European Communities

EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

SESSION DOCUMENTS

English Edition

22 May 1992

A3-0193/92/Annexes

REPORT

of the Committee on Foreign Affairs and Security on EC-Turkey relations

Rapporteur: Mrs DURY

ANNEXES: Opinions

- of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development
- of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy
- of the Committee on External Economic Relations
- of the Committee on Social Affairs, Employment and the Working Environment
- of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection

DOC EN\RR\208991

PE 153.446/Annexes Or. FR/EN

- C Series Documents received from other Institutions (e.g. Consultations)

A Series: Reports - B series: Motions for Resolutions, Oral Questions.

= Consultation procedure requiring a single reading

L [****II**

of Parliament

Cooperation procedure (second reading) which requires the votes of the majority of the Members

= Cooperation procedure (first reading)

*** = Parliamentary assent which requires the votes of the majority of the current Members of Parliament

CONTENTS

	<u> </u>	age
Opinion of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development	•	3
Opinion of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy		6
Opinion of the Committee on External Economic Relations		12
Opinion of the Committee on Social Affairs, Employment and the Working Environment		18
Opinion of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health		31

OPINION

of the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development

for the Committee on Foreign Affairs and Security

Draftsman: Mr Paul HOWELL

At its meeting of 23 May 1991 the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development appointed Mr Howell draftsman.

At its meetings of 28 and 29 October 1991, 29 and 30 January and 25 and 26 March 1992 it considered the draft opinion.

At the last meeting it adopted the conclusions as a whole, unopposed with 1 abstention.

The following took part in the vote: Vázquez Fouz, vice-chairman and acting chairman; Lane, vice-chairman; Howell, draftsman; Bocklet, Conan, (for Verbeek), Funk, Garcia, Görlach, Keppelhoff-Wiechert, Maher (for Kofoed), Mantovani (for Mottola), Morris, Navarro, Rothe, Santos López, Saridakis, Sierra Bardaji, Sonneveld, Welsh and Wilson.

In response to Turkey's application for accession in 1987 the Commission delivered an opinion on 17 December 1989 to the effect that it would be premature to accept this application 1 . The problem of relations between Turkey and the EEC has since been very widely debated 2 .

In agriculture the situation in EEC-Turkey relations is as follows:

- Turkey and the Community have undertaken to liberalize trade, including agricultural trade, during the 22-year transition period (to 1995³) set out in the Association Agreement. For a wide variety of reasons, not as much progress has been made as desirable.
- Since 1 January 1987 it has been possible to import most Turkish agricultural products free of customs duties (except certain products on which restrictions have been retained). The concessions do not apply to the additions to the list of processed agricultural products which were usually classified as industrial products. Thus duty exemption is limited.
- To date, Turkey has not made significant reductions in customs duties (except on certain products treated as equivalent to industrial products). The Turkish import regime is extremely complex indeed it appeared at one time that there was no coherent tariff. Certain reductions in customs duties made since 1989 are of course welcome. However, in some cases, these reductions in levies have been made on additional levies imposed, i.e. they are reductions in previous increases.
- These additional levies were imposed after 1984 on a series of imported products containing certain component agricultural products. The Turkish authorities regard these additional levies (for a Mass Housing Fund or Price Stabilization Fund) as measures designed to finance mass housing construction or to stabilize domestic prices. For the Community these are levies equivalent to customs duties and are collected in violation of the provisions of the Additional Protocol. The draftsman wonders whether such levies are GATT consistent.
- Pursuant to Article 35 of the Additional Protocol the two parties are committed to a certain amount of harmonization of their agricultural policies. However, nothing significant has been undertaken in this connection hitherto, although the draftsman understands that studies in two pilot sectors (fruit and vegetables as well as cereals) have been initiated.

For the reasons set out above, the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development feels bound to submit the following conclusions to the Political Affairs Committee:

SEC(89) 2290 final (Opinion of the Commission on Turkey's application for accession)

² PE 134.338, 28 September 1989

PE 143.040, 20 June 1990 (EEC-Turkey Joint Parliamentary Committee)

OJ No. 217, 29 December 1964, p. 3687 (Agreement establishing an association between the EEC and Turkey)

The Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries and Rural Development :

- 1. Considers, in agreement with the Commission, that at this stage it would be premature to contemplate accession by Turkey at this time;
- 2. Considers moreover that the Common Agricultural Policy could not bear the cost of any such accession at this time; the CAP is in the process of reform, so a definitive judgement on this subject is difficult to make, but it is wrong to argue that because Turkey does not have surpluses of milk, cereals etc, its accession would not add to CAP costs. There would be considerable structural costs at the very least;
- 3. Believes that the proposals submitted by the Commission for strenghthening the Association Agreement should be conditional on the removal by Turkey of charges having equivalent effect to customs duties unilaterally imposed on products with an agricultural content;
- 4. Considers that Turkey must take the necessary steps by dismantling tariff barriers, securing progressive alignment with the CCT, abolishing charges having an equivalent effect to customs duties and achieving greater liberalization of agricultural trade, to secure effective implementation of the Customs Union;
- 5. Is in favour of strengthening industrial and technical cooperation as the most appropriate means of bringing about the necessary harmonization and of taking requisite action on Turkish agricultural structures;
- 6. Approves the resumption of the Fourth Financial Protocol and considers that this should enable the measures outlined above to be implemented; expects Turkey to respect human rights and international law and thus terminate its occupation of Cyprus as a condition for a resumption of the Fourth Financial Protocol;
- 7. Is also in favour of strengthening relations between the EEC and Turkey, but points out that this will only be possible if Turkey lives up to its commitments as set out in the Association Agreement between Turkey and the EEC, the European Parliament resolutions and the decisions taken at European Council meetings and notably at the Dublin Summit and, finally, in the Commission's opinion on Turkey's application for accession to the EC';
- 8. Requests the Commission to report to Parliament within twelve months on the progress of negotiations on agricultural trade.

<u>OPINION</u>

of the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy

for the Political Affairs Committee

Draftsman: Mr de DONNEA

At its meeting of 31 May 1991 the Committee on Economic and Monetary Affairs and Industrial Policy appointed Mr de DONNEA draftsman.

At its meetings of 30-31 October 1991 and 7-8 November 1991 it considered the draft opinion.

At the latter meeting it unanimously adopted the conclusions as a whole.

The following took part in the vote: Beumer, chairman; de Montesquiou, vice-chairman; de Donnea, draftsman; Bofill Abeilhe, Caudron, Colom i Naval, Fitzgerald, Herman, Merz, Metten, Patterson, Roumeliotis, Siso Cruellas, Van Hemeldonck (for Hoff) and Wettig.

1. The economic situation in Turkey

After a serious economic crisis in the 1970s, Turkey experienced steady economic growth in the last decade, with an annual average of 5.4% for the period 1980-1987.

This growth resulted largely from the strong growth of the processing industries (in particular textiles and clothing) but also from certain production sectors (glass, cement, aluminium pig iron, carpets, leather, etc.). However, it slowed down in 1988 (0.1%) and in 1989 (1.4%) (OECD figures).

The 1980s were also characterized by a programme of economic liberalization and deregulation seeking to restrict the public sector to areas which depend on it (in particular transport infrastructure, telecommunications and energy) and to subject the production of goods and provision of services to market forces.

At the end of 1989, the Commission's report noted that the process of economic liberalization with a view to improving the competitive position of Turkish industry was still far from complete if the standards in force in the European Community were applied. In particular, import duties and export subsidies are incompatible with EC legislation and indeed with the additional protocol to the Association Agreement.

The Turkish economy may be roughly described as follows:

- a high external debt of \$ 36 billion (60% of GNP), of which debt servicing alone represents \$ 7.1 billion (12% of GNP);
- the rate of inflation remains high: 67% in 1989; 60.3% in 1990; 64% in 1991. The OECD predicts 56% in 1992;
- unemployment is difficult to assess as there is no unemployment benefit and therefore no obligation to register. However, according to the OECD, the trend appears to be an upwards one:

 1988:
 9.5%

 1989:
 10.2%

 1990:
 10.1%

 1991:
 11.1%

 1992:
 11.4%

The population growth rate was 2.5% for the period 1980-1985, and this should be maintained until the end of the century.

- As regards external trade, the balance of payments current account improved during the 1980s to show a surplus in 1988. This trend was maintained in 1989.

In 1990 the Turkish trade balance was again in deficit, but this was offset for by revenue from tourism and transfers of funds by Turkish workers in the EEC.

Turkey exported 53.2% of its products to the EEC in 1990, with total imports from the EEC representing 41.8%.

This trade deficit amounted to \$ 2.5 billion for Turkey in 1990.

A particular problem is posed by exports of Turkish textiles, which are subject to voluntary restraint.

The Gulf War naturally had a considerable impact on the conditions of economic and social development in Turkey. The most recent studies (those by the Commission of 17 December 1989 and the OECD study of January 1990) must therefore be seen in perspective.

The influence of the Gulf War on the Turkish economy involves several factors:

- loss of revenue from tourism;
- loss of revenue from exports to Iraq and from the transport of Iraqi oil;
- cost of the increased price of petroleum products;
- non-reimbursement of the Iraqi debt;
- loss of contracts in Iraq for Turkish businessmen.

It is difficult to quantify this impact: for 1990 it has been estimated at a \$ 3 billion foreign exchange deficit. For 1991-92 it should amount to \$ 5 billion.

Since the beginning of the hostilities in the Gulf, the Community has already granted aid of ECU 175 million to Turkey.

2. Relations between the European Community and Turkey

Turkey officially applied to join the European Community on 14 April 1987.

The Commission delivered its opinion on 18 December 1990.

This states that no requests for the opening of negotiations could be considered before 1993 because of the priority given to completion of the internal market and the achievement of Economic and Monetary Union, and because of the difference in economic and social development. The Commission opinion also refers to political considerations, in particular those linked to respect for human rights and the Cyprus problem.

The Council adopted this opinion on 5 February 1990, while stating that the Community has a fundamental interest in stepping up its relations with Turkey and in helping it to complete the process of economic and political modernization.

In 1963 Turkey became the second state (after Greece in 1962) to conclude an association agreement with the Community. Since then, loans amounting to ECU 695 million have been granted to Turkey under three financial protocols. This agreement provides for the establishment of a customs union in three phases, beginning with the development of commercial relations and freedom of movement for goods, services and persons, political coordination and, in certain circumstances, the possibility of accession.

Various events have delayed the establishment of the customs union.

Furthermore, the fourth financial protocol initialled in 1981 (worth ECU 600 m) has not yet been signed. On 7 June 1990 the Commission adopted a proposal for a Council decision seeking to put this fourth protocol into effect.

In addition, the Commission communication on relations with Turkey sets out a series of proposals seeking to enable Turkey to reduce its development gap vis-à-vis the Community and to get as close to it as possible.

These proposals involve:

- 1. The establishment of the customs union by the end of 1995; this means that Turkey will adopt the CCT, will catch up as regards tariff dismantling, will abolish export charges levied on certain raw materials and agricultural products, as well as charges equivalent to customs duties. Provided Turkey meets its commitments, the Community will return to the arrangements of the association agreement as regards voluntary restraint in textiles and clothing.
- Technical cooperation and assistance in the field of macroeconomic and monetary policy, industry, agriculture, services (in particular financial), transport, telecommunications, energy, the environment, science and technology, tourism, training, the arts and its media and the social field.
- 3. Financial cooperation; the fourth protocol consists of ECU 225 m in EIB loans from own resources, ECU 325 m in soft loans and ECU 50 m in grants.
- 4. Political cooperation, which will be developed by stepping-up the political dialogue.

The 32nd sitting of the EEC-Turkey Association Council, which had not met since 1986, was held in Brussels on 30 September 1991.

On that occasion the mutual interest of the Community and Turkey in stepping up their relations was reaffirmed. In the economic field the Community pointed to the very positive trade results (ECU 6 billion in imports in 1990, including 3.8 billion from manufactures as against ECU 7.7 billion in exports) and hoped that a solution could be found to the problems which still hampered the establishment of a customs union. Operations intended to bring the Turkish economy closer to that of the EEC are under way in several fields (energy, medical and health research, the environment).

The Council recently concluded with Turkey a two-year extension of the arrangement concerning voluntary restraint as regards exports of clothing products to the Community. Financing conventions for vocational training projects have also been signed as part of the special aid to Turkey approved in 1980.

Furthermore, Turkey is likely to joint the COST programme for cooperation in the field of medical and health research (COM(90) 573 final - SYN 320).

CONCLUSIONS

1. Over the last decade Turkey has experienced very steady economic growth (5.4% annual average from 1980 to 1987), largely thanks to a programme of economic liberalization and deregulation. The growth rate has slowed, however, in recent years (1990 = 1.4%).

- 2. Until 1989 the Turkish trade balance was in surplus or balanced (a deficit of \$ 2.5 billion reappeared in 1990) and trade relations between Turkey and the EEC, its major trading partner, developed strongly (in 1990 Turkey exported 53% of its products to the EC, including 80% manufactures, while its imports amounted to 41%).
- 3. Despite this progress, there is still a substantial structural development gap between Turkey and the Community, the per capita GDP of that country being only one-third of the Community average.
- 4. Turkey's economy still faces the following difficulties:
 - very great structural disparities in both industrial and agricultural fields (50% of the labour force is still employed in agriculture);
 - macroeconomic imbalances: a very high rate of inflation (64% in 1991), a very heavy external debt (60% of GNP, with debt servicing representing 12% of GNP) and unemployment running at approximately 11%;
 - a continuing high level of industrial protectionism;
 - a low level of social protection;
 - a substantial and little-publicised state and even armed forces involvement in the economy, and especially in industry.
- 5. The democratization process undertaken in Turkey, having brought about the resumption of the dialogue with the Community since 1989 (meetings of the Joint Parliamentary Committee and the Association Council), justifies a real revival of the association agreement, in particular at the economic level.
- 6. The reassertion, at the last meeting of the EEC-Turkey Association Council on 30 September, of the mutual interest of the Community and Turkey in stepping up their relations must be embodied in reciprocal measures to allow the gradual convergence of the Turkish economy with that of the Community.
- 7. The recent renewal of the of voluntary restraint arrangement for exports of clothing products and the signing of financing conventions for vocational training projects are signs of the new impetus which the Community wishes to give to the association agreement.
- 8. An ambitious technical cooperation and assistance programme must be pursued in the field of macroeconomic policy:
 - in the <u>industrial field</u> (the extension to Turkey of the SMU promotion and information instruments (BC NET), increasing the number of joint ventures and cooperation with European standardization bodies so as to facilitate the alignment of Turkish standards and technical rules with those of the Community);

- in the <u>agricultural field</u> (measures to encourage changes in Turkish agriculture - major irrigation projects are under way - and achieve a maximum of convergence between the agricultural policies pursued by each side);
- in the <u>transport sector</u> (improving the transport system, which is essential for the sound operation of the customs union, and the introduction of an efficient telecommunications system);
- in the <u>environmental</u> field (measures to clean up the Mediterranean, such as those under MEDSPA, given their impact on activities of great economic significance to the region, such as tourism);
- in the <u>research sector</u> (involvement of Turkey in the European COST and EUREKA programmes);
- in the <u>financial field</u> (improving financial services in Turkey and growing participation of Community investment, in particular through new schemes run by the EIB).
- 9. The Turkish government must rapidly take measures to:
 - guarantee the unrestricted exercise of all political, cultural and trade union rights in Turkey and arrive at a fair solution to the Cyprus problem;
 - permit the completion of the customs union by 1995, in particular tariff dismantling, alignment with the CCT and the abolition of charges with equivalent effect, together with a more determined approach to combating counterfeits.

In this way, in both the political and economic fields, conditions can be created for the eligibility of Turkey to join the Community at some future date.

OPINION

(Rule 120 of the Rules of Procedure)

of the Committee on External Economic Relations

for the Political Affairs Committee

Draftsman: Mr Giulio Cesare GALLENZI

At its meeting of 29 November 1990 the Committee on External Economic Relations appointed Mr Gallenzi draftsman.

At its meetings of 20 February 1992 and 23 March 1992 it considered the draft opinion.

At the latter meeting it adopted the conclusions as a whole unanimously.

The following took part in the vote: De Clercq, chairman; Cano Pinto, first vice-chairman; Stavrou, second vice-chairman; Gallenzi, draftsman; Hindley, Izquierdo Rojo (for Bettiza), Janssen van Raay (for Chabert), Mihr, Miranda de Lage, Moorhouse, Ortiz Climent (for Lemmer), Price, Sonneveld (for Peijs), Suárez González and Visser (for Benoit).

1. EC/Turkey Relations

In assessing relations between the Community and Turkey (which are based mainly on the Association Agreement and Association Council decisions as well as subsequent protocols to the agreement), the Committee on External Economic Relations should concentrate on the economic and trade aspects and, as far as possible, leave aside problems of a political nature although these undoubtedly affect relations between the two parties.

It should however been borne in mind that ever since the military coup d'état in Turkey in 1980 the European Parliament has expressed reservations about strengthening relations with Turkey, and has even blocked appropriations entered in the budget by the Commission and the Council for increasing cooperation.

The European Parliament defined its position with regard to political problems and relations between the Community and Turkey in the Walter Report of 15 September 1988 which stated that extension of the Association Agreement could only be considered when democracy in Turkey was fully restored and human rights were respected. At the same time it was prepared to consider a resumption of the Association since significant progress had been made towards restoring parliamentary democracy.

Parliament also maintained that problems in the Aegean and the occupation of part of Cyprus by Turkish troops compromised political stability in the region and affected political relations between the EEC and Turkey.

(a) Characteristics of the Association Agreement

The aim of the Association Agreement signed in Ankara on 12 September 1963 is to strengthen economic and trade relations between the EEC and Turkey, taking account of the need to aid Turkey's economic development and increase the level of employment and improve living conditions there. The means to this end are the creation of a customs union, coordination of economic policies, gradual liberalization of the services sector, freedom of movement for workers and freedom of establishment.

(b) Obstacles to the functioning of the Association

The functioning of the Association Agreement has been hampered by a series of major difficulties that can be attributed to both sides:

- in 1976 <u>Turkey</u> stopped making the annual reductions in customs duties needed for the customs union. Reductions have however been made regularly since 1988. Turkey has however reduced customs duties for all countries so that there has been no preference for the Community. And if Turkish tariffs vis-à-vis third countries were to be lower than the common customs tariff, the result could be a deflection of trade,
- Turkey has still not granted the Community any agricultural trade preferences,
- ever since 1984 Turkey has gradually introduced a series of taxes on imports that can be regarded as having the equivalent effect of customs duties,

- intellectual property in Turkey does not seem to be properly protected, particularly in the case of trade marks and the control of imitations,
- on the <u>Community's</u> side however imports of Turkish textiles (the most vital component of Turkey's industrial production) are restricted under an informal agreement reached with Turkish producers. Turkey has in fact refused to negotiate an agreement under the MFA. It is difficult to reconcile the existence of this quota with the Association Agreement even though it is not legally binding,
- the Community has also not respected the undertaking given in the additional protocol to the Association Agreement to bring about freedom of movement for workers between the Community and Turkey by November 1986.
- financial cooperation is at a standstill because the fourth Financial Protocol (ECU 600 m in soft loans) has not been approved because the Council could not reached the unanimity needed to sign the protocol.

It should be noted however that measures taken to help countries hardest hit by the Golf crisis included an ECU 175 m interest-free loan to Turkey for a ten year period.

The Association Council meeting on 30 September 1991 (the first since 1986) also undoubtedly marked the resumption of the Association.

2 Future prospects

On 14 April 1987 the Turkish Government formally applied for membership of the Community.

On the whole, the opinion delivered by the Commission in December 1989 is negative but it does indicate the direction to be taken gradually to strengthen economic ties in order to bring about some economic convergence.

The Commission subsequently presented the 'Matutes package' 1 which contains a series of general guidelines for stepping up cooperation as well as a proposal for the conclusion of the fourth Financial Protocol.

The main points proposed are:

- bringing about customs union by 1995
- stepping up cooperation in a number of areas connected with customs union
- reestablishing financial cooperation
- promoting political cooperation.

As for stepping up cooperation, the Commission takes the view that it should concentrate on the following areas:

- macroeconomic and monetary policy,
- industry,
- agriculture,
- services, particularly financial services,
- transport,

¹ SEC(90) 1017

- telecommunications,
- energy,
- the environment,
- science and technology,
- social affairs.
- tourism,
- training, culture and the media.

Conclusions

The Committee on External Economic Relations

- (a) considers it necessary to strengthen EC/Turkey economic relations through implementation of the Association Agreement and acts subsequently adopted, and insists that Turkey and the EC fulfil their obligations under this Agreement,
- (b) points out that a customs union between the Community and Turkey will put considerable pressure on Turkey's economy because of the differences in production capacity, technological level and infrastructures between the Community and Turkey; the hoped-for approximation of Turkish and Community laws on working conditions and environmental protection (particularly in the Mediterranean) would create further problems,
- (c) consequently stresses the need for efforts by Turkey to adapt its production structures in order to attain the objectives of the Association, within the framework of the strategy adopted by the Community on relations with Mediterranean countries; therefore advocates aid for Turkey in order to achieve the above objectives more easily, always on condition that it complies with the spirit of the conclusions reached at the European Council of 25 and 26 June 1990 on the implications of the situation in Cyprus for EC-Turkey relations.
- (d) is in favour of a resumption of cooperation with Turkey along the lines suggested in the 'Matutes package' and stresses the importance of increased EC/Turkey economic relations for the economic and political stability of the region.
- (e) Also stresses the positive role which, through cooperation in the Black Sea area and the strengthening of relations with the former Soviet republics of Central Asia, the Turkish economy can play in promoting development and economic integration there.

ANNEX: Turkish foreign trade Source : OECD

Imports by commodities

\$ million

		1980	1981	1982	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989
1.	Agriculture and livestock	50	125	176	138	417	375	457	782	499	1 041
11.	Mining and quarrying	4 006	4 098	3 961	3 864	3 908	4 186	3 4 40			
	Oil	3 862	3 878	3 749	3 665	3 637		2 440	3 400	3 204	3 387
	Crude oil	2 952	3 258				3 612	2 008	2 956	2 777	2 950
	Oil products	910	620	3 528	3 242	3 373	3 321	1 808	2 711	2 434	2 456
	Other			221	423	264	291	200	245	343	494
	Other	144	220	212	199	271	574	432	444	427	437
Ш.	Industrial products	3 759	4 641	4 657	5 177	6 432	7 052	8 302	10.101		
	Agriculture-based processed products	301	228	176	203	434	481		10 101	10 632	11 323
	Industrial products	3 458	4 412	4 482	4 974	5 998	- •	480	720	738	843
	Chemicals	727	919	839			6 565	7 822	9 381	9 894	10 482
	Fertiliser	395	280		1 032	1 212	1 111	1 263	1 638	1 781	1 710
	Rubber and plastics	181		51	119	128	183	159	299	203	395
	Textiles	79	240	237	251	359	343	372	488	525	485
	Glass and ceramics		78	103	98	117	146	161	204	260	297
	Iron and steel	35	40	34	57	63	63	96	117	141	126
	Non-ferrous metals	462	605	591	675	862	1 060	1 028	1 537	1 655	2 217
		87	141	122	195	220	224	230	418	412	421
	Metal products	23	23	37	30	34	38	51	56	62	57
	Machinery	843	1 223	1 309	1 432	1 618	1 551	2 304	2 454	2 400	2 188
	Electrical appliances	270	336	374	398	573	664	892	940	1 075	1 028
	Motor vehicles	223	356	594	478	517	812	768	550	690	790
	Other industrial products	133	171	191	209	295	370	498	680	695	768
' .	Imports with waiver	94	69	49	56	_	_	_	-		- 30
	Total	7 909	8 933	8 843	9 235	10 757	11 613	11 199	14 283	14 335	15 763

1. Excluding transit trade.

Source: State Institute of Statistics, Monthly Indicators

Exports by commodities¹ \$ million

		1980	1981	1982	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989
I.	Agricultural products	1 672	2 219	2 141	1 881	1 749	1 719	1 886	1 853	2 341	2 127
	Cereals	181	326	337	376	267	234	246	266	441	315
	Fruits and vegetables	754	795	649	591	646	561	820	800	867	789
	Hazelnuts	395	302	241	246	305	255	378	391	359	266
	Dried fruit	187	208	168	120	119	73	177	208	231	195
	Citrus fruit	86	125	77	72	62	58	74	91	90	105
	Other	86	160	163	153	160	175	191	110	187	223
	Industrial crops and forestry products	606	813	741	531	492	659	495	431	696	693
	Cotton	323	348	297	197	168	170	139	20	141	160
	Tobacco	234	395	348	238	216	330	270	314	266	479
	Other	49	70	96	96	108	159	86	97	289	54
	Live animals and sea products	131	285	414	382	343	265	325	356	337	330
II.	Mining and quarrying products	191	194	175	189	240	244	247	272	377	377
III.	Processed and manufactured products	1 047	2 290	3 430	3 658	5 144	5 995	5 324	8 065	8 944	9 088
	Processed agricultural products	209	412	569	670	808	647	667	954	885	919
	Manufactured products	838	1 878	2 861	2 988	4 336	5 348	4 657	7 111	8 059	8 169
	Textiles and clothing	424	803	1 056	1 299	1 875	1 790	1 851	2 707	3 201	3 509
	Hides and leather	50	82	111	192	401	484	345	722	514	605
	Forestry	4	20	33	15	24	106	52	32	22	16
	Chemicals	76	94	148	120	173	266	350	527	734	774
	Rubber and plastics	16	72	60	77	97	108	141	258	352	313
	Petroleum products	39	107	343	232	409	372	178	232	331	254
	Glass and ceramics	36	102	104	108	146	190	158	205	233	258
	Cement	40	198	207	81	56	44	27	7	7	34
	Iron and steel	34	100	362	407	576	969	804	852	1 458	1 349
	Non-ferrous metals	18	30	45	79	86	116	111	134	226	266
	Metal products and machinery	30	85	143	122	134	450	263	788	383	219
	Electrical equipment and products	11	26	75	69	100	119	130	293	294	234
	Other	60	159	174	187	259	334	247	354	304	340
	Total	2 910	4 703	5 746	5 728	7 133	7 958	7 457	10 190	11 662	11 627

Excluding transit trade.
 Source: State Institute of Statistics, Monthly Indicators.

Geographic distribution of foreign trade!

\$ million

				Imports (ci	Ŋ					i	Exports (fo	ob)		
	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989
OECD countries	4 481	5 561	6 362	7 303	9 031	9 237	9 908	2 760	3 740	4 106	4 292	6 444	6 707	7 184
EEC countries	2 596	2 974	3 895	4 565	5 668	5 894	6 059	2 010	2 732	3 204	3 263	4 867	5 098	5 416
of which:								1			5 205		3 0,0	2 410
France	218	243	514	545	609	829	748	181	201	215	299	500	499	598
Germany	1 053	1 172	1 369	1 772	2 110	2 054	2 205	838	1 280	1 391	1 444	2 184	2 149	2 177
Italy	510	629	658	866	1 076	1 006	1 070	423	501	502	580	851	955	978
United Kingdom	441	443	468	520	697	739	728	247	261	539	334	541	576	616
Other OECD countries	1 885	2 587	2 467	2 738	3 363	3 343	3 849	750	1 008	902	1 029	1 577	1 609	1 768
of which:					2 2 2 2 2		3017	1		,01	1 02)	1 311	1 009	1 /00
Japan	349	405	507	684	666	555	530	37	37	43	99	150	209	233
Switzerland	266	234	187	285	365	344	412	286	358	128	162	356	265	175
United States	695	1 073	1 150	1 177	1 363	1 520	2 088	232	368	506	549	713	761	970
Eastern Bloc	802	943	852	872	969	1 102	1 493	245	284	302	311	334	609	1 029
Middle East and North														
Africa	3 387	3 600	3 630	2 041	3 152	2 935	2 927	2 359	2 852	3 288	2 578	3 084	3 530	2 876
of which:												• • • •	5 550	20.0
Iran	1 222	1 548	1 265	221	947	660	233	1 088	751	1 079	564	440	546	561
Iraq	947	943	1 137	769	1 154	1 441	1 650	320	934	961	533	945	986	446
Kuwait	168	98	98	209	75	89	81	87	105	116	121	248	199	168
Libya	793	661	621	292	305	79	286	184	142	59	136	141	218	227
Saudi Arabia	269	216	226	176	168	229	212	365	378	430	357	408	359	365
Other countries	565	647	499	983	1 131	1 100	1 435	364	258	262	276	328	816	539
Total	9 235	10 757	11 343	11 199	14 283	14 374	15 763	5 728	7 134	7 958	7 457	10 190	11 662	11 628

^{1.} Excluding transit trade and non-monetary gold imports. Source: State Institute of Statistics, Monthly Indicators.

Balance of payments¹ \$ million

•	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989
Current account												· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
Exports, fob	2 288	2 261	2 910	4 703	5 890	5 905	7 389	8 255	7 583	10 322	11 929	11 771
Imports, fob	-4 369	-4 815	-7 513	-8 567	-8 518	-8 895	-10 331		-10 664		-13 706	
Trade balance	-2 081	-2 554	-4 603	-3 864	-2 628	-2 990	-2 942	-2 975	-3 081	-3 229	-1 777	-4 201
Services and income, credit	533	708	762	1 316	2 038	2 041	2 366	3 162	3 338	4 195	6 026	7 083
Tourism	234	281	326	380	373	420	548	1 094	950	1 476	2 355	2 557
Interest	0	0	0	0	110	81	146	298	341	382	374	638
Other	299	427	436	936	1 555	1 540	1 672	1 770	2 047	2 337	3 297	3 888
Services and income, debit	-816	-1 377	-1 738	-1 946	-2 639	-2 734	-2 945	-3 184	-3 646	-4 162	→4 812	-5 474
Tourism	-71	-83	-104	-103	-149	-128	-277	-324	-313	-448	-358	-5 65
Interest	-489	-1 010	-1 138	-1 443	-1 565	-1 511	-1 586	-1 753	-2 134	-2 387	-2 799	-2 907
Other	-256	-284	-496	-4 00	-925	-1 095	-1 082	-1 107	-1 199	-1 327	-1 655	-2 002
Private transfers, net	1 086	1 799	2 153	2 559	2 189	1 549	1 885	1 762	1 703	2 066	1 827	3 135
Workers' remittances Other	983 103	1 694 105	2 071 82	2 490 69	2 140 49	1 513 36	1 807 78	1 714 48	1 634 69	2 021 45	1 776 51	3 040 95
Official transfers, net	103	103	18	-1	88	211	197	222	221	324	332	423
Invisibles balance	816	1 141	1 195	1 928	1 676	1 067	1 503	1 962	1 616	2 423	3 373	5 167
				-							-	
Current balance	-1 265	-1 413	-3 408	-1 936	-952	-1 923	-1 439	-1 013	-1 465	-806	1 596	966
Capital account												
Direct investment	34	75	18	95	55	46	113	99	125	106	354	663
Portfolio investment	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	146	282	1 178	1 586
Credit utilisation	2 177	4 722	3 657	2 287	2 632	2 438	2 953	2 185	2 552	3 385	3 124	2 585
Debt repayments	-496	-3 187	-1 628	-1 289	-1 603	-2 136	-1 907	-2 208	-2 173	-2 687	-3 927	4 023
Dresdner Bank scheme, net	0	0	0	0	_ 0	358	568	186	662	755	594	518
Capital balance	1 715	1 610	2 047	1 093	1 084	706	1 727	262	1 312	1 841	1 323	1 329
Basic balance	450	197	-1 361	-843	132	-1 217	288	-751	-153	1 035	2 919	2 295
Short-term capital	402	-1 000	-2	121	98	798	-652	1 479	812	50	-2 281	-554
Assets "	-17	-109	85	360	-181	177	-1 625	127	-313	-945	-1 428	371
Liabilities	419	-891	-87	-239	279	621	973	1 352	1 125	9 95	-853	-925
Errors and omissions	874	651	1 434	649	-75	409	469	-837	-118	-506	515	974
Counterpart items	-4	40	19	68	13	161	-171	233	249	390	-263	51
Overall balance	-26	-112	90	-5	168	152	66	124	790	969	890	2 766
Change in official reserves	26	112	-90	5	-168	-152	66	-124	-790	-969	-890	-2 766
IMF	213	10	423	268	133	77	-138	-104	-245	-320	-469	-253
Official reserves	-187	102	-513	-263	-301	-229	204	-20	-545	-649	-421	-2 513

^{1.} The Central Bank revised balance-of-payments statistics in 1989. In the new series, interest and debt repayments and credit utilisation figures include debt relief adjustments Source: Central Bank of Turkey, Quarterly Bulletin.

<u>O P I N I O N</u>

(Rule 120 of the Rules of Procedure)

of the Committee on Social Affairs, Employment and Working Environment for the Committee on Political Affairs Draftsman: Mr Anthony WILSON

At its meeting of 29 October 1991 the Committee on Social Affairs, Employment and Working Environment appointed Mr WILSON draftsman.

At its meetings of 7 November, 26 November and 17 December 1991 it considered the draft opinion.

At the last meeting it adopted the conclusions as a whole by unanimity.

The following were present for the vote: van Velzen, chairman; Wilson, draftsman, Buron, Cramon-Daiber, van Dijk, Hadjigeorgiou, Hughes, Marques Mendes, McCubbin, McMahon, Menrad, O'Hagan, Oomen-Ruijten, Onur, Pronk, Spencer, Torres Couto, Van Outrive.

I. GENERAL QUESTIONS - IS TURKEY IN EUROPE?

1. POLITICAL AND SOCIAL SITUATION

The Commission of the E.C., in its opinion on Turkey's application for accession 1987, considered in 1989, that it would not be wise for there to be new accession negotiations before 1993^1 . The Commission "left the door open for Turkey to progress its accession aim and suggested a new stage of close" association between it and the E.C.

At the same time the Commission considered also that any decision to open negotiations for accession with any country, including Turkey, must be based on a strong conviction that a positive conclusion is possible, that the candidate country is considered capable, at the end of a transitional period of bearing all the disciplines now applying to Member States, otherwise the further progress of the Community would be hampered. The Commission felt that the Community was in a position to cope with the problems which the integration, albeit progressive, of the candidates into the Community would raise².

In the case of Turkey these two aspects assume a very important significance. It is a very large country (more than 53 million citizens in 1988) with large westernized towns but backward rural areas. Its social and economic development is still much lower than the European average.

On paper, Turkey is a "democratic" country, with party politics based on free elections at all levels of government. However the "shadow" of the generals remains. Turkey is also a "secular" state but there are some fears and allegations of both persecutions and repression of religious and racial minorities (Kurds).

2. OVERALL VIEW OF THE MAIN SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC DATA

Since the beginning of the eighties Turkish economic policy has been aimed at modernizing the country and integrating it internationally. This improvement stopped in the second part of 1988 and in the first 6 months of 1989 (Annex $\rm I)^3$.

According to the OECD the population grew in 1989 and 1990 by an average annual rate of 2.4% (\pm 1.3 million persons per year). Among those between 15 to 64 years the increase was 3% which means an extra 1 million people per year.

^{1 (}SEC(89) 2290 final, p. 3).

² (SEC(89) 2290 final, p. 4).

Economic studies OECD, 16.12/1991, p. 13.

Although there has been intensive industrialization, over half the active population was still engaged, in 1989, in agriculture (compared with 8% in the E.C.). In 1988 some 2.4 million Turkish nationals were living abroad (of whom 1 million were workers. They were to be found primarily in Germany -1.5 million Turkish citizens of whom 0.6 million workers) and in 1990 2.5 million Turkish workers were on the Community job market (Annex II)⁴.

Together with receipts from tourism, remittances by expatriate Turks are a major source to plague Turkey's trade deficit (Annex III) $^{(4)}$.

It must be stressed that it is very difficult to present social and economic data which correspond to reality. In fact the different sources of data often don't correspond and the revision of the Statistic System made by the State Planning Organisation in 1989, doesn't help to clarify the existing situation on the labour market. Nevertheless on Annex IV the main social data provided by the OECD can be seen.

II. WORKING ENVIRONMENT

1. GENERAL ASPECTS

Only 3% of the 19 million workforce are covered by Labour Law (agriculture work, handicrafts, temporary contracts, domestic work, and other sectors are not covered). Turkish workers generally work longer hours than workers in the E.C. After only five years of compulsory education, children work from the age of 12.

There is much atypical work and generally a short job life; 80% of women are in non-registered jobs.

While a few workers in well paid employment are guaranteed aid after redundancy, the great majority are not.

The social security system is underdeveloped and there are no unemployment benefits or benefits for dependant children. Only half of the population has insurance cover for sickness and industrial accidents and pays contributions. (About 60% of the workforce has access to some sort of pension scheme).

All the social security funds are financed by contributions from employers and employees and the state does not provide any subsidies.

The recorded unemployment rate is currently at about 14% and rising. The disparity between well paid jobs and low paid work is up to 14-1. The average wage is far less than the E.C. average or the average of any of the 12 Member States.

Only one quarter of women workers are "employees", the rest are unpaid family or self-employed, and only 3% of apprentices are women.

SEC(89) 2290 final Annex 18/XII/89, p. 39 and SEC(90) 1017 final, 12/VI/90, (PE 143.040/Ann. p. 10.)

Of the 171 ILO Conventions Turkey has ratified 28 (the last one in 1984-Annex V). Although it has ratified the Convention on equal remuneration for men and women at commencement of employment, women can not make a labour contract without the permission of their husbands. A man does not need the permission of his wife!

The wages share of national income is falling and real wages have been also been falling (Annex VI).

Health and Safety at Work regulations are laid down by Government without ongoing negotiations with trade unions, and are often far below norms in the E.C. There is great disparity in working conditions.

2. TRADE UNION RIGHTS

The Turkish Constitution of 1982 guarantees the freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining. However in practice workers have few rights as so few are trade union organized. Many workers, such as civil servants, members of armed forces, teachers in private education and apprentices can not join trade unions and have no "rights".

Strikes are prohibited by law in sectors considered of vital importance for the national economy - electricity, gas, water, oil, petrochemical, public transport, fire services, schools, banks, notarial services, hospitals. In some "special" zones of the country, strikes are banned and generally can be suspended by ministerial decree if they are deemed dangerous to public health or national security.

In 1988 the ETUC (European Trade Union Confederation) adopted a resolution during its sixth Congress, condemning the difficulties suffered by workers and trade unions in Turkey.

3. FREEDOM OF MOVEMENT

Article 12 of the Association Agreement (EC-Turkey) presents a first engagement of the contracting parties to establish, by stages, freedom of movement of workers between them. The Additional Protocol signed in 1970 lays down that freedom of movement for workers between Member States of the Community and Turkey shall be secured by progressive stages (the deadline expiring in 1986).

On 1986 the Commission submitted some proposals on this issue but they were rejected by the Turkish Government. These proposals dealt mainly with:

- the conditions under which a Turkish worker employed in a Community Member State and the members of his family living with him could acquire free access to employment in that Member State;
- the obligation on the Member States to give Turkish workers priority when allocating vacant jobs to workers from non-Community countries;

- equal treatment with regard to working conditions and entitlement of the children of Turkish workers to general education and vocational training;
- reuniting of families.

The Schengen Agreement has not yet been implemented by Convention, and until now, no impact from the free movement of Turkish workers has been felt. Even after the ratification of the implementing Convention, Turkish workers will be restricted. They will only be able to cross the EC internal boarders to work in another State which is party to the Convention for a maximum of three months.

4. CONTACTS BETWEEN THE COMMISSION AND THE TURKISH AUTHORITIES

EC Social Policy has both a direct and indirect effect on Turkey and Turkish citizens. 2.5 millions are resident in E.C. and must retain strong links with family and friends at home who will be told of working and social conditions within EC and affecting EC citizens.

In June 1990 the Commission agreed to conduct regular discussions with the Turkish authorities on the basis of the Social Action Program and to discuss with Turkish authorities all possible steps to achieve a better integration of Turkish workers in the Community in the light of the conclusion of the Strasbourg summit 5 . These initiatives seem essential to obtain correct information on the true existing social situation in Turkey and to determine the previous questions on which resolution is essential for the revival of the existing Association Agreement, before negotiations are opened.

⁵ SEC(90) 1017 final 12.6.90, p. 10.

III. CONCLUSIONS

On the basis of the above considerations, the Committee on Political Affairs is requested to include the following remarks in its report:

- A Notes that Turkey is about to have a new Government. Hopes that its admirable aims will be realized and considers that the E.C. should give every support to the new Government to help it achieve those aims.
- B Stresses that trade and other economic relations with Turkey must be tied to "social improvements" in that country, and the eventual revival of the existing Association Agreement should only be accepted if human rights and minimum standards of living and working conditions are respected.
- C Expects that the conclusion of trade agreements with the Community will lead to recognition of the ILO standards.
- D Points out that social protection of the population can only be improved through continuing economic development; considers therefore that Turkey also should benefit from the Community financial aid which is granted to all Mediterranean countries.
- E Stresses, however, that the Turkish authorities must ensure that the general political, social and economic conditions in Turkey will improve before the opening of accession negotiations could be contemplated.
- F Welcomes the new Turkish Government's announcement that it will respect human rights and minority rights, and that aims to make progress in the area of social policy.
- G Urges the Commission to inform the European Parliament of the results of the regular discussions that it intended to have with Turkish authorities on the Community Social Action Program. It should also inform the European Parliament of the improvements obtained during the talks concerning a better integration of Turkish workers in the Community, in the light of the conclusions of the Strasbourg Summit.
- H Calls on the Commission to prepare, on the basis of the available data and estimations, as it has done for other countries on other occasions, a study on the impact of the Turkey's accession with regard to social issues and the European Community labour market.
- I Considers that the EC institutions concerned with the existing Association Agreement should take responsibility for promoting, in Turkey, better working practices and trade union rights, better general living conditions and social protection considered normal in the EC countries.
- J Recommends that Turkey ratifies the existing ILO Conventions and ensures their implementation in reality.
- K Stresses that Turkey should be advised to reorganize its statistical data, which should be harmonized with that of the EC in order to allow easy comparisons with EC data on aspects of social affairs, employment and the working environment.

- L Recommends that the Turkish Government, the institutions of the association agreement, the governments of Member States and the Commission make an effort with a view to achieving a better understanding on the integration of Turkish workers and their families resident in the European Community.
- M Welcomes the recent re-legalization of DISK (a trade union formerly outlawed in Turkey), which represents a victory for both internal and external pressures. However, deplores the lack of any genuine change to date in the basic political climate as far as trade unions are concerned. Much anti-union legislation is still in force. Calls on the new Turkish parliament to undertake legislative reform to correct this situation.

Table 1 Supply and use of resources

		089 N prices	Aver	age volume c	nange		Percentas	ge volume cha	ruße ozer bie	vious year	
	TL billion	Per cent of GNP/GUP	1973-17	1978-80	1981-85	1986	1987	1988	1989	19901	:9911
GNP at market prices	170 633	100.0	6.5	0.5	4.6	8 (7 5	3.6	1.6	9.0	5.9
Foreign balance?	-2 049	-12	-1.7	2.6	1.1	-32	13	3 2	-0.6	-3. l	1.1
Exports	47 607	27 9	-3.9	-0.3	21.7	1.2	24.3	16.3	11.3	7.0	7.2
Imports	45 558	26.7	7.9	-14.0	12.8	161	178	3.6	12.4	16.8	3.5
Total domestic demand	168 585	98.8	8.2	-2.2	3.5	11.4	6.0	04	2.3	12.3	4.7
Stockbuilding)	-167	-0.1	0.0	0.8	0.2	0.6	0.1	-1.3	-0.1	1.8	-0.1
Final domestic demand	168 751	98.9	8.2	-2.8	3.8	10.0	5.9	1.7	2.5	10.5	4.9
Private investment	20 953	12.3	9.8	-12.5	3.2	16.4	18.6	13.5	4.1	8.6	7.1
Public investment	17 351	10.2	48.4	-5.2	3.5	74	-4 1	-135	-6.2	8.5	6.4
Private consumption	111 052	65.1	6.6	-2.0	4.3	11.5	6 6	2.6	3.7	:1.0	4.0
Public consumption	19 395	114	9.5	110	19	6.6	3 8	3 0	2.8	119	63
GDP at factor cost	151 906	100 0	7 1	10	4.4	7 3	6 5	4 7	0.4	3 1	5 2
Agriculture	25 156	16.6	3.2	2.4	2.4	7.9	2 1	8 0	-11.5	11.3	3.5
Industry	47 609	31.3	9.7	-1.8	7.3	8 7	9.6	3 1	3 1	9.8	5.9
Mining	3 095	2 0	15.8	0.8	2.5	-6.3	4 2	8.7	-3.7	6 3	
Manufacturing	38 254	252	8.8	-2.7	7.8	9.6	9.9	18	3 2	10.1	••
Energy	6 260	4 1	13.4	5.0	7.9	15.5	109	98	7 1	9.5	
Construction	6 01 3	4.0	7 1	3.0	1 2	8.3	67	2 3	1.0	0.0	••
Services	73 127	48 1	8.0	1.5	4.5	6.2	6 8	4.4	4 4	6.2	5.3

1 Estimate of the State Planning Organisation
2 1991 programme target
3 Contribution to GNP growth
Source Data provided by the State Planning Organisation and the State Institute of Statistics

TURKISH EMIGRATION

a. Emigration of Turkish workers

	Total	of which : EEC	of which: Germany (FR)
1961-1973	790.289	733.063	648.029
1973-1980	125.257	22.750	9.412
1981-1984	206.426	490	409
1985	46.353	39	23
1986	35.608	32	17
1987	40.807	51	27

b. Turkish migrants living abroad (workers in brackets)

	Total	of which : EEC	of which: Germany (FR)
End 1980 End May 1984 End April 1987	2.023.102 (888.290) 2.404.031 (1015.544) 2.347.807 (1058.014)	1. 360.626 (706.726)	1.552.328 (542.512)

Source : Turkish Ministry of Work and Social Welfare, Annual Reports.

TABLE Nº 3

Workers' remittances by month
\$ million

	1980	1981	1982	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989	1990
January	83 3	134.9	149.2	121.2	83.4	151.9	97 5	115.2	95.0	l 90.0	187.0
February	1733	143.5	130 8	105.7	98.5	1340	100.3	98.7	96.0	236.0	214.0
March	1117	1397	147.3	129.3	98.7	122.8	91.1	1373	105.0	190.0	240.0
April	114.8	159.1	152.4	117.1	81.7	123.1	118.7	149.4	136.2	172.0	224.0
May	103.2	162.1	160.1	107.7	119.2	128.5	106.1	171.6	157.8	185.0	272.0
June	155.0	212.4	165.6	109.9	139.8	98.3	121.4	186.1	131.1	234.0	282.0
July	279 4	313.2	246.4	164.0	233.8	216.0	216.6	231.4	172.0	319.0	334.0
August	279.5	377.7	300.9	191.6	242.3	182.8	192.4	238.3	225.0	424.0	364.0
September	207.3	266.4	196.5	139.7	172.9	183.5	183.7	224.7	172.1	374.0	359.0
October	205.1	211.8	203.6	140.3	160.2	162.3	166.2	216.3	170.2	315.0	301.0
November	172.6	183.2	143.0	103.4	267.4	136.6	137.€	153.6	187.0	232.0	256.0
December	185.9	185.7	190 7	123.8	183.3	134.5	164 2	: 79.4	214.0	258.0	220.0
Total	2 071.1	2 489 7	2 186.5	1 553.7	1 881.2	1 774.3	1 696.C	2 102.0	1 865.0	3 138.0	

Source Central Bank of Turkey, Quarterly Bulletin

Table 4 Labour market!

				Thousand					Percentage o	tenge over	previous ye	3 (
	1980	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989:	1990 Estimate	. 538	1987	:988	:9891	1990 Estimate
Population	44 73?	50 665	\$1.630	52 747	53 969	55 255	56 570	1.9	2.2	2.3	2.4	2.4
Population aged 15-64	25 022	29 432	30 291	31 177	32 085	33 008	33 939	2.9	2.9	2.9	2.9	2.8
Participation ratio (per cent)	62.4	59.1	58.5	57.8	57.2	56.6	56.4					
Civilian labour force	15 619	17 395	17 708	18 027	18 350	18 680	19 131	1.8	1.8	: 8	1.8	2.4
Civilian employment	13 813	15 360	15 843	16 316	16 550	16 771	17 145	3.1	3.0	1.4	1.3	2.2
Agriculture	7 583	8 095	8 206	8 321	8 169	8 397	8 449	1.4	1.4	8.0	0 3	0.6
Industry	1 912	2 271	2 388	2 494	2 512	2 558	2 643	5.2	• 4.4	0.7	1.8	3.3
Construction.	. 700	743	798	847	866	874	890	7.0	6.1	2.2	0.9	1.8
Services	3 618	4 251	4 451	4 654	4 803	4 909	5 163	4 7	4.6	3.2	2.9	4.5
Unemployed Unemployment ratio	1 806	2 035	1 865	1711	1 800	1 909	1 986					
(per cent)	11.6	11.7	10.5	9 5	9.8	102	:04 j					•
Productivity (per cent)						•						
GDP	0 0	2.7	4 !	3.4	3.2	-0.9	I					
Agriculture	2.7	0.9	6.4	0.7	7.4	~11.4	Ì				,	
Industry	-4.8	3.2	3.3	5.0	2.4	1.2					ì	
Services	-0 3	0.9	1.2	1.7	1.7	1.3	}					

^{1.} In May 1984, the State Planning Organisation revised the labour market statistics from 1978 onwards. The new series are based on the 1988 Labour Market Survey, and sectoral value-added and productivity statistics.

Source Data provided by the State Planning Organisation

. Y.

² Provisional

TABLE Nº 5

TURQUIE

Con	rention	Ratification corregistrée
C.2	CONVENTION SUR LE CHOMAGE, 1919	- 14.07.50
C.11	CONVENTION SUR LE DROIT D'ASSOCIATION (AGRICULTURE), 1921	
C.14	CONVENTION SUR LE REPOS HEBDOMADAIRE (INDUSTRIE), 1921	
C.15	CONVENTION SUR L'AGE MINIMUM (SOUTIERS ET CHAUFFEURS), 1921	
C.26	CONVENTION SUR LES METHODES DE FIXATION DES SALAIRES MINIMA	. 29.01.75
C.34	CONVENTION SUR LE BURFALIX DE PLACEMENT PAYANTS, 1933 1	27.12.46
C.12	CONVENTION (REVISCE) DES MALADIES PROFESSIONNÉLILÉS, 1934	27.12.46
C.45	CONVENTION DES TRAVAUX SOUTERRAINS (FEMMES), 1935	
C.58	CONVENTION (REVISEE) SUR L'AGE MINIMUM (TRAVAIL MARITIME).	
C.77	CONVENTION SUR L'EXAMEN MEDICAL DES ADOLESCENTS (INDUSTRIE)	
C.80	CONVENTION PORTANT REVISION DES ARTICLES FINALS, 1946	13.07.49
C.81	CONVENTION SUR L'INSPECTION DU TRAVAIL, 1947	05.03.51
C.88	CONVENTION SUR LE SERVICE DE L'EMPLOI, 1948	14.07.50
C.94	CONVENTION SUR LES CLAUSES DE TRAVAIL (CONTRATS PUBLICS),	
C.95	CONVENTION SUR LA PROTECTION DU SALAIRE, 1949	29.03.61
C.96	CONVENTION SUR LES BUREAUX DE PLACEMENT PAYANTS (REVISEE)	23.01.52
C98	CONVENTION SUR LE DROIT D'ORGANISATION ET DE NEGOCIATION	23.01.52
C.99	CONVENTION SUR LES METHODES DE FIXATION DES SALAIRES MINIMA	
C.100	CONVENTION SUR L'EGALITE DE REMUNERATION, 1951	19.07.67
C.102	CONVENTION CONCERNANT LA SECURITE SOCIALE (NORME MINIMUM),	29.01.75
C.105	CONVENTION SUR L'ABOLITION DU TRAVAIL FORCE, 1957	29.03.61
C.111	CONVENTION CONCERNANT LA DISCRIMINATION (EMPLOI ET	
C.115	CONVENTION SUR LA PROTECTION CONTRE LES RADIATIONS, 1960	15.11.68
C.116	CONVENTION PORTANT REVISION DES ARTICLES FINALS, 1961	02.09.68
C.118	CONVENTION SUR L'EGALITE DE TRAITEMENT (SECURITE SOCIALE),	25.06.74
C.119	CONVENTION SUR LA PROTECTION DES MACHINES, 1963	13.11 67
C.122	CONVENTION SUR LA POLITIQUE DE L'EMPLOI, 1964	13.12.77
C.1 27	CONVENTION SUR LE POIDS MAXIMUM, 1967	13.11.75

Convention dénoncée du fait de la ratification de la convention no 96

² A accepté les dispositions de la partie III.

Parties II, III, V, VI et VIII-X. En vertu de l'article 3, paragr. 1, de la convention, le gouvernement accepte les obligations de la convention pour les parties II et VIII sous réserve des dérogations temporaires figurant dans les articles 9 d) et 48 c).

Branches a)-g).

Wages

	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989	1990 Estimate	
				TL per day				
Nominal wages								
Average private sector!	3 535.3	4 772.9	6 299.9	9 847.4	16 423.3	36 577.5	78 642.0	
Average public sector?	3 092.9	3 757.0	4 383.0	6 175.0	9 226.0	22 234.0	45 933.0	
Legal minimum wage)	748.1	958.1	1 380.0	1 927.5.	3 337.0	5 575.5	10 125.0	
	Percentage change over previous year							
Nominal wages								
Average private sector	39.8	35.0	32.0	56.3	66.8	122.0	115.0	
Average public sector?	28.3	21.5	16.7	40.9	49.4	141.0	106 6	
Legal minimum wage ¹	38.5	28.1	44.0	39.7	73.1	67.1	816	
Real wages4								
Average private sector	-5.8	-6.9	-1.9	12.6	-4.9	31.3	34.1	
Average public sector	-13.5	-16.2	-13.3	1.5	-14.8	42.1	28.9	
Legal minimum wage	-6.6	-11.6	7.0	0.6	-1.3	-1.6	13.3	

^{1.} Wage plus social benefits, including social security premiums, excluding other non-cash benefits

^{2&}quot; Wage plus social benefits, excluding social security premiums and other non-cash benefits

^{3.} Weighted annual averages for industry and services.

^{4.} Nominal wages deflated by the general consumer price index of the State Institute of Statistics.

Source: State Planning Organisation, 1991 Annual Programme.

OPINION

(Rule 120 of the Rules of Procedure)
of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection
for the Committee on Foreign Affairs and Security

Draftsman: Mr Alexandros ALAVANOS

At its meeting of 26 April 1991 the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection appointed Mr Alavanos draftsman of an opinion.

At its meetings of 19 December 1991 and 31 January 1992 it considered the draft opinion.

At the latter meeting it unanimously adopted the conclusions as a whole.

The following took part in the vote: Schleicher, acting chairman; Amendola, vice-chairman; Alavanos, rapporteur; Barrera i Costa (for Bjørnvig), Caudron (for Bombard), Delcroix, Green, Hadjigeorgiou (for Florenz), Mrs Jackson, Jensen, Kuhn, Lannoye (for Quistorp), Muntingh, Oomen-Ruijten, Partsch, Pronk (for Chanterie), Raffin, Llewellyn Smith (for Bowe), Staes, Vittinghoff, Vohrer and White.

The special political circumstances in Turkey over the last 10 years have stood in the way of the transparency required for a complete approach to the problems of the environment. The information which is available indicates that the following are among the more serious problems:

1. Air pollution

Throughout the Eighties pollution increased sharply as a result of increased industrial activity and urbanization. Estimated SO₂ emissions in the European part of the country rose from 276 000 tonnes in 1984 to 321 000 tonnes in 1986. Air pollution levels in Ankara, especially in the winter months, are on a par with those of London in the Forties and Fifties. The use of lignite as a fuel for industry and for heating buildings, and the topography of the city favour the formation of smog, with the result that about 92% of SO_2 in the air comes from these sources. This pollution frequently exceeds the safe limits for public health by a wide margin, reaching levels 7 or 8 times those set by the WHO. Methods of power generation have been an important factor in the increase in air pollution. By way of comparison, it is worth pointing out that the general energy efficiency index (total demand for energy per GNP unit) is 0.60 for Turkey (1987), while in the western European countries it was no more than 0.32. 30% of the country's industrial activity is concentrated around Istanbul and 15% around Izmit.

2. Water and coastal pollution

Especially polluted waters include the Sea of Marmara, the waters around Istanbul, the Golden Horn, the gulfs of Izmit, Gemlik and Izmir, the harbours of Antalya and Samsun and the gulf of Iskenderun. Pollution from the development of tourism along the coastline constitutes a further, seasonal, problem since in several areas the population can be up to 10 times the normal in summer, but the sewage disposal facilities required do not exist.

The policy of encouraging tourist development is expected to increase the number of beds from 155 000 in 1989 to 400 000 in 1993-4, dramatically increasing water and coastal pollution.

The probable construction of a thermal power station in the Ali-Aga area near Izmir will create a serious environmental problem as it is considered that the discharge of 60 000 tonnes of warm water containing chlorine into the gulf of Candarli would affect the marine environment within a radius of 200 km.

Marine pollution from vessels is a special problem on top of marine pollution from other sources (urban and industrial waste, and garbage).

3. Problems affecting fauna

There are serious environmental problems in relation to the protection of the endangered natural environment. According to the explanatory statement to a resolution of the European Parliament (OJ C 262/200/10.10.88) there are about 100 individual monk seals monachus-monachus, but their exact situation is unknown. Another resolution (OJ C 262/202/10.10.88) states that in the Dalyan area, which is the habitat of the loggerhead turtle (caretta-caretta), a large-scale tourist complex comprising nine hotels with a total capacity of 10 000 beds is being planned, without an environmental impact study, and would imperil the habitat of this species. The first hotel was already being built in 1988, but construction work has in general come to a temporary halt.

All along the southern coast of Turkey there are important loggerhead turtle and green turtle (Chelonia mydas) nesting beaches, especially in the Koycegiz (including Dalyan), Kumluca, Belek, Side, Alanya and Kukurova areas. These habitats are at risk from tourist and urban/industrial development. Both species (Mediterranean monk seal and sea turtles) are protected by international conventions. However, some evidence of the failure to implement the environmental regulations and the strict international bans is provided by the accusation by the British ecologist John White published in the Daily Express of 22.4.91, that Turkish fishermen are catching large numbers of dolphins and sea turtle for commercial purposes.

4. Soil erosion and pollution

The forests were nationalized in 1945. However, the forestry law of 1956 watered down the principle of state management of forests with the result that wooded areas have been substantially reduced. It has been estimated that 50-60% of the area in Anatolia suffers from active erosion. One important cause of erosion lies in the extensive use of non-commercial fuels (22% of energy sources in 1985). In coastal areas serious erosion problems have also arisen because of the uncontrolled use of large areas of land hitherto protected by vegetation for tourist infrastructures.

There is also serious evidence that there are probably major toxic waste problems.

5. Environmental impact of the GAP programme in S. E. Anatolia

This programme, which includes 21 dams, 17 hydroelectric power stations and 13 large irrigation schemes on the Tigris and Euphrates rivers and their tributaries, is intended to further the development of eight provinces. After completion, the total flow of the Euphrates alone will be reduced by 50%. Pollution of the entire natural flow of the two rivers is also to be expected as the irrigated area, of about a million hectares, will be returning fertilizer and pesticide residues and salts to those rivers shortly after the year 2000.

The Ataturk dam, 4 times the size of the Aswan dam in Egypt, which is part of the programme and which will irrigate an area twice the size of the Netherlands, halted the flow of the Euphrates for 27 days and is still only 25-30% full. It has already reduced fish stocks in Iraq and will hold back the rich silt required for the functioning of river eco-systems. The environmental impact on the river deltas on the Persian Gulf is expected to be serious.

The fact that 236 villages and about 200 archaeological sites will be flooded by the dams will create huge problems.

Although Syria and Iraq are asking for $700~\text{m}^3$ per second of water from the Tigris and Euphrates, Turkey had signed a supply agreement in 1987 for $500~\text{m}^3$ per second and rejects the concept of an international agreement on water. Suleyman Demirel was indeed reported to have told the Milliyet newspaper on 7 May 1990 that the Euphrates and Tigris were not international waters, and that no foreigner could have any claim to resources arising within Turkey's borders.

6. Environmental policies

In principle there is a relatively large amount of legislation directly or indirectly relating to Turkey's environmental problems. That legislation is however either in abeyance or ineffective.

In 1981 the Turkish government signed the Barcelona Convention, the Protocol for the prevention of pollution of the Mediterranean Sea by dumping from ships and aircraft and the Protocol concerning cooperation in cases of emergency. Also that year a network for measuring air pollution in Ankara was set up with World Bank finance.

In 1982 the Constitution was amended to include a separate article on the environment (Article 58). Articles 43, 63 and 169 are also relevant.

In the Eighties a framework law on the environment (N 2872) was adopted, but has not been put into effect. Various other environmental laws were also adopted, such as No. 2873 on the national parks, No. 2863 on the protection of cultural and natural resources, and the special law on the Bosphorus. The Environmental Undersecretariat was upgraded to a Directorate-General of the Environment reporting to the Prime Minister. A law on the coastline was adopted, but in the end ruled unconstitutional. The law on construction, a law on sea and freshwater produce, a regulation on noise, and on an environment fund, and on Unhealthful Institutions (SIC) were also adopted. Regulations on the protection of air quality were also adopted.

From 1986 onwards it was noticeable that public resistance to environmental pollution in Turkey hardened (objections by the judiciary to the felling of trees around the Courts in Ankara, objections to the construction of a multistorey car park in Güven Park in Ankara, the demonstration against the Ak Cement factory in the village of Minar Sinan near Istanbul, the objections by local inhabitants to the construction of thermal power stations in the gulf of Gokova in the Ali-Aga area and in the village of Turkebler in the Aegean).

I. Sebastian of the World Bank environmental section makes the following assessment: on the basis of talks with the Turkish authorities, the following factors may explain the Turkish reluctance to take vigorous action to control pollution: the belief that environmental and economic/development objectives are incompatible; the great investment required for some measures to control pollution in a situation where there is a shortage of foreign currency and competition for scarce funds within the country; the absence or ineffectiveness of economic incentives and of organizations— governmental, legal, economic or social—to support policies to reduce pollution.

There is a general political reluctance to take drastic anti-pollution measures which, apart from anything else, is causing considerable delays: in the promoting research, establishing standard models, adopting the practice of environmental impact studies for projects, and in publishing information about the state of the environment in the country.

7. Situation in the occupied part of Cyprus

There are explosive environmental problems in the northern part of Cyprus, which is still under Turkish military occupation. Even reports in the Turkish-Cypriot press, in the absence of other sources and of information from the internationally-unrecognized regime in northern Cyprus, give a revealing picture.

<u>Disposal of toxic waste</u>: a freighter transported 2 000 tonnes of PCB waste to the occupied Famagusta free zone on behalf of the GERMENER Co (Kibris Postasi, 7.8.90).

The destruction of the natural and historical environment: the construction of a hotel complex and country villas around the historical Bellapaise Abbey and in the forest areas around Kyrenia (Kibris 19.8.90, Kibris 21.8.90, Yenigan 10.9.90); the destruction of Morphou Church (Kibris 10.9.90); the construction of a commercial jetty and a road in the historic Chryso-Cava area (Yenidusen 11.8.90).

The construction of shanty towns without the most elementary provision of health and environmental infrastructure for the thousands of Turkish settlers, such as the village of Zhodia (Yenidusen 27.6.90).

The dereliction of the town of Famagusta which has been forcibly kept as a 'ghost' town since 1974 with consequent environmental decay and deterioration.

8. Public Health

Public spending in this field was 1.4% of GNP in 1987 as against the average of 5.6% for OECD countries, while total spending that year was 3.5% as against the OECD average of 7.3%.

Current life expectancy for women (last figures available: 1983) is 65.5, the lowest in any OECD country, followed by Ireland with 75.6. The figure for men is 60.8 for Turkey as against the OECD average of 70.8.

In Turkey there were 2.1 hospital beds per thousand inhabitants in 1982 as against the OECD average of 9.3 (Public health: finance and health services - OECD).

The most recent figures (Public health systems - OECD, Paris 1990) give child mortality of 8.3% of live births in Turkey (1984), followed by Portugal with 1.67%, and with Japan as the lowest at 0.6%.

<u>Information on consumer protection</u> is unfortunately not readily available. It may be assumed that there is a similarly wide gap between the Turkish and Community levels as there is in the case of public health. 1

See the attached comments by the Turkish Minister of Health on this opinion

Conclusions

The Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection calls on the Committee on Foreign Affairs and Security, the committee responsible, to take the following conclusions into account in its motion for a resolution:

The Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection:

- 1. Considers that the level of environmental protection (and of public health and consumer protection) in Turkey is well below that in the Community;
- 2. Considers that the environmental standards which the Community has achieved should not be undermined by the prospect of enlargement, and that there should be no question of accepting any environmental 'dumping' within the Community; considers that one of the conditions of any country's accession to the Community should be its adoption and implementation of Community environmental regislation.
- 3. Believes that Turkey must sign and ratify international agreements on the environment to which the Community is already a party, such as the 1979 convention on migratory species of wild animals, the 1974 Convention on the prevention of marine pollution from land-based sources (which Turkey had not signed in 1988).
- 4. Considers it important that Turkey adopt the May 1990 Nicosia Charter of Mediterranean Countries, adopted by the conference on the subject which took place under the Community's auspices, for the elimination of the environmental problems of the Mediterranean by the year 2025 with the assistance of the Community, the World Bank, the EIB, UNEP, by taking four key steps: enforcing existing regulations, applying new measures, improving standards and securing resources.
- 5. Believes that the financial protocols and other forms of Community aid to Turkey can and must contribute to the solution to that country's environmental, public health and consumer protection problems. Turkey itself must therefore remove the obstacles it has put in the way of the activation of those mechanisms and to which the European Parliament has repeatedly drawn attention (human rights, the occupation of Northern Cyprus). Talks between the Community and Turkey should focus in particular on major construction projects and their effects on the environment.
- 6. Expresses the deepest concern at the destruction of the natural and historical environment in the northern part of the Republic of Cyprus, which is under Turkish military occupation.
- 7. Considers that the basic requirements for environmental policy in the case of Turkey should include transparency, information, and freedom of action for environmental, social and political organizations.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Broen J-M., 'TURKEY, SYRIA NEAR AGREEMENT ON EUPHRATES', The Financial Times, 11 Feb. 1991
- Turkish Permanent Delegation to the European Communities, THE NEW TURKEY-TURKEY: EUROPE'S GATEWAY EAST
- Environmental Problems Foundation of Turkey: ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY OF TURKEY, EPFT, Dec. 1987; ENVIRONMENT LAW AND ITS APPLICATION IN TURKEY (Executive Summary), EPFT, Feb. 1987
- Germirli F., 'AN OVERVIEW OF THE TEXTILE INDUSTRY IN TURKEY POLLUTION, PROFILES AND TREATABILITY, CHARACTERISTICS', Wat. Sci. Tech., Vol. 22, N°. 9, 1990
- Hill A., 'TOURISM IS THE COUNTRY'S NEWEST INDUSTRY', The Financial Times, 24 May 1990
- Kocasoy G., 'THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN COASTAL TOURISM, SEA POLLUTION AND PUBLIC HEALTH: A CASE STUDY FROM TURKEY', The environmentalist, Vol. 9, N° 4, 1989
- Kolars John, 'THE FUTURE OF THE EUPHRATES RIVER', World Bank, W.D.C., June 24/28, 1991
- Lang J-T., 'IMPLICATIONS OF THE EUROPEAN COMMUNITY'S ENVIRONMENT POLICY FOR TURKEY', European Law Review, N° 6, Dec. 1988
- Plinke E., 'ANALYSIS OF ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROBLEMS IN TURKEY', Ambio, VOL. 19, N° 2, Apr. 1990
- 'SMOG CHOKING TURKEY'S BIG CITIES', Business Times, June 2, 1988
- 'THERMAL POWER PLAN COULD BE REVIVED SOON', Sunday Times, 15 Dec. 1990
- Tekeli Sahim, 'TURKEY SEEKS RECONCILIATION FOR THE WATER ISSUE INDUCED BY THE SOUTHEASTERN ANATOLIA PROJECT (GAP)', Water International, N° 15, 1990
- Tremer D., 'HOUSEHOLD WASTE RECYCLING IN TURKEY PIONEERING EFFORT', Biocycle, July 1989
- Sebastian Iona, ISSUES IN URBAN AIR POLLUTION: ANKARA DIAGNOSTIC REPORT, The World Bank, August 1990
- Stansell J., 'THE NICOSIA CHARTER', New Scientist, 5 May 1990
- UNEP/MAP/Blue Plan, 'FUTURE OF THE MEDITERRANEAN BASIN', UNEP-B.P./Regional/ Activity Centre, 1988; 'OVERVIEW OF THE MEDITERRANEAN BASIN/DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENT', UNEP-B.P./Regional Activity Centre, 1984
- O.J. N° C 207/14, 20.8.90; O.J. N° C 214/28, 26.8.85; O.J. N° C328/10, 31.12.90

Letter from the Turkish Permanent Representation
to the European Communities
to Mr Alexandros ALAVANOS
member of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health
and Consumer Protection

Brussels, 24 January 1992

Dear Sir,

I have the honour to enclose information provided by the Turkish Ministry of Health in response to some of the criticisms of Turkey set out in the draft opinion of the Committee on the Environment, Public Health and Consumer Protection for which you are the draftsman.

(Closing formula)

(sgd.) Nihat ARKYOL Acting chargé d'affaires

(1) Atmospheric pollution

 ${\rm SO}_2$ and particulate emissions are monitored throughout the country by 136 monitoring stations. Air quality regulations issued in 1986 set thresholds based on the standards applying in the European Community, and the action to take in each province when these thresholds are exceeded. In the case of Ankara, where 16 monitoring stations check atmospheric pollution, which is due not only to heating, but also to the city's topography and meteorological conditions, a marked improvement has been achieved in the last two years with the use of high calorific value, low-sulphur fuels and the installation of a natural gas grid. Industrial plant operating permits are not issued unless an emission licence has previously been obtained from the competent authorities, on presentation of a statement of the action been taken to comply with the regulations.

(2) Water pollution

The Turkish authorities, being aware of the value of the Turkish coastline to tourism, are introducing all possible measures to avoid coastal pollution. These measures have been implemented via state-financed projects or as part of international projects. Rules on the control of water pollution were issued in 1988, and in particular have made the discharge of effluent into water courses and the sea subject to authorization, and effluent purification standards. Natural water catchment areas are protected by law.

(3) Problems affecting fauna

For a number of years there has been a public debate in Turkey on the protection of the environment and natural resources, including fauna. The authorities have signed several international conventions on the subject, and are taking part in various international projects such as the Dalyan project (loggerhead turtles) and the Köycegiz project. Various new laws have been adopted to protect the natural environment in national parks, nature conservation zones, biogenetic reserves and special habitats.

(4) Soil erosion and pollution

Turkey does indeed have a soil erosion problem, due to incorrect land use. However, legislation has been introduced to reduce to a minimum the pollution causing erosion, and to protect soil quality. The use of natural and chemical substances in agriculture has been regulated, and reaflorestation and plant breeding to contain erosion are under way.

(5) Public health

In 1990 there were 857 hospitals in Turkey, excluding Ministry of Defence establishments, with 105 710 beds. The figures over the last few years will show what progress has been made in this area: 736 hospitals in 1986, 756 in 1987, 777 in 1988 and 812 in 1989. 3 186 336 patients were hospitalized in 1990, with an average stay of 6.9 days. The youth of the Turkish population by comparison with the average age in the OECD countries in general is one factor to be taken into consideration in the health field. The hospitalization rate therefore needs to be seen in the light of these comparative figures.

On 21 August 1991 a Ministry of the Environment was set up to deal with these matters in an effective and thorough manner.

