposal from the Commission of the European Communities to the Council, 1
- having been consulted by the Council pursuant to Article 100 of the EEC Treaty (Doc. 303/73),
- having regard to the report of the Committee on Public Health and the Environment and the opinion of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs (Doc. 339/75),

1. Approves the Commission's proposal for a directive to reduce the lead content of petrol used in motor vehicle engines only on condition that its date of entry into force be changed so that from 1 January 1977 petrol shall be placed on the Community internal market only where its lead compound content does not exceed 0.40 grams (g) per litre (1);

2. Is unable to approve the proposal for a directive so long as it provides for the reduction in a second stage, from 1 January 1978, of the lead content of regular petrol to 0.15 g/l, and would like the Commission instead to submit by 1 January 1979, in the framework of a general report, a supplementary proposal for a directive which would take into account experience gained and latest findings;

3. Again advocates the principle of prevention, which requires a limitation of the lead content of motor vehicle exhaust gases since it cannot at present be proved scientifically that the ever-increasing concentrations of lead in the atmosphere of European cities is not prejudicial to public health;

1 OJ No. C 8, 31.1.1974, p.28
4. Agrees with the Commission that in the interests of prompt and effective protection of the environment, the Member States should be permitted to prescribe a reduction of the lead content of petrol at an earlier date than that laid down in the proposed directive, provided this is not prejudicial to the common market;

5. Calls on the Commission to lay down in its proposal for a directive that Member States may prescribe greater reductions of the lead content of petrol than provided for in the directive if
   (a) specific public health requirements make this an urgent necessity,
   and
   (b) the smooth functioning of the common market is no way prejudiced thereby;

6. Insists on the period of six months referred to in Article 7 of the proposed directive for the introduction of the provisions laid down by law, regulation or administrative action which are necessary to comply with the directive, being observed without fail;

7. Expects the Commission to submit a proposal for a directive limiting nitrogen compounds in motor vehicle exhaust gases, since petrol contains other harmful substances apart from lead;

8. Calls on the Commission to begin an investigation to establish whether and under what conditions use could be made of improved filtration systems to eliminate the lead content from motor vehicle exhaust gases;

9. Requests the Commission to make the following amendments to its proposal, pursuant to Article 149(2) of the EEC Treaty;

10. Requests its appropriate committee to establish whether the Commission of the European Communities incorporates the amendment proposed by the European Parliament in its proposal and, if necessary, to report accordingly.
PROPOSAL FOR A COUNCIL DIRECTIVE
concerning the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to
the composition of petrol - Problem of the lead content of petrol

Preamble unchanged

1st and 2nd recitals unchanged

3rd recital
Whereas, despite the fact that in
the present state of scientific
knowledge there is no evidence to
prove that existing concentrations
of lead in the atmosphere constitute
a danger to public health, it is
nevertheless necessary to ensure
that these concentrations do not
increase as a result of the growing
density of traffic and, accordingly,
to take precautionary measures for the
purpose of limiting the lead content
in petrol:

4th to 11th recitals unchanged

Article 2
1. As from 1 January 1976, petrol
shall be placed on the Community
internal market only where its lead
compound content, calculated as lead,
does not exceed 0.40 g/l.

2. As from 1 January 1978, regular petrol
shall be placed on the Community internal
market only where its lead content does
not exceed 0.15 g/l. The provisions of
paragraph 1 shall continue to apply in the
case of premium petrol.

---

1 For full text see OJ No. C 8 of 31.1.1974, p.28
3. As from 1 January 1978, intermediate grade petrol between premium and regular quantities shall be placed on the Community internal market only where its lead compound content, calculated in terms of lead, does not exceed the concentration of an equivalent blending of those two qualities.

4. As from the date of adoption of the present directive, the Commission, wishing to continue its efforts to curb air pollution caused by motor vehicles, will report biennially to the Council on:

(a) the effects of implementation of this directive;

(b) the evolution of systems for the lowering of emissions other than lead content in exhaust gases, of techniques of propulsion of vehicles, and of methods of production of low pollution fuels;

(c) the evolution of concentration of different pollutants, particularly of lead content in atmosphere of European cities and their effect on public health.

In addition, depending on data gathered during the progress of these surveys, the Commission will formulate, as soon as possible, all necessary proposals.

In addition, the Commission will submit by 1 January 1979, in the framework of a general report, which takes account of experience gained and latest findings, a supplementary proposal for a directive to further reduce the lead content of petrol.

---

 ARTICLE 3

First paragraph unchanged.

To this end, the Member States shall take all steps necessary to ensure that measurements are made in respect of pollutants emitted in the exhaust gas. The data thus obtained shall be communicated to the Commission.

ARTICLE 4

1. Member States shall not prohibit, restrict or prevent the marketing and use of a petrol on the grounds of its lead content:
   - as from 1 January 1976, where the petrol in question conforms with the provisions of Article 2(1) of this Directive;
   - as from 1 January 1978, where the petrol in question conforms with the provisions of Article 2(2) and (3) of this Directive.

2. By way of derogation from the first subparagraph of the preceding paragraph, Member States shall, prior to 1 January 1978, be empowered to apply the provisions of Article 2(2) and (3).

If this proposal does not lay down final and definitive arrangements, the Commission shall, at the latest before 1 January 1981, present proposals for an overall solution to the problem of lead content in petrol.
3. In addition, Member States may prescribe greater reductions of the lead content of petrol than provided for in the directive if
(a) specific public health requirements make this an urgent necessity, and
(b) this in no way prejudices the smooth functioning of the common market.

Articles 5 to 8 unchanged

Annex I unchanged
EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

I. General remarks

1. The Commission bases its proposal for a directive on Article 100 of the EEC Treaty. The differences in national legislation on the composition of petrol, particularly as regards the limitation of the lead content of petrol used in motor vehicles, constitute obstacles within the Community. They therefore have a direct effect on the operation of the Common Market.

2. One of the assumptions from which the Commission proceeds in its proposal for a directive, however, is that the protection and improvement of public health constitutes a major preoccupation common to all industrialized countries. The Commission further states that, although in the present state of scientific knowledge there is no evidence to prove that existing concentrations of lead in the atmosphere constitute a danger to public health, it is necessary to ensure that these concentrations do not increase as a result of the growing density of traffic. The Commission is therefore convinced that precautionary measures must be taken for the purpose of limiting the lead content of fuels.

3. The Committee on Public Health and the Environment agrees that there is a basic need for effective Community measures in this sector. It considers, moreover, that scientific knowledge of the dangers to health attributable to lead concentrations in the atmosphere must be extended and confirmed by current and proposed research projects.

4. In this regard, your committee generally reaffirms the position it has repeatedly adopted in similar cases in the past: where decisions affecting health policy are concerned, the question is not whether it can be proved that a danger to health exists; what must be asked, rather, is whether it can be proved that there is no danger to health.

5. The Commission's proposal is fully justified both on this count and in view of the subclinical signs that have been observed in certain groups as the result of exposure to lead concentrations in the atmosphere. Possible economic difficulties which may result from the implementation of this directive must be regarded as minimal in the face of likely benefits to public health.

6. Finally, your committee is in full accord with the basic principles of the programme of action of the European Communities on the environment adopted by the Council on 22 November 1973, which refers to prevention in the following terms: 'The best environment policy consists in preventing the creation of pollution or nuisances at source, rather than subsequently trying to counteract their effects.' Your committee recognizes that the Commission's proposals take this principle of prevention into account.

7. Your committee has accordingly invited the Commission to amend the third paragraph of the recitals as follows: 'Whereas since in the present state of scientific knowledge there is no evidence to prove that existing concentrations of lead in the atmosphere do not constitute a danger to public health, it is necessary to take precautionary measures to limit the lead content of petrol, with account also to be taken of the fact that these lead concentrations are constantly increasing as a result of the growing density of traffic'.

8. In addition, your committee notes that lead undeniably represents a threat to human and animal health. This serious threat affects not only the respiratory passages, but also the food chain. There is sufficient evidence to show that agricultural products cultivated in the proximity of motorways are contaminated by lead from the exhausts of motor vehicles. For that reason, the Council adopted on 17 December 1973, on the basis of a proposal from the Commission, a directive on the fixing of maximum permitted levels for undesirable substances and products in feeding stuffs¹, in which lead is listed as an undesirable substance for the reasons already mentioned.

9. In conclusion, your committee refers to the Commission's activities with regard, for example, to its proposed directives on

- the limitation of extractable quantities of lead and cadmium in ceramic articles intended to come into contact with food (Doc. 458/74)²,

- biological standards for lead, screening of the population for lead and air quality standards for lead (Doc. 93/75)³

as well as the research projects for direct and indirect action sponsored by the Commission and approved by the European Parliament, which serve to emphasize further the need for the proposal for a directive under consideration.

II. Discussion of the individual articles of the proposal for a directive

10. Article 1 contains the following definitions for petrol, premium petrol and regular petrol:

- petrol is any fuel intended for the operation of internal combustion spark-ignited engines used for the propulsion of vehicles.

- premium petrol is any petrol with a research octane rating ⁴ of not less than 98 and a motor octane rating of not less than 87.

¹ OJ No. L 38, 11.2.1974, p. 31

² See also the report by Mr JAHN (Doc. 18/75) on this proposal for a directive.

³ See also report by Mr NOE' on this proposal for a directive (PE 41,098/rev.)

⁴ The research octane rating denotes petrol quality. In the case of premium petrol, it is between 98 and 100 and for regular petrol between 90 and 92; for petrol without additives the research octane rating is 90 or 91 in the case of premium petrol and 85 in the case of regular petrol.
regular petrol is any petrol with a research octane rating of not less than 90.

Your committee agrees with these definitions.

11. Article 2 is the most important one in the directive. It specifies the following maximum permissible lead content in petrolys:

- from 1 January 1976 (first stage): 0.40 g/l in all petrolys,
- from 1 January 1978 (second stage):
  (a) 0.15 g/l in regular petrol,
  (b) 0.40 g/l in premium petrol (i.e. unchanged)

The lead content of intermediate grade petrol between premium and regular qualities shall also not exceed the concentration of an equivalent blending of those two qualities.

The Commission shall also report to the Council every two years on

- the effects of implementation of the directive,
- the evolution
  (a) of systems for the lowering of emissions other than lead content in exhaust gases,
  (b) techniques of propulsion of vehicles, and
  (c) methods of production of low pollution fuels,
- the evolution of concentrations of different pollutants, particularly of lead content in the atmosphere of European cities and their effect on public health.

On the basis of data gathered throughout these continuous surveys, the Commission will formulate as soon as possible all necessary proposals.

Finally, the Commission will present proposals for an overall solution of the problem of lead content in petrol by 1 January 1980 at the latest.

12. The arguments for the reduction in maximum lead concentrations in petrol proposed by the Commission can be summarized as follows:

- The production of petrol satisfying the requirements of the directive will not cause any notable difficulties in the Member States, in particular the structure of the refineries in the Community will make it possible to produce appropriate petrol qualities within the time limits provided for in the directive.
According to motor car manufacturers, lead can be easily replaced by other petrol additives with equivalent anti-knocking qualities.

Variations in lead content in petrol in the individual Member States may lead to distortion of competition, which is particularly prejudicial to small and medium-sized undertakings.

No increase in the cost of petrol is to be expected as a result of the requirements of the directive.

According to the Commission's information, in the case of application of the directive, the estimated rise in crude oil demand will be 1% of 4%, i.e. within relatively narrow limits.

According to expert opinion, the use of grades of petrol with a low lead content can be expected to produce a reduction in maintenance costs for engines and exhausts.

The speed restrictions in the Community which the Commission wishes to achieve should produce a tendency towards greater use of regular petrol, which is beneficial for the environment, as, under the provisions in the directive, regular petrol will have a much lower lead content (0.15 g/l) than premium petrol (0.40 g/l) from 1 January 1978.

According to statistical information, the number of motor vehicles using regular petrol and exported from the Community to third countries is continuously increasing, a trend particularly in evidence on the large American market which is of interest to the Community.
Moreover, the implementation of the first stage will, on the basis of experience in the German Federal Republic, result in no adverse effects on motor vehicles and no increase in costs to consumers or manufacturers.

This measure will bring about a reduction of around 27% in the lead emitted in the exhaust gases of motor vehicles throughout the Community. Even if vehicle traffic increases at around 6% per year, a reduced level of lead pollution of the air will be ensured for some time to come.

(b) The reduction in the lead content of regular petrol to 0.15 g/l as from 1 January 1978 should be postponed for the time being. Instead, the Commission is instructed to submit a supplementary proposal for a directive by 1 January 1979 in the framework of a general report which takes into account experience gained and latest findings. This request, made in paragraph 2 of the motion for a resolution, was approved unanimously by your committee, with two abstentions. It entails the deletion of Article 2(2) and (3) of the proposal for a directive and a corresponding amendment to Article 2(4)(b).

In reaching this decision, your committee took into account the misgivings of its members that implementation of the second stage proposed by the Commission would mean:

- that the investment needed would be too high and out of all reasonable proportion to the improvement of the environment that could be expected, and,

- that increased fuel consumption could put a strain on fuel supplies.

(c) If the Commission cannot put forward a final and definitive solution with the supplementary directive requested by your committee, then it should, in your committee's opinion, propose an overall solution to the problem of the lead content of petrol by 1 January 1981 at the latest. Article 2(4)(c) of the proposal for a directive should be amended accordingly, bearing in mind that because of the postponement of the date of entry into force of the directive, the time limit for the overall solution to the problem should be extended from 1 January 1980 to 1 January 1981.

(d) Your committee has no fundamental objections to the report procedure provided for in the first paragraph of Article 2(4), but it cannot see why these biennial reports should be submitted only to the Council and not to the European Parliament.

Your committee therefore requests that the wording of the first paragraph of Article 2(4) should be amended as follows: '... the Commission will report biennially to the Council and the European Parliament on ...'
14. Under Article 3, the reduction of the lead content shall not be such as to lead to any appreciable increase in the emission of other pollutants in the exhaust gas. In any case, the composition of the petrol shall be such as to conform with the limits stipulated in Directive No. 220/70 of 20 March 1970. That directive lays down a limit for the emission of carbon monoxide and unburnt hydrocarbons from positive-ignition engines.

These seem to be logical provisions and are therefore approved by your committee.

In this connection, your committee invites the Commission to submit a proposal for a directive as soon as possible on the limitation of nitrogen compounds in exhaust gases of motor vehicles. It must not be forgotten that engine exhaust gases also contain pollutants other than lead, in particular, nitrogen compounds.

Your committee also feels that it would be appropriate for the Commission to begin, as a back-up measure to the reduction of lead concentrations in the air, an investigation to establish whether, and if so, under what conditions, lead can be eliminated from vehicle exhaust gases by the use of improved filtration systems. Paragraph 8 of the motion for a resolution, which contains this request, was adopted unanimously by your committee.

The second paragraph of Article 3 provides that the Member States shall take all steps necessary to ensure that measurements are made of the emission of pollutants in engine exhaust gases. The data thus obtained will be communicated to the Commission.

Your committee again insists that the information should not only be communicated to the Commission, but also to the European Parliament. The second paragraph of Article 3 should be amended accordingly.

15. Under Article 4(1), the Member States may not prohibit, restrict or prevent the marketing and use of petrol on the grounds of its composition,

- as from 1 January 1976, where the petrol in question conforms with the provisions of Article 2(1) of this directive,

- as from 1 January 1978, where the petrol in question conforms with the provisions of Article 2(2) and (3) of this directive.

Since implementation of the first stage would, if your committee's suggestion is adopted, be postponed for a year and the second stage would be deferred for the time being, this provision must be amended accordingly.

16. Under Article 4(2), the Member States may depart from the provision under which the lead content of petrol must not exceed 0.40 g/l as from 1 January 1976 and apply the more stringent provisions (0.15 g/l) before 1 January 1978.
Your committee considers it is reasonable to give the Member States the general option of bringing both stages into operation earlier than provided for in the Community directive, in the interests of timely and effective protection of the environment.

This provision must also be amended in accordance with the decision to postpone the second stage. Your committee basically agrees with the Commission, however, that, in the interests of prompt and effective protection of the environment, the Member States should be permitted to prescribe reductions in the lead content of fuels at an earlier date, provided this is not prejudicial to the common market.

This viewpoint, expressed in paragraph 4 of the motion for a resolution, was approved by your committee by 15 votes to 1 with 1 abstention.

Your committee feels, moreover, that it is essential that Member States whose populations are especially threatened by the density of motor vehicle traffic and by climatic conditions must be free to reduce the lead content of petrol to a greater extent than provided for in the proposal for a directive in the interests of effective protection of the environment. This view is further supported by the fact that it is open to the governments of the Member States, pursuant to the Agreement of the representatives of the Member States meeting in the Council on the General Programme of 28 May 1969 on the elimination of technical obstacles to trade arising from discrepancies in legal and administrative provisions, to take action on an independent national basis if this is urgently necessary for reasons of health or security. It is also in accordance with the programme of action of the European Communities on the environment adopted by the Council on 22 November 1973 which, in the third paragraph of Title II(II) of the principles of a Community environment policy states: 'This Community environment policy is aimed, as far as possible, at the coordinated and harmonized progress of national policies without, however, hampering potential or actual progress at the national level'.

Your committee is not unaware that measures considered necessary by a Member State must not adversely affect the effective operation of the common market. In this connection, it notes that the basic Community objectives of harmonization of the market and protection of health and the natural environment are equally important and knows that this is also the view of public opinion in Europe.

---

1 OJ No. C 76, 17.6.1969, p. 10
Your committee therefore asks the Commission to amend Article 4 accordingly. It makes this request in paragraph 5 of the motion for a resolution, which was adopted by 14 votes to 2.

17. Under Article 5 the octane ratings and the lead content are to be measured in accordance with the control procedures set out in Annex I.

Your committee agrees with this.

18. Article 6 places upon the Member State the obligation to take the necessary measures to comply with the prescribed limits for lead content if it is found during the control procedures provided for in Article 5 that a petrol fails to conform with the requirements.

Unfortunately, this provision can only take effect when infringements have been discovered, i.e. when it is too late. Nevertheless your committee thinks it is reasonable, provided it is ensured that it is strictly observed.

19. Under Article 7 (1) Member States are to introduce the provisions laid down by law, regulation or administrative action which are necessary to comply with this directive within six months from the time of its notification and shall forthwith inform the Commission accordingly.

Your committee again insists that this time limit of 6 months is actually observed, as urgent action is needed. It makes this request in paragraph 6 of the motion for a resolution, which was adopted unanimously.

20. Under Article 7 (2) Member States are to ensure that the Commission is informed of any draft provisions laid down by law, regulation or administrative action which they propose to adopt in the field governed by the directive, allowing the Commission sufficient time to make its own observations on these.

This provision complies with a wish frequently expressed by your committee and is therefore welcomed.

III. Opinion of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs

21. The opinion of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs, which is attached, was submitted in the form of a letter from its chairman to the chairman of your committee on 27 June 1975.

The committee asked for its opinion also recognized the need to reduce the lead content of petrol in the interests of public health. Moreover, it is aware of the advantages which would result from harmonization of legislation in the field covered by the directive and the alignment of the conditions of competition, the free movement of both fuels and motor vehicles and the
reduction in manufacturing costs resulting from the application of uniform regulations. Your committee on Public Health and the Environment therefore unanimously approves the proposal.
Letter from the chairman of the committee, Mr Leenhardt to Mr Della Briotta, chairman of the Committee on Public Health and the Environment.

Brussels, 27 June 1975

Dear Mr Della Briotta,

On 28 May 1975 the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs was asked to deliver an opinion on a proposal for a Council directive concerning the approximation of the laws of the Member States relating to the composition of petrol - problem of the lead content.

The Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs examined this proposal for a directive at its meeting of 26 June 1975. It recognized the need to reduce the maximum lead content of petrol in the interests of public health and the advantages which would result from a harmonization of legislations in this field in terms of the equalization of conditions of competition, the free movement of both fuels and motor vehicles, and the reduction in production costs resulting from the application of uniform regulations.

This proposal for a directive was therefore approved on the understanding that, in the interests of speedier and more appropriate examination of proposals for directives on the removal of technical barriers, the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs, whose terms of reference cover all problems connected with the operation of the common market, should be without exception the only committee responsible for all proposals for directives in this field.

Yours sincerely,

(sgd) LEENHARDT

1 The following were present: Mr Leenhardt, chairman; Sir Brandon Rhys Williams, vice-chairman; Mr Artzinger, Mr Burgbacher, Mr Carpentier, Mr Flämig, Mr Lange, Mr Schwörrer and Mr Suck.