Training and democracy: current aspects
The editorial committee was not unaware of the difficulties it would face as a result of its choice of “Training and democracy” as the theme for this issue of the Vocational Training Journal. Indeed, it hesitated for some time before reaching a decision that was not unanimous - a rare occurrence in the Journal’s long life - because the subject is risky from several points of view.

In the first place there are the inherent risks. A discussion of matters pertaining to democracy is generally considered to fall more within the purview of politics than of science, except in the case of specialists in the field of political science for whom it is a subject of research. We are well aware that this publication is concerned with vocational training and not with political science. Which led us to ask ourselves whether as a consequence any discussion of democracy should be barred as inappropriate.

The answer, finally, was that it should not. While it is true that vocational training is generally considered as a matter for technical debate, such discussions are often embarked upon from an ideological standpoint. Despite their efforts to ignore it, researchers are obliged to accept this fact. And those concerned with training activity constantly find themselves enmeshed in discussions of training policy as well as its more practical aspects, if only through their involvement in debates at parliamentary level or discussions with the social partners.

The various stances adopted in relation to training are important by virtue of their influence not only on the form training takes but also the social purpose for which it is given. The detached view necessary for the building of Europe soon makes clear that both these aspects reveal a great deal about the societal structures in each country. Adopting this theme for the Journal was therefore felt to be all the more appropriate in that CEDEFOP is situated at the crossways of Europe, providing a forum for dialogue and reflection for the various departments of the European Commission, the representatives of member states and the social partners.

Having resolved certain questions of principle we were left with the practicalities. How should we approach the subject in view of its widely varying content? How could we avoid the trap of vacuousness or polemic or both? And how could we put together an issue of the Journal that made sense in terms of the proposed subject-matter bearing in mind who were our traditional contributors?

After a great deal of further hesitation and discussion the editorial committee decided in principle not to change the type of contributor or the mode of requesting a contribution. We therefore sent our requests as usual to academics working in the training field, saying nothing about the subject of democracy. We simply asked them to write on a subject of interest to them in accordance with the rules generally applicable to our type of publication. However, in order to set them in perspective, these articles have been complemented by non-academic contributions which are in equal measure “eyewitness accounts” of events connected with the formation of Europe.

That, then, is how we built up this issue of the journal - a high-risk issue that admits the opinion of a wider circle of contributors as we have often been asked to do but which detracts from the customary unity of tone and may well upset the delicate balances so difficult to achieve in the framework of a single issue. Thus when perusing this issue it will be worthwhile pausing occasionally to regain the general approach adopted by the Journal, which is to examine the vast field of training without complacency and from various points of view.

The question of democracy, therefore, should be seen as underlying the whole and the various articles should be read in relation to each other rather than solely for their individual content. It reflects par-
particularly clearly in the questions asked both in connection with public policy at member state and regional level and with training courses organised by firms.

It will be seen that the people liable to benefit from a satisfactory launch into working life will differ according to the policy pursued. What also emerges from a detached historical view is how many discussions and decisions in the sphere of training bear the stamp of the ideologies of the period and how their development reflects not only radical ideological changes but also changes in the interplay of political forces in Europe.

The lessons these articles hold for us when read with the necessary detachment are hard, but salutary. They should put us on our guard when attempting an analysis by making us realise - should this be necessary - the weight of ideological assumptions in arguments advanced in connection with vocational training and their relative nature, but also the successes they can lead to.

We have explained that this issue has been divided into two parts according to the type of contribution, some of which are more academic and others more accounts of actual experience.

The former include the article by S. Laestadius which warns us of the falseness of the widely held idea that there is no salvation outside a high-tech economy based on theoretical, scientific learning. It reveals the competitive ability that can result from knowledge and skills firmly based on industrial practice able to select knowledge in order to apply it to more traditional trades.

The article by J. Bishop is especially interesting because of the way in which he encourages us to enter the debate currently raging in the United States on training and its usefulness for individuals or groups as a function of how and where it is given. Deliberately adopting the neoliberal stance of a market economy that is only willing to pay a high price for goods in short supply, he concludes that any training aiming to impart basic skills such as reading, writing and arithmetic is of little interest compared with specific training for what he terms “excellence and specialisation” and which when designed to provide “activity qualifications” are alone able to enhance the value of more basic skills.

Following a somewhat similar train of thought is J.R. Shackleton, who enquires into the reasons behind government policy with regard to vocational training beyond the market balances that might result from application of the theory of human capital. He presents an interesting thesis which leads him to point the finger at what he suggests is a certain collusion between the different parties involved - the unions, employers, instructors and politicians - whose specific interests nonetheless converge and who together favour a kind of economy of waste.

J.V. Mascarell helps perhaps to illustrate this, by placing himself in the position of managing a local development project and pleading for the avoidance of “a dichotomy between what is commercially profitable and socially necessary” and for a pedagogical approach that “thinks globally and acts locally”. In his view there is need to combine the divergent approaches of the various institutions concerned (chambers of commerce, employers’ associations and unions) in order to increase their overall effectiveness for a joint project.

Contrasting with these four contributions, certain elements of the Council of Europe’s discussion on adult education and the three “eyewitness accounts” included in this issue coincide in seeking a form of training that would afford recipients more scope to discuss their counsellors’ proposals and to participate effectively in their realisation.

The story, so well told by V. Capecchi, of an Italian “Utopia” that came into being in Bologna in the early seventies in connection with the magazine “Inchiesta” and which aimed to encourage a new attitude to training on the part of the unions is to some extent echoed by that of educational leave in Belgium, which also has a long history, told with some disillusion by E. Creutz and Ch. Piret. Both cases show how ideas generously conceived if not actually revolutionary get bogged down in a “realism” which reduces them to the
bare minimum and drains them of their substance.

However, through them it is possible to realise the potential impact of a democratic project that sets training in the context of local economic and political development. Is this a Utopia belonging to a past that will not return because of the economic constraints by which our countries are bound? Or merely a temporary setback for attempts made before their time but which one day will rise again from the ashes in response to the renewed democratic demands outlined by M. Hervé in his article?

Where the truth lies only the future will tell. The editorial committee felt that its responsibility required that it should not seek to evade such questions, even at the risk of giving an unsatisfactory and possibly irritating answer. Our readers must be the judges.

Alain d’Iribarne
Training and democracy: current aspects

Policies, local action: economic and/or social consequences

Governments and training: a necessary involvement? ..................................... 7
J. R. Shackleton
This article subjects increasing government intervention in training to critical examination. It explores the reasons offered for government intervention, considers the counterarguments, and then sketches some of the evidence available on the achievements of this activity.

Vocational Training for Slow Learners in Germany .............................................15
Helmut Pütz
The better one succeeds (…) in reducing the numbers of disadvantaged young people, the less serious (…) will be the problems that society and state have in Germany with young adults who have not had training.

Training and local development .....................................................................23
Josep Vicent Mascarell
Any model of intervention in the community in the form of local development projects should not split what is economically profitable from what is socially necessary.

Tacit Knowledge in a Low Tech-Firm ...............................................................27
Staffan Laestadius
The powerful learning capacity of this firm is more or less independent of schooling and of science and is probably of much greater importance to its competitive success than either.

General competence/specific professional competence: an analysis of the American experience

Vocational education and at-risk youth in the United States ..........................34
John H. Bishop
“If old skills become obsolete more rapidly, then new skills must be learned more frequently. This implies a greater overall need for occupational training, not a reduced need.”
Education and citizenship

Reflection within the Council of Europe

The Council of Europe’s “Permanent Education” project ......................... 43
Jean-Pierre Titz

“Education for Democratic Citizenship”: short presentation of 4 workshops carried out by the Council of Europe on this issue .......... 47
Madalen Teeple

The market, standards and the community, or new education ............... 50
Annie Vinokur

Trade union perspectives

Trade unions and training: workers’ rights to training from the early 1970s to the early 1990s ....................................................... 54
Vittorio Capecchi

“150 hours” in Italy: the issue and the path.

Paid Educational Leave in Belgium: is legislation slipping off the track?................................................................................. 62
Christian Piret, Emile Creutz
This article recaps on the history of the 1955 law on training leave and on its application and explains the reasons for the current budgetary deficit and the incoherence of the decision taken. It concludes by examining more positive prospects.

The point of view of a local elected representative:

The role of education and training in local democracy ......................... 69
Michel Hervé
The elected representative confronted with the double needs of training and democracy becomes, of necessity, the organiser of a vast educational market within the dimensions of the territory for which he has received a mandate.

Reading

Reading selection .................................................................................................. 72

Publications received by the editorial office..................................................... 83
Governments and training: a necessary involvement?

Throughout the European Union, emphasis on vocational training has increased significantly in the last decade. This is largely the outcome of market forces, and welcome. European firms have reacted to increased world competition in the production of goods and services in which they were formerly preeminent: reorienting their labour forces towards new processes and new products has required steadily increasing commitments to investment in human capital. In a related development, workers have reacted to increasing labour market competition by seeking higher qualifications prior to entering employment, and by endeavouring to develop and extend their skills in later years.

However governments have been unwilling to leave this process of skill augmentation to private enterprise alone. Across Europe, governments have intervened; regulating training, requiring increased emphasis on vocational skills in schools, subsidising individuals and firms, and directly or indirectly funding training programmes. Government expenditure on training (and related Active Labour Market Policies such as employment subsidies and job broking services) rose significantly in European Union countries between the mid-1980s and the early 1990s (OECD 1993, Calmfors and Skedinger 1995). The European Commission has actively encouraged this interventionism by generating and disseminating information through CEDEFOP, by encouraging exchanges and pilot schemes through PETRA, FORCE, COMETT, NOW and a range of other initiatives, and by providing Social Fund support for many programmes with a training dimension. Following the Maastricht Treaty, a new legal basis for this activity has resulted in the establishment of LEONARDO, which aims to coordinate and rationalise these programmes.

Increased policy activism has been associated with the higher unemployment experienced across the EU since the early 1980s. This has particularly (though not exclusively) afflicted the less highly-skilled members of the European workforce; the conclusion has been drawn that improvement in their qualifications is a necessary condition for bringing down unacceptably high levels of joblessness. At the same time, enhanced training opportunities have also been presented as an “entitlement” by which disadvantaged workers - females, ethnic minorities - may improve their economic status.

This article subjects increasing government intervention in training to critical examination. It explores the reasons offered for government intervention, considers the counterarguments, and then sketches some of the evidence available on the achievements of this activity.

Some economics of training

In a European Union committed to competitive capitalism as the main economic driving force, it is necessary to clarify the reasons why there is thought to be a need for government intervention in vocational training. When economists seek to justify intervention in an otherwise optimally-functioning economy, they draw on the concept of “market failures” – ways in which actual markets tend to diverge from the ideal conditions necessary to produce an efficient outcome. So what market failures are present in the training sphere?

Economists see vocational training as one way to increase a country’s “human capital”: other means include academic schooling and health care. This type of investment, because it raises worker pro-

The theme of “Training and Democracy” necessarily involves some discussion from first principles of the role which governments play, or should play, in human capital formation. The author therefore discusses the case for and against intervention. Briefly reviewing some of the evidence on the effectiveness of government initiatives, he points out the pitfalls. He argues, from a “public choice” perspective, that there may be a tendency to excess intervention, and cautions CEDEFOP against unreflecting advocacy of government solutions to training problems.
“Employers are said to fear that workers whom they train may be 'poached' by rivals (...).”

Where the problem (if any) lies is in the provision of general or transferable training, generating skills of value to many employers.”

productivity, is seen as potentially profitable for the private sector. There may, however, be difficulties. Employers are said to fear that workers whom they train may be “poached” by rivals: this may deter investments in training. However, well-established economic analysis (Mincer 1962, Becker 1964) suggests that this problem has been exaggerated. Much training provided by employers is only useful while working with that employer. Instruction in the operation of a particular company’s payroll system, for example, is non-transferable. So is induction training and any staff development programmes orientated towards defining and maintaining the company targets and aspirations - long an important feature of Japanese employment practice and of growing importance in European economies (Rainbird and Maguire 1993) under fashionable banners such as Total Quality Management. Employers providing such specific training have little reason to fear that their newly-trained employees will be seduced away by rivals offering higher pay. Where the problem (if any) lies is in the provision of general or transferable training, generating skills of value to many employers. Some of this is financed directly by individuals or their families, of course. In most countries there is a large amount of self-funded training, particularly for professional jobs such as law, accountancy and medicine. However in many cases general training is also provided by employers, although implicitly financed in large part by workers. Historically apprentices were paid very low rates of pay, for example - rates which made it worthwhile for employers to provide training, whether the employee subsequently left the firm or not. In many jobs incremental pay scales with low starting rates provide a means of shifting the incidence of the costs of training to the employee. In the United Kingdom perhaps a quarter of overall training costs are paid for by earnings foregone (Department of Employment 1989).

In this perspective, “market failure” in training is not self-evident. However difficulties may arise if the costs of training in some fields are too high for individuals to finance privately, or if minimum wage legislation prevents wages of trainees falling to a level which makes it profitable for employers to provide training (an important consideration in some EU countries). Furthermore, decisions to invest in human capital depend on making assumptions about the future demand for skills. If employers and employees take a pessimistic view of the future, it has been argued that an economy can settle in a “low-skill equilibrium” (Finegold and Soskice 1988). Productivity and pay will be lower than would be the case if people had acted on more optimistic expectations. If government intervention can raise private sector expectations, a self-validating cycle of higher investment will eventually raise the economy to a “high-skill equilibrium”.

Against this argument for intervention, however, there are a number of points. One is that there is no guarantee that governments are better at foretelling the future than the private sector; government industrial interventions based on this premise have a poor record (Burton 1983, Leonard and Van Audenrode 1993). Another is the tendency to confuse private with social returns to training. The achievement of vocational qualifications, for example, is to some extent a positional good. Although skills to which such qualifications attest may raise a worker’s productivity, their value to particular individuals and firms can be a misleading guide to their social utility. Thus the sorting-screening hypothesis holds that employers’ decisions to employ workers do not depend on skills as such, but rather a willingness on workers’ parts to obey orders, be punctual, attend work regularly and so on (OECD 1989; Brown 1991; Chapman 1993). Successful completion of vocational qualifications attests to these behavioural traits, which are what the employers really value. Faced with a queue of applicants for jobs, employers sort them according to qualifications and select the best-qualified. Workers, knowing this, aim for the highest possible qualifications. After the event, we observe the best-qualified, most highly trained workers in the best and most productive jobs - but we cannot infer from this that a government-engineered expansion of training will necessarily boost an economy’s productivity and increase employment. One scenario sees employers raising hiring standards to choose between increasingly well-qualified candidates, with the workforce becoming over-qualified in re-
lation to the tasks it has to perform (Lindley 1991, Scherman 1991). Meanwhile the average qualifications of the unemployed might also rise (Lange 1993), generating some disillusion with the results of training.

Public choice?

Policy interventions are rarely the outcome of disinterested and dispassionate examination of likely costs and benefits. This is true whether the focus is national or international. Within the EU it is difficult to argue that the continuing confusions and waste of the Common Agricultural Policy - or even more parochial matters such as CEDEFOP’s relocation to Greece! - are based on objective evaluation of the options. One way to look at this draws on the analysis of the “public choice” school of American writers such as James Buchanan and Gordon Tullock (Buchanan and Tullock 1962; Buchanan, Tollinson and Tullock 1980). Following these authors, we may hypothesize a political market in which policies are the outcome of demand and supply forces. On the one hand, policies are “demanded” by groups of voters, producers and interest groups who benefit from their enactment. On the other, policies are “supplied” by politicians and bureaucrats, in exchange for votes, campaign contributions, political favours and budget appropriations. It has indeed been argued by some that there is a systematic tendency for over-supply of intervention - a real “government failure” (Stigler 1971). Can such scepticism be justified in relation to training policy?

Certainly training interventions often seem uninfluenced by close examination of the evidence concerning their effectiveness. Reviewing a range of active labour market policies across the OECD, David Grubb concluded that governments are often “largely indifferent” to evaluation studies (Grubb 1994 p. 195). In the UK, Peter Dolton commented that “one of the main motivations for instituting national training schemes may be political... an evaluation of the [UK’s Youth Training] scheme amounts to the political value of getting young people off the unemployment register” (Dolton 1993 p. 1277). One reason for this is that many influential groups stand to gain from these interventions:

- Trade unions are typically in favour of increased formal training leading to certificated skills. They tend to press for higher entry qualifications to jobs, a policy enhancing rents (returns in excess of the earnings which they could obtain elsewhere) to existing workers. However the ability of unions to secure influence over training policy varies from country to country. For example British unions were for many years ridden by demarcation and inter-union rivalry, and in the last fifteen years have experienced a sharp decline in political power and influence. Postwar German unions, to take a very different example, were organised exclusively on industrial lines and faced less internal problems, while their political legitimacy has remained relatively unchallenged: their influence on training policy has been correspondingly greater (Streeck et al 1987, Clarke et al 1994).

- Employers also hope to gain from government intervention in training. Public funding, necessarily rather undiscriminating, may substitute for specific training which firms would otherwise finance themselves. Employers providing general training will often support industry levies (such as the French obligation de dépense en matière de formation continue*) or compulsory training provision in order to equalise the burden of training costs which other firms would otherwise avoid. In this light, the support of the UK’s Confederation of British Industry (the main employers’ association) for compulsory training for young workers is explicable (Confederation of British Industry 1993).

- Professional “trainers” (private and public sector organisations and individuals drawing their incomes from providing training) preach the need for greater investment in human capital. Academics, both as educators and as researchers, have generally welcomed enhanced public investment in training with open arms: it has increased funding for themselves and their institutions. And we have seen evidence of classic interest group activity in bodies such as the British Training and Enterprise Councils. Initially intended simply as a more efficient means of delivering train-

*”Certainly training interventions often seem uninfluenced by close examination of the evidence concerning their effectiveness.”

“Policy interventions are rarely the outcome of disinterested and dispassionate examination of likely costs and benefits. This is true whether the focus is national or international.”

* Since 1971 French firms have been obliged to spend a proportion of their wage bill on recognised training activities, or else pay the appropriate amount to the state or recognised intermediaries which provide training.
“(…) in a period of high unemployment the appeal of intervention in training is particularly easy to discern. There is a powerful need to be seen to be ‘doing something’ which can be presented as improving long-term competitiveness as well as alleviating short-term problems.”

Intervention can take three broad forms - direct provision of training by government agencies, funding and regulation.

- There is a long history of direct provision of training by the state. In a sense, the free-at-the-point-of-use compulsory education (typically 10-11 years in the European Union) which all developed countries now provide for their children is part of the “training system” of a country. Recently secondary education in particular has become increasingly vocation- alised in EU countries - most notably France and the UK (Shackleton et al 1995). In addition to formal education, governments have for a long time also directly provided training for particular groups such as demobilised servicemen and women, the unemployed and the disabled. Such provision has increased substantially in the postwar period, and in the 1970s and 1980s in particular. Governments are also major employers in their own right, and as such they naturally provide training of all descriptions. Evidence from a variety of countries indicates that government employees typically receive more training than their counterparts in the private sector (ibid). Indeed, government provision can sometimes distort or reduce private sector training by making much of it redundant. For example, the UK, French and German air forces provide a large proportion of the trained pilots working in the civil aviation sectors of these (and other) countries. Government-run hospitals typically provide internships for junior doctors who then practise in the private medical sector, while government legal departments are a major source of corporate lawyers.

- In some EU countries, there is a current tendency to replace direct provision by funding of training provided by outside agencies. This can be direct funding, where the government contracts with employers, colleges or other training providers to train individuals. There is also increased interest (for example in the UK, Germany and France) in providing vouchers or credits to individuals who can then...
shop around amongst competing providers. Such “arms-length” provision is increasingly favoured because of the perceived problems of motivating trainers who are permanent employees of the government. Funding can also be provided indirectly through subsidies such as tax concessions to training providers, or to individuals undergoing training. A danger of all these subsidies is that they end up financing much training that would have taken place anyway. In the case of subsidies to individuals, the distributive consequences are often perverse. It is now well known that subsidies to higher education are taken up disproportionately by the relatively well-off or their children; it is perhaps less well understood that this applies across a wide range of training opportunities.

Governments also influence training provision through regulation of the economy. They can do this deliberately by requiring that only appropriately qualified and registered personnel can practise a trade or profession. Such requirements, almost universal for higher professions such as law and medicine, are sometimes (as in Germany) extended far wider. The justification offered is that of protecting the public against incompetence or malfeasance: in practice a stronger effect may be to protect registered practitioners from outside competition. Legislation may also require employers to give training or day-release education facilities for young people, or spend a given percentage of turnover or wage bill on training. It may require or permit levies on employers for industry-based training. Less obviously, governments create a “need” for training as a result of regulations intended for some other purpose, for example health and safety or tax law. On the other hand, some regulations may tend to reduce provision. One example may be labour market legislation - minimum wage or equal opportunity laws - which prevents wages falling to a level where individuals can finance their training through reduced pay (Polachek and Siebert 1993).

**Government failure?**

These measures are rather blunt instruments. Attempts to use them may themselves create considerable inefficiencies, “government failures” to offset supposed market failures. This section elaborates on some of the problems associated with two popular forms of intervention - levy systems to finance training, and government-funded retraining schemes for the unemployed.

Levy schemes mandate some level of spending - 1.5% of the wage bill in France - on training. Those who spend less pay a net levy. One problem is that of defining training expenditure given the range of activities which can improve productivity and/or earnings prospects. This leads governments to lay down arbitrary rules about what counts as officially recognised training. In France, all officially-sanctioned training for the purposes of the obligation de dépense en matière de formation continue has to be off-the-job, despite much conventional wisdom stressing the importance of on-the-job training. Similarly arbitrary rules meant that the levy to support Industrial Training Boards in the UK in the 1960s and 1970s effectively penalised small firms which could not spare workers for off-the-job training.

A second problem with levies based on a given percentage of wage bill or turnover is that they have little basis in economic reasoning. Economically rational firms, however strong their commitment to the training culture, will want to spend differing proportions of their revenue on human capital investment, just as they wish to spend different proportions of their revenue on investment in buildings and machinery. The appropriate amount of spending for a firm depends on a variety of factors relating to its business. They will include the stage of the product or process cycle (when new products or processes are introduced, training needs will be greater than at later stages of the cycle), the technology employed, the sector, the scale of the enterprise and the degree of competition. Spending requirements will also depend on the nature of the workforce: its age structure, its previous levels of education and the occupations in which individuals are engaged.

Because of these varied requirements, no common level of training provision is appropriate for all enterprises. Critics of levy systems claim that the requirement
“Whatever reservations governments may have about other interventions in training, the arguments for doing something to help the unemployed improve their prospects is difficult to resist.”

to spend arbitrary amounts encourages wasteful spending. They argue that in practice the levy is a tax on small firms (larger firms usually spend more than the required amount on training anyway) and thus tends to reduce competition.

Another common form of intervention - ubiquitous in the 1980s and 1990s - is the government training or retraining scheme for unemployed workers. Whatever reservations governments may have about other interventions in training, the arguments for doing something to help the unemployed improve their prospects is difficult to resist. There is now a considerable literature on such schemes (see, for example, OECD 1993 Chapter 2; Lange and Shackleton 1994; Calmfors and Skedinger 1995). Without embarking on a tour of this literature, three observations are in order.

- Firstly, there are incentive problems involved in running schemes. The need to motivate trainers usually means that governments judge effectiveness by reference to performance indicators such as the cost per trainee, numbers of qualifications achieved, and numbers of trainees who achieve jobs at the end of courses. This can lead to opportunistic behaviour which at times becomes fraudulent. A BBC TV Panorama programme in April 1994 showed that alert entrepreneurs had set up prearranged employment for individuals they then took onto UK government-funded training schemes: the bonus for successful “placement” was shared with the employers. Such performance indicators can lead even honest administrators to go for the cheapest rather than the most appropriate forms of training (training for retailing, say, rather than engineering), and the lowest rather than the highest qualifications (as these will almost certainly have higher success rates). Where trainers select their trainees, this also encourages “creaming” - choosing those individuals most likely to become employed because of their age, gender, ethnicity, education, previous experience or motivation (Anderson, Burkhauser and Raymond 1993). Since many such trainees would, given time, find jobs anyway, the “value added” by training may be limited - and the hard core of difficult-to-place unemployed will find their position in any job queue worsened.

- Secondly, there are known to be substantial displacement effects from government-sponsored schemes. These involve reductions in employment of one group of workers when employment prospects are enhanced for others. It has been suggested, for example, that retraining schemes for the long-term unemployed in East Germany simply fit some of the long-term unemployed for jobs that would have gone to the short-term unemployed; they now become long-term unemployed in turn and there is little net employment gain (Lange 1993). Studies of the UK’s Youth Training Scheme (now renamed Youth Training) have also shown high displacement rates (Deakin and Pratten 1987; Chapman and Tooze 1987; Begg, Blake and Deakin 1991; OECD 1993 Chapter 3). It needs to be strongly emphasised that the overall impact of a scheme simply cannot be judged from the proportion of participants subsequently getting jobs.

- Following from this, a third point concerns the macroeconomic impact of retraining for the unemployed. This is much more complicated than might at first be thought. To the extent that training programmes improve the match between job-seekers and vacancies, or improve the effectiveness of labour market search, total employment is likely to be increased. However, one consequence of the widespread availability of such schemes (typically involving allowances or payments to previously-unemployed participants greater than those to which they would otherwise be entitled) is to reduce the perceived costs of unemployment to those currently in work. This may lead to a reduction in restraint by wage-setting unions, higher pay and consequently lower employment. This danger is greater the less targeted are training programmes and the higher are allowances for those on such programmes. Sweden has been one of the countries where retraining has been very widely available, and generous allowances paid. Empirical work by Lars Calmfors and various collaborators (Calmfors 1994; Calmfors and Forslund 1991; Calmfors and Skedinger 1995; Calmfors and Lang 1995) points out that such policies may not have had the desired effect of reducing overall unemployment at all.
The policy implication of this last point is, however, difficult to follow through. The suggestion seems to be that we should target only the long-term unemployed for retraining. This may be true if the focus is on reducing the overall level of unemployment through inducing greater wage restraint. But from the point of view of individual workers who become unemployed, the quicker they receive effective retraining the better. If they have to wait around in increasing poverty and desperation until they eventually become entitled to entry to a scheme, their own individual chances of getting a new job will be much lower. Moreover a rigorously applied rationing of retraining to the long-term unemployed will mean such schemes become more than ever “ghettoes” of labour market rejections, from which employers will be unwilling to recruit. Such targeting might then indeed worsen the plight of the long-term unemployed. It is certainly not a painless remedy for the deficiencies of retraining programmes.

**Conclusion**

This article has been critical of many assumptions made in the current debate about training within the EU. It has been argued that market failure may not be widespread, and that consequently there is less scope for effective government intervention than some have argued. Furthermore, the point is repeatedly made that, even where there appears to be a plausible case for intervention, the actual policies pursued by European governments can have adverse side effects. Even when they appear to be successful (for instance in placing retrained people in jobs), their overall impact on the labour market may be much less impressive. Another conclusion, perhaps, is that government policy towards training cannot be divorced from other aspects of labour market policy - particularly when we try to design programmes to improve the position of the unemployed or increase access to disadvantaged groups. Remember that welfare systems, minimum wage and job protection legislation, and industrial relations institutions all have an impact on the incentives to provide training.

CEDEFOP plays an important role in documenting training systems within the EU, and in spreading information about policy initiatives. This role must continue, for we all have much to learn and there are scale and scope economies in the collection of information which argue for the centrality of a body of this kind. But in promoting interest in training across member countries it should not fall into the trap of excessive advocacy, or assume that governments always know better than the private sector. Some government intervention in training may be inevitable and desirable, but this should not preclude cool and objective appraisal of current and future policy initiatives.

“(...) the actual policies pursued by European governments can have adverse side effects.”

“Some government intervention in training may be inevitable and desirable, but this should not preclude cool and objective appraisal of current and future policy initiatives.”

**References**


Vocational Training for Slow Learners in Germany

Vocational training is intended to pave the way to job security and satisfaction - according to the research group on “Work Force Integration and Reintegration” at the Federal Institute for Vocational Training (BIBB). This would imply that initial and continuing vocational training keep abreast of changing occupational requirements and impart knowledge and skills that trainees and workers will be able to utilize for many years to come. It calls for state programme funding to promote such skills, the availability of suitable vocational training curricular material and the provision of appropriate train-the-trainer courses.

The promotion of disadvantaged young people in compliance with Art. 40c of the Labour Promotion Law

Trainees with poor school achievement and/or social problems need special encouragement to begin vocational training and see it through to the end. In Germany, Art. 40c of the Labour Promotion Law provides for such support, supplementing in-company training with parallel assistance programmes and promoting initial vocational training in non-enterprise training facilities.

Since 1994, the new para. 2a of Art. 40c of the Labour Promotion Law has provided an opportunity to continue social and educational assistance to young people who have completed non-enterprise training measures under Art. 40c, para. 2 of the Labour Promotion Law if they need such help to find or secure a job. The new regulation is designed to remove obstacles disadvantaged young people face when transferring from training in non-enterprise training facilities to a job by continuing to give them individual assistance. This help is intended to reduce the risk of unemployment and the accompanying personal and professional development handicaps which some disadvantaged young people encounter even after they have successfully completed training.

Objective of vocational training: integration

“Integration” is used in this context to mean a process or a state which opens up “access to avenues of social prestige”. The problem of integration as such will never be eliminated in an open and changing society. Just as the ladders to social prestige change, so, too, does access to them. Issues of work force integration and reintegration can basically therefore be subdivided according to the:

- “points” where access to the avenues is interrupted (e.g. the first threshold: the transition from school to training; the second threshold: the transition from training to employment, interrupting a career to have children);
- groups affected by the interruption;
- reasons for the interruption;
- measures and concepts to correct the disturbance.

As a general rule any interruption affects the individual’s fundamental right to free development of personality (and other basic rights) and wastes potential talent. Especially in a country such as Germany where primary resources are scarce, developing human resources presents the best opportunity for prosperity and is thus a major focus of policy and research.

* Status lines: positions with higher social recognition.
Federal Institute for Vocational Training records reveal that the vocational training system’s ability to integrate/reintegrate people is limited if it does not manage to differentiate its training offers more effectively to changing training prerequisites and the training needs of its clientele. Our work increasingly poses the question of how groups who have received no training in the past might be reached through more flexible and differentiated forms of training.

Evidence substantiates the hypothesis that many young people and especially those who have no lower secondary school leaving certificate or have attended a special school (for slow learners) will continue to have problems when transferring from school to in-company training (first threshold), even when the situation on the training place market improves. Problems in transferring from vocational training to the work force (second threshold) have not disappeared. Although not so many young people in the west German Länder are affected as was the case in the early 1980s, this does not rule out qualitative breaches between training and employment. Inversely, these problems have intensified in the eastern Länder.

The attractiveness and quality of vocational training, already important issues, are becoming more and more crucial. The quality of the dual system is measured among other things by its ability to integrate disadvantaged young people. Long-lasting vocational integration is only possible if new occupational requirements are addressed in training. The leaders in this area have been the restructured training occupations. Disadvantaged young people must not be excluded from training in these occupations. This would place whole occupational fields in the commercial and trade/technical area beyond the reach of potential trainees among this group of young people, thus narrowing their long-term chances of integration. Training the disadvantaged in demanding occupations is less a problem of this particular group than a challenge to develop suitable qualification concepts.

Despite the wide range of activities that have been undertaken in this field, the problems of vocational integration and reintegration through further training, retraining and continuing training are likewise still far from being solved. On the contrary, high unemployment and the influx of resettlers from Eastern Europe have complicated the problem. The threat of unemployment looms for those who did not undergo training during the years when training places were scarce. These young adults, now aged between 18 and 25 run a high risk of joining the ranks of the unemployed as a result of the loss of jobs for those with “no formal qualifications” (NFQ). If we look at the east German Länder, we see that the disparities are far more evident in an economy overshadowed by massive retrenchment processes and restructuring.
**Promotion measures: participation rates and costs**

In 1994, some 49 200 (in 1993: 53 200) persons were admitted for the first time into programmes in the “old” Länder under the promotion of vocational training of disadvantaged trainees clause (Art. 40c Labour Promotion Law). Girls and young women comprised 34% of this figure (in 1993: 32%). Tutoring was given to 42 800 trainees parallel to their training course, 6 400 commenced vocational training in a non-enterprise training facility. Young foreigners and young adults accounted for 22% (10 900) of those assisted. Foreigners constituted 21% (9 000) of those coached during vocational training and

---

**Table 2:**

The state aids disadvantaged young trainees who need special help because of their poor school performance or social difficulties. The aim is to enable disadvantaged young people to assume, continue and successfully complete vocational training by providing assistance parallel to their training or vocational training in extra-plant facilities. The measures are intended to take the trainees’ special situation into consideration, address language and educational deficits and provide social and educational support. Priority is given to assistance offered parallel to training courses.

**Groups eligible for assistance**

The Federal Labour Office may support the vocational training of the following groups of persons if - without such aid - the person will not find a training place or is likely to discontinue training.

1. Foreign trainees;
2. Slow learners among German trainees, especially those who have left lower secondary school without obtaining a final certificate and young people who have attended schools for the learning impaired (special schools);
3. Socially disadvantaged German trainees, irrespective of the level of their general education, in particular:
   - Young people with behavioural disorders, as determined by the Psychological Service;
   - Dyslexics;
   - Young people who have been given child care assistance under the Children and Youth Welfare Act provided they are not undergoing training in a shelter for these reasons;
   - Young people who were former drug addicts;
   - Young ex-convicts;
   - Young prisoners, if the measure will enable them to take up vocational training, or if the continuation of vocational training will reduce their sentence or result in a suspended sentence on probation;
   - Young ethnic German resettlers from Eastern Europe who have difficulties with the German language.
4. Trainees likely to fail their in-plant training course if they are not given assistance, judging by their previous training achievements or because of social problems.
Integration of persons as such is no longer in the limelight of the debate, but rather the question of curricular input and further development.

In 1994, 3,300 trainees in the old Länder completed their training in an extra-plant training centre; 3,000 passed the final examination. In the same year, programmes were supported for around 19,100 1st-year participants in the “new” Länder (in 1993: 15,100). Girls and young women made up 29% of this figure (1993: 33%). In 1994, 10,200 young people received coaching parallel to their training course (in 1993: 8,800), and 8,900 young people began vocational training in a non-enterprise training facility (in 1993: 6,300).

The cost for the promotion of vocational training for disadvantaged trainees according to Art. 40c of the Labour Promotion Law totalled 845 million deutschmarks in 1993 (in 1992: 660 million deutschmarks).

In addition to the programmes sponsored under Art. 40 - 40c (para. 1 - 3) of the Labour Promotion Law, the new Länder benefited from promotion of vocational training in non-enterprise facilities during a transitional period ending in 1992/1993 in accordance with Art. 40c, para. 4 of the Labour Promotion Law/GDR of 22 June 1990. At the end of December 1994, some 14,400 young people were taking part in a non-enterprise vocational training course in accordance with Art. 40c, para. 4 of the Labour Promotion Law/GDR. They had either been unable to find a training place in an enterprise because of the situation on the training market or they had lost their training place when their company went bankrupt or their plant was closed down.

In recent years various strategies for the vocational integration of young people have been developed and put into practice. Preparatory vocational measures, training in non-enterprise facilities and coaching parallel to training courses are typical of some of the approaches for which the basic structures have been consolidated. Consequently, the principal problem is no longer integration as such, but rather the question of curricular input and further development. These aspects are coming to the fore especially since training in non-enterprise facilities is becoming more common in the east German Länder. There these institutions have to enrol not only disadvantaged young people as a priority group. They must also accommodate anyone unable to find an in-company training place, regardless of the level of school education they have reached. This means that more research has to be devoted to means of guaranteeing the necessary practice-orientation. This includes prioritizing training for occupations with a secure future. The need for internal differentiation has likewise become more acute. This requirement has already become a must in vocational training in general.

**The principle of differentiation**

The preservation and further development of the dual system depends not least on the extent to which it manages to accommodate the diverse groups of young people.

Integration of persons as such is no longer in the limelight of the debate, but rather the question of curricular input and further development.

In 1994, 3,300 trainees in the old Länder completed their training in an extra-plant training centre; 3,000 passed the final examination. In the same year, programmes were supported for around 19,100 1st-year participants in the “new” Länder (in 1993: 15,100). Girls and young women made up 29% of this figure (1993: 33%). In 1994, 10,200 young people received coaching parallel to their training course (in 1993: 8,800), and 8,900 young people began vocational training in a non-enterprise training facility (in 1993: 6,300).

The cost for the promotion of vocational training for disadvantaged trainees according to Art. 40c of the Labour Promotion Law totalled 845 million deutschmarks in 1993 (in 1992: 660 million deutschmarks).

In addition to the programmes sponsored under Art. 40 - 40c (para. 1 - 3) of the Labour Promotion Law, the new Länder benefited from promotion of vocational training in non-enterprise facilities during a transitional period ending in 1992/1993 in accordance with Art. 40c, para. 4 of the Labour Promotion Law/GDR of 22 June 1990. At the end of December 1994, some 14,400 young people were taking part in a non-enterprise vocational training course in accordance with Art. 40c, para. 4 of the Labour Promotion Law/GDR. They had either been unable to find a training place in an enterprise because of the situation on the training market or they had lost their training place when their company went bankrupt or their plant was closed down.

**Approaches in practice**

In recent years various strategies for the vocational integration of young people have been developed and put into practice. Preparatory vocational measures, training in non-enterprise facilities and coaching parallel to training courses are typical of some of the approaches for which the basic structures have been consolidated. Consequently, the principal problem is no longer integration as such, but rather the question of curricular input and further development. These aspects are coming to the fore especially since training in non-enterprise facilities is becoming more common in the east German Länder. There these institutions have to enrol not only disadvantaged young people as a priority group. They must also accommodate anyone unable to find an in-company training place, regardless of the level of school education they have reached. This means that more research has to be devoted to means of guaranteeing the necessary practice-orientation. This includes prioritizing training for occupations with a secure future. The need for internal differentiation has likewise become more acute. This requirement has already become a must in vocational training in general.

**The principle of differentiation**

The preservation and further development of the dual system depends not least on the extent to which it manages to accommodate the diverse groups of young people. It is not just a question of the vocational integration of those young people who are hard to integrate in training and an occupation because of their handicaps or other disadvantages. It is also a matter of including those who will not be interested in dual system training unless skilled worker jobs are given more prestige and skilled workers have better career prospects. This is where the principle of internal differentiation becomes relevant. Internal differentiation should not be confused with differentiation in the level of qualifications (e.g. “simple training courses” for the disadvantaged). What is meant is a differentiation in training contents and forms, teaching and learning methods, while preserving a common minimum standard for all and fulfilling the objective of promoting the individual in the best possible way. A more apt description would perhaps be individualization (e.g. on the one hand, offers to offset deficits, on the other hand, opportunities to acquire additional knowledge and skills). To be consistent, the demand for more individualization cannot be restricted solely to enterprise training; vocational schools have an important role to play. An important related issue is the form that this individualization and internal differentiation should take at the various training sites. The principle of dif-
The more we manage to reduce the number of disadvantaged young people (....), the fewer and less severe problems untrained young people will cause in society and in the country as a whole.

Table 3: Promotion of Disadvantaged Young People

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Old Länder</th>
<th>New Länder</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Admission in the year under review</td>
<td>51 200</td>
<td>52 300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in extra-plant facilities</td>
<td>5 700</td>
<td>6 600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assistance during training</td>
<td>45 500</td>
<td>45 700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In addition: measures under Art. 40, para 4 of the Labour Promotion Law/GDR</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolments at the end of the year under review</td>
<td>56 100</td>
<td>68 900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in extra-plant facilities</td>
<td>14 500</td>
<td>15 300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assistance during training</td>
<td>41 600</td>
<td>53 600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In addition: measures under Art. 40, para 4 of the Labour Promotion Law/GDR</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure in million deutschmarks</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>582</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Federal Labour Office
Despite the wealth of individual studies and measures, no single coherent strategy has been conceived so far to attack the problem.

It is undisputed that those responsible for vocational training must continue and if possible intensify their measures, especially their programmes for disadvantaged young people.

can and must be complementary. The more we manage to reduce the number of disadvantaged young people through dedicated vocational training programmes and social and educational assistance, the fewer and less severe problems untrained young people will cause in society and in the country as a whole.
The complex public debate indicates that the general public is well aware of the objectives and problems associated with the late training of young unqualified people and shows increasing interest in new strategies to combat these problems. The promotion of disadvantaged young people, in other words, the younger portion of a larger population without vocational qualifications, is often seen in Germany under the aspect of taking full advantage of the pool of potential skilled workers and the shortage of skilled labour in trade and industry. This view is far too narrow. When improving measures to promote the vocational training of disadvantaged young people, altruism and the costs of social welfare are important, but the emphasis should be on the personal and social aspects.

Despite the wealth of individual studies and measures, no single coherent strategy has been conceived so far to attack the problem. Basically two contradictory concepts dominate the arena today:

- The first concept attempts to solve the problem by continuing to improve and perfect the means available to assist disadvantaged young people within the limitations of the system of existing training occupations and criteria of the German Vocational Training Act.

- The other concept, which is propagated principally by the Federal Government, favours - likewise within the framework of the Vocational Training Act - the creation of new and special training occupations which are particularly suitable for disadvantaged young people. These occupations should be better matched than the standard training occupations to the practical skills of disadvantaged young people. Training for these occupations should have less theory and be shorter if necessary.

Training slow learners

Those responsible for and involved in vocational training unanimously agree that considerable efforts have been made in the past to implement educational policy principles and give all young people qualified and recognised vocational training. The consequences of young people having no training, and the related employment, social and economic risks are considered serious. In view of the shrinking demand for unskilled and semi-skilled labour, these problems and their impact will become even more acute unless countermeasures are taken. For this reason, there is wholehearted agreement that those responsible for vocational training and especially vocational training for disadvantaged young people should continue and expand their programmes. These measures will help this particular group to acquire training in state-recognised training occupations under the Vocational Training Act.

Arguments supporting assisted vocational training for slow learners show that lower and intermediate-level vocational training qualifications are better than no qualifications at all, if this is the only way that

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4: Examinations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- additional oral examination to balance out marks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- longer processing time for theoretical examination.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- easier forms of written examination.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- recognition of the passed practical examination as partial qualification with a certificate if the trainee did not pass the theoretical examination.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The combination of work and initial vocational training is a sensible and necessary strategy for the special group of unskilled 20 to 30-year-olds.

Training the Unskilled

The combination of work and initial vocational training is sensible and necessary for the special group of unskilled 20 to 30-year-olds. This measure should complement other preventive activities aimed at increasing the training rate of young people. A concept to assist the late training of young adults must emphasise on-the-job learning for two reasons:

1. From a curricular and educational viewpoint, on-the-job learning is a particularly suitable method for this group of people to acquire vocational qualifications because the personal learning situation of the individual, which often includes rejection of school learning as a form, can be taken into consideration.

2. On-the-job learning - acquiring qualifications with concurrent employment - is also a necessary element of late vocational training because the living conditions of 20-year-olds who have never begun or completed vocational training and for whom retraining is no alternative favour job-related training.

Qualification Criteria

Consequently, the qualification strategy proposed here is based on the following criteria:

1. Achieving recognised training qualifications in compliance with the Vocational Training Act/Craft Trades Code;

2. Dividing current job profiles into partial qualifications/modules and developing adult training curricula;

3. Linking job/contract learning and courses in cooperation between enterprises and non-enterprise/extra-plant training facilities;

4. Raising the level of earnings in keeping with the increase in qualifications;

5. Providing constant vocational counseling.

Selected bibliography

Der Bundesminister für Bildung und Wissenschaft (eds.): Daten und Fakten über Jugendliche ohne abgeschlossene Berufsausbildung. Bonn 1991


Zielke, Dietmar; Lemke, Ilse: Außerbetriebliche Berufsausbildung benachteiligter Jugendlicher: Anspruch und Realität. BIBB (eds.) Berlin, Bonn 1989 (Berichte zur beruflichen Bildung, Heft 94)
Training and local development
An experiment in cooperation between different bodies for the provision of training on the Mediterranean coast

In this article the author considers how training can become a means of participating in local development by taking advantage of valuable and unrepeatable experience. Experience in many cases long and painful and described by a great many authors, some of them anonymous, who sought with enthusiasm and a certain amount of ingenuity to make the organisations on which they depended and which they hoped to involve more sensitive to the social environment. Why not take advantage of synergy when the ends are complementary and resources very restricted? It all seemed so easy. If the various organisations chose not to collaborate, it was because the various people involved were not listening to one another. After a great deal of joint effort that started out from understanding each other’s background, we managed to establish a cordial and productive relationship. But even now some of the organisations continue to ignore each other and remain impervious to the environment in which they operate. In recounting this experience of individuals and institutions it is worth emphasising that what counts is people but what is indispensable for durability is institutions.

Think globally, act locally

The framework within which people can initiate a process of social dialogue and cooperation is their home territory. In our case this is the district of Marina Alta, situated in the north of the province of Alicante in the region of Valencia. According to the figures for 1991 published by the Valencian Statistical Institute, the population at that time was 110,302 and the density 181.7 per sq.km. The chief of the 34 towns in the district is Dénia with an official population of 24,764.

Marina Alta has never really experienced a process of industrialisation but has merely seen the growth of various branches of industry. Since the 1960s a service sector has developed, centring on tourism, which is now a major economic activity.

The district has a number of specific sociological and human features which help to determine its culture, values and mentality.

A good question is better than an excellent reply

Until the 1987/88 academic year the number of students registered with Dénia’s Vocational Training Institute remained between 200 and 400. The number then gradually increased and by 1995/96 had reached around 1,500.

Some 55% of the Institute’s students come from various towns in the district. Training courses cover the auto industry, the electrical industry, administrative and secretarial work and sport, tourism and the hotel trade.

During 1986/87 the Institute conducted an interdisciplinary experiment entitled “Getting to know Marina Alta”. Teachers of Spanish, geography and history and approximately a hundred students from the various specialist courses worked together using the discovery method in order to learn more about the history and development of our region, asking the questions “What role do we play in the community?” and “How does our project link in with our environment?”

In 1986/87 15 students did periods of practical work on a sandwich course basis. By 1995 the aim was for 1011. In its annual report for 1992 the Vocational Training Institute’s Department of External Relations highlighted the ability demonstrated by our former students to adapt to new technology, helped effectively by the strategic plans and the close relationship existing between sandwich-type work experience, job placement and the fact that employers in the district know

Josep Vicent Mascarell
Director of the Dénia Vocational Training Institute and Director of the Centre for Tourism Development (C.D.T.) of the Autonomous Community of Valencia
“...with limited resources, hardly known as we were and with a programme of training courses without prestige one is left only with imagination, effort, generosity and cooperation.”

“During this period we learned to intensify the social dialogue and began to become involved with all kinds of bodies in the field of social welfare and firms and to encourage contacts between all stages of the educational and training system and the permanent, established relationship between the world of education and work.”

...with limited resources, hardly known as we were and with a programme of training courses without prestige one is left only with imagination, effort, generosity and cooperation.

The reform of the Spanish educational system, publication of experience gained in connection with “The transition of young people from school to adult working life” sponsored by the European Commission from 1977 onwards, and our own urge to do something led us to discover other bodies with responsibility and expertise in the fields of training and employment, namely the National Institute for Employment (INEM) and the Dénia municipal authority.

We decided to create a liaison body which initially would play a purely consultative role but later would aim to represent the district, with decision-making powers and a permanent structure.

Involvement in the interests of consistency and effectiveness

In 1989, a publication of the Spanish Ministry of Education and Science, in collaboration with IFAPLAN, proposed the creation of model “Project 2020: an integrated vocational training plan for the Dénia region”.

This project marked the beginning of efforts to link vocational training with the social and economic structure of the Marina Alta district. It involved other municipal authorities, the Chamber of Commerce, employers’ associations and the unions.

In its initial stage, Project 2020 outgrew its origins and became an autonomous project with the Marina Alta Liaison Agency as the coordinating body.

Although all the potential members were in agreement and working towards its realisation, it never proved possible to give the Liaison Agency legal form, nor to set up an advisory committee. Perhaps the timing was wrong, just as travel to the moon was not feasible at the time of Galileo. The agency disappeared, but a number of its specific initiatives survived and have become signposts for development.

Providing and accepting information create order, but energy is needed to maintain it

During this period we learned to intensify the social dialogue and began to become involved with all kinds of bodies in the field of social welfare and firms and to encourage contacts between all stages of the educational and training system and the permanent, established relationship between the world of education and work.”

*Editorial note

IFAPLAN: is an applied social research institute based in Cologne. Through its Brussels office it previously provided a base for the Technical Assistance Office of the PETRA programme and since 1995 for EUOPS - the European Office Programme Support (for the Technical Assistance Office for the Adapt and Employment initiatives).

EGB: basic general education
FP: vocational training
BUP: polyvalent integrated baccalaureate
ESCUÉLA TALLER: Using work experience, schools for training young people who have dropped out of education (non-regulated training)
courses within the various programmes. Thus among the most successful activities of the vocational guidance programme were the information round tables for discussing career possibilities, which were chiefly targeted at students and their parents. These were not difficult to organise since the members of the Technical Office included representatives of elementary and secondary schools and vocational guidance services.

These round tables developed to such an extent that in 1994 and 1995 they were replaced by the first and second Marina Alta Career Guidance Fairs. More than 2,000 students visited the fair, at which most of the institutions concerned with vocational training and job placement for young people were represented.

Another activity with considerable impact was the Enterprise Development Campaign. This involved setting up mini-firms from elementary school up to Vocational Training Institute level. Coordination was put in the hands of FEMIMA (Federation of Mini-firms of Marina Alta). Here again, the municipal authorities cooperated in the experiment. Mini-firms were regarded as an educational means of encouraging enterprise and initiative among young people and of helping them to develop creative and entrepreneurial skills, both from the general training and the economic and employment orientation.

A district fair is now held every year at which the products of the various mini-firms are exhibited. Some 400 elementary school and Stage I vocational training students took part in FEMIMA in the first few years.

FEMIMA has the support of financial institutions and is recognised by firms associated with the AFC (Agency of Employers’ Associations for the Development of Continuing Training).

The lack of flexibility of training within the education system, the unavailability of crediting experience in the curriculum, and the lack of funds and recognition by the educational authorities have led to a decline in FEMIMA’s activity in the past two years.

Even so, the experience has helped to increase the stock of knowledge and know-how in Marina Alta. Changes in attitude, the subject-matter, content and methodology of curricula, some aspects of organisation and the way in which know-how is treated still remain.

Years later, in 1994 there came into being an organisation known as CREAMA (Consortium for the Economic Recovery of Marina Alta). This was the result of an agreement between the three local authorities in the region - Dénia, Benissa and Pego - through their local development agencies, with the National Institute for Employment and the provincial council participating. Its purpose is to create jobs by creating firms through full exploitation of the social and economic network. Its basic tools are training and promoting industrial and commercial enterprise.

Although this was a district initiative, the Consortium had its origins in the strategic plan for the city of Dénia. Its extension to the district, though complex, presented few difficulties. To take advantage of existing development agencies and the experience of cooperation already gained was of fundamental importance: 1,750 people receiving help, 192 procedures for establishing firms initiated, 27 new firms created and 109 jobs created are some of the results achieved so far.

The European network

In 1989 an initiative by the government of Valencia led to the Vocational Training Institute as a member of the 2020 MA Technical Office becoming involved in the PETRA I and II action programmes and, together with Oaklands College in the UK, Greta Languedoc Roussillon in France, and the Siegerland Language School in Germany, setting up the GEREC group. Between then and 1995 the Vocational Training Institute in cooperation with various other members at national and international level, has taken part in 11 Community programmes or initiatives. In addition, as a result of this European approach, it became a co-founder of the Centre for European Languages and Cultures, whose members include the Dénia municipal authority and the Dutch, English and German residents’ associations.
In 1993 the centre organised its First European Week in Marina Alta.

This explosion of European consciousness resulted in the Dénia municipal authority’s strategic plan for 1991, whose stated aim was to create an enterprise city with a European focus.

**Training an essential component of any development plan**

Between 1991 and 1992 participants in the Additional Petra (South Devon-UK, Rander-DK) action programme were actively designing and developing the European Tourist Institute (ETI).

Also under the aegis of this programme, the Spanish members - the municipal authority, the Educational Council, the Vocational Training Institute and the Chamber of Commerce - designed and put into operation a study centre for theoretical and practical training known as OGET (Office of Tourism Studies and Management).

In 1992, in response to a proposal by ETI and OGET the Council for Culture, Education and Science, the Dénia Municipal Council and the Chamber of Commerce, Industry and Shipping of Alicante in 1992 signed a framework cooperation agreement with the objective of improving skills and vocational training. It was on the basis of this agreement that the Marina Alta School of Hotel Management and Tourism was established in 1993.

The creation of the hotel management school was thus the result of a development plan for training in the field of hotel management and tourism and based on the regulations then in force and on experience of cooperation in the field of vocational training already gained by the institutions involved. The participation of these institutions in a number of different European programmes - PETRA, FORCE, LINGUA and, EUROFORM - increased their know-how and ability to exploit the potential for synergy.

The school is one example of how with imagination and a small investment it is possible to meet the need for training and play a part in regional development. The school combines the complementary forms of training within the education system, training on the job and continuing training. It optimises use of resources. The job placement rate varies between 85% and 95%. The same model is being used in other parts of the Autonomous Community of Valencia and has been followed in establishing the School of Higher Tourism Studies in the Republic of Cuba.

The creation of a board of governors including representatives of employers, unions, the Chamber of Commerce and the municipal authority manage with flexibility and firmness a body of over 700 students, the European programmes, and research activity would seem to be the next step. This will be the only school of hotel/tourism of its kind in the Autonomous Community of Valencia, which makes administering it a worthwhile learning process.

**Training and technology as paradigms of socio-economic development**

Every territory has a certain value in terms of industrial competitiveness which is the result of interaction between the competitiveness of its enterprises in the sense of skills and know-how and the supporting environment, by which is meant all those localised factors that help business and industry to function - the educational system, research laboratories, infrastructures, social values, measures to encourage enterprise, the organisation of agencies and institutions and the links between them, and the ability to establish creative relationships with external bodies. No community development project should create a dichotomy between what is commercially profitable and socially necessary.

Business and industry are the agents permitting the concrete expression of this competitive ability which can result in prosperity of the community. A sufficient amount of human capital and are adequate level of technology are necessary for this result.

CREAMA, the Marina Alta School of Hotel Management and Tourism, the spirit of cooperation and the promotion of enterprise, social cohesion, and the experiences gained are now part of the supporting environment and competitive advantage for firms in Marina Alta.
Tacit Knowledge in a Low Tech-Firm

Academical discussion within the OECD-area is very concerned with the competitive advantage of nations. The origin of this discussion goes back to the end of the 70-ies when it was noticed that the old industrialized world faced an increased competition from the newly industrialized countries (Laestadius, 1980).

The standard argument for how advanced industrialized economies should cope with this challenge borrows much of its theoretical base from Vernon’s theory on international production and structural change (Vernon, 1966) and orthodox innovation theory. Advanced industrialized countries should specialize in the early R&D-intensive phases of product and process cycles, such goes the argument, assuming that technological and industrial development starts with basic science and is followed by applied research but also on the assumption that R&D-intensive artifacts and processes are more advanced and more difficult to imitate than production with lower R&D intensity.

This S&T perspective has, however, severe shortcomings as a base for understanding the competence necessary for industrial success and for policy conclusions. Based on the empirical results from a case study at a Swedish lowtech company (and industry) I argue that the S&T perspective provides an incomplete picture of the knowledge formation and the industrial competence needed for staying competitive or innovative.

This S&T perspective has, however, severe shortcomings as a base for understanding the competence necessary for industrial success and for policy conclusions. Based on the empirical results from a case study1 at a Swedish lowtech company (and industry) I argue that the S&T perspective provides an incomplete picture of the knowledge formation and the industrial competence needed for staying competitive or innovative.

Based on a thorough case study of a chain factory in Sweden, Ramnäs Anchor Chains, this study analyses in detail the fact that this “low tech” plant, with no reported R&D and a formally lowly educated staff reveals a high international competitiveness in mooring chains for the offshore industry: the toughest market segment in chain manufacturing.

The case study reveals continuous incremental innovations, many of which can be characterized as user-producer oriented. Ramnäs is thus a strong demand receiver showing an ability to transform demands from strong buyers into high quality products. Ramnäs is also a technology pusher, i.e. itself introducing new qualities and standards on the markets. The company obviously also has a capacity to absorb external R&D and transform it into industrially relevant knowledge. To some extent, the learning processes associated with that are independent of science.

This knowledge formation cannot be understood as a diffusion process starting with science, but as a transformation of knowledge between different thought worlds. Such transformation is in itself a cognitive process often neglected in analyses of industrial competence and of the complexity of industrial systems.

Comparing the Ramnäs case with parallel case studies it is argued that it is not necessary to sacrifice these traditions of industrial creativity, innovative spirit, practical skills, industrial craftsmanship and organizational knowledge often revealed in mature industries on the altar of science in the present restructuring of vocational training and other industrial education systems.

The second section thus contains a detailed presentation and analysis of manufacturing of chains in Sweden - an activity which from one perspective is low-tech indeed but from another appears to be highly innovative and highly competitive in international markets. In the third section, and...
relating the analysis to what is found in other case studies, I argue that industrial competence does not necessarily belong to the same thought world as competence in R&D. This should be considered when reflecting on how to restructure vocational training and industrial schools in this era of great trust in science.

The Ramnäs anchor chain factory - the high quality of low-tech production

Founded in 1590 Ramnäs has always been part of the ironworks cluster which constituted the industrial basis for Swedish international competitiveness in the 17th, 18th and the 19th centuries. In 1876, Ramnäs started - with the help of migrant blacksmiths - the manufacturing of chains. The modern competence in anchor and mooring chains has its origin in the Second World War and the need to supply the Swedish merchant fleet and navy with anchor chains.

Joint war time efforts from Asea-Svets (a welding company), Ramnäs and Ljusne (another chainworks) resulted in superb international competitiveness which lasted well into the sixties. By that time Ramnäs had developed its production system further and became one of very few chainworks which could meet the increased demand in the seventies for high quality, high strength chain products for the offshore industry.

Until now, Ramnäs is the only chain manufacturer in the world which has delivered mooring chains of quality class 4 for the offshore industry with a link dimension of more than 100 mm (blank diameter). At the end of 1994 Ramnäs delivered the final chains of a 6000 ton order to Norsk Hydro (the Troll Field in the North Sea) of 152 mm chain of grade 4 worth more than SEK 150 mil (ca. US$ 20 mil.); the biggest order ever received and the strongest chain ever delivered by the chain industry and representing more than half of Ramnäs’ yearly turnover.

The total size of world production of chains is unknown but world trade exceeds US$ 1200 mill. Most of that is, however, chains of lighter and/or lower quality than the high grade heavy mooring chains. High quality heavy stud chain makes up maybe 5% of the total market.

Swedish, Japanese and Spanish manufacturers dominate the world market for this heavy stud chain. With some reservations about the problems of interpreting the trade statistics on chain, it seems that Ramnäs, since about 1989, has maintained and even increased its market share in quantities parallel to raising its prices more than the competitors (reflecting a larger share of high quality shipments). Ramnäs has also managed to increase its value added more than and to levels well above the average in Swedish manufacturing.

By established international terminology, Ramnäs is a low-tech company within a low-tech industry (ISIC, Rev. 3, 28.7420). The share of R&D is less than 0.6% of turnover and the company reports no patent activity. The international competitiveness of Ramnäs reveals, however, an industrial competence beyond from the S&T perspective.

This section of Swedish industry is sometimes characterized as “unskilled labour intensive”. Ramnäs is not an exception. If competence is measured by formal education it can be noticed that about two thirds of the employees have only lower secondary school as their highest basic education (9 years), about a quarter have secondary school/college (Swedish gymnasium) but the remaining 10% have upper secondary school/college (Swedish gymnasium) or (for two persons) university level education. About four of the very few employees with middle level education (gymnasium) has studied at a “doer-oriented” industrial school oriented towards the steel industry. As a whole this formal competence is very low by average Swedish educational standards. It is low also compared to the Swedish metal industry in general.

From a S&T point of view, a chain is a very old product, its manufacturing takes place in a mature industry and the core process, welding, is an old technology long since documented in handbooks all over the world. Even so a deep analysis

1) This study was financed by the Swedish National Board for Industrial and Technical Development.

2) For the empirical background for this section, see Laestadius, 1994.

3) The size of a chain is expressed in the diameter of the blank (steel bar) from which the link is formed. A grade 4 link of size 157 mm has a length of 94 cm and a weight of 345 kg!
of the company reveals continuous incremental innovations in products and processes for many decades.

Ramnäs has thus been able to develop the well known processes of cutting, heating, bending, welding, heat treatment, proof loading etc. to be suitable and efficient also for high quality steels in the production of increasingly heavier dimensions to meet the high standards needed in offshore activities. Although - superficially at least - a chain is a chain, the amount of incremental innovations in product and processes separating a pre-World War anchor chain from the recent Troll-Field mooring chain is too large to be neglected. These innovations in fact lie more or less totally out of sight from the S&T perspective. Nevertheless they explain the difference between companies that are internationally competitive and those which are not.

The Ramnäs company has demonstrated competence in everyday engineering problem-solving: new combinations and intelligent variations occur on old themes. Although there is nothing revolutionary in improved studs and shackles or changes in welding and heating processes, such incremental innovations reveal an industrial creativity of a collective and systemic nature. Associating their empirical awareness to the user-producer relations studied in modern innovation theory (cf. Lundvall, 1992, chpt. 3 & von Hippel, 1988) we recognize the many different roles played by Ramnäs. The company appears to be a strong user; a demand former, forcing its subcontractors and equipment contractors to improve.

More or less all equipment used in this small chain factory is the result of intensive dialogues between the technicians at Ramnäs and their suppliers of machinery. Existing techniques have been modified and new equipment has been designed due to these dialogues. Sometimes the desired specifications are given in detail, sometimes there is just an exchange of ideas and sometimes the Ramnäs people do part of the design and the manufacturing of the equipment themselves.

Ramnäs has two different profiles in its role as a strong producer. First the company acts as an innovative demand receiver with a competence to establish a dialogue with the very demanding buyers (like Norsk Hydro) and classification companies (like American Petroleum Institute) in the industry and develop its products and processes in response to their demands on high quality. Ramnäs' second producer role is as a technology pusher. In fact Ramnäs has been a proactive leader in pushing for higher quality on mooring chains as well as a leader in the development of product design and production technology.

This industrial competence is to a large extent based on a good ability to absorb external R&D (cf. “receiver competence” in Eliasson, 1990) and which is not exactly the same - on a local learning capacity in the organization. These abilities, however, and the activities connected with them, are neither identified as innovations, nor registered in the accounts as R&D. In fact, when interviewed, many of the employees at Ramnäs had difficulties isolating and identifying their day to day activities as incremental innovations even if they had been directly involved in such processes (according to the terminology of this paper).

The learning capacity identified above to a large extent has the character of creating industrially relevant knowledge. Partly, but not wholly, this involves the transformation of scientific knowledge, partly it is a learning process independent of science. Let me illustrate with some examples from this process of knowledge formation - which is our aggregate concept for this - at Ramnäs.

The kind of knowledge behind what is written on the materials certificates, e.g. phase diagrams, accompanying the blank deliveries from the steelworks are of great importance but of no direct use in the industrial processes at Ramnäs. What matters in heat treatment is the speed of the chain in the chimney-like furnace, the temperature and its stability at various levels in the furnace, and the possibility of using existing equipment to obtain the quality standards needed and promised. The interaction of these parameters and their control, even under conditions of a changing environment, as well as their relation to the settings in the rest of the chain manufacturing process must be

“(…) a good ability to absorb external R&D (…) and - which is not exactly the same - on a local learning capacity in the organization.”

“The learning capacity (…) has the character of creating industrially relevant knowledge. Partly, (…) this involves the transformation of scientific knowledge, partly it is a learning process independent of science.”
studied in detail and learned through practical experience.

The handling of the stud which of traditionally is pressed into every link to strengthen and to reduce its deformation when loaded provides us with another illustration. Corrosion usually rapidly reduces the efficiency of the stud and even makes it fall out. This is an arena for fierce quality competition between the chain manufacturers. Ramnäs has attacked the problem on four fronts. The first was to change the shape of the soles of the stud which are pressed into the still warm links after they have been welded. An asymmetric shape and different size of the soles compensate for the difference in temperature between the welded and non-welded link sides. This allows for a better fitting and reduces the risk of fall-out. Secondly, Ramnäs has developed an expansion process which, through a highly concentrated pressure on the side of the inserted stud, prolongs it and thus expands the link and creates a tension in it which springs back following the corrosion of the link and the stud. Thirdly, Ramnäs has developed the methods of stud welding, a process which, although well-known in theory, is extremely complicated with the high quality steel used in heavy dimensions. Fourthly the company has developed a studless chain which necessitates a new shape of the individual links to distribute the forces in a new way when loaded.

It is difficult to find anything of "scientific interest" in this process of incremental innovations at the shop-floor level. Hitherto however, Ramnäs has compensated for the lack of basic education and formal training. There are, however, currently signs that too few of the employees have the relevant educational background to understand and fine tune the more complicated computer based control systems which are currently being installed all over the factory.

This experience, more or less shared among the employees at Ramnäs seems to be of a systemic character. Together they build up a precise knowledge of the behaviour and interaction of the equipment and the chains in production. The conditions for production are far from ideal. There are peculiarities everywhere: the furnaces do not behave exactly the same, nor do the welding machines. A low carbon alloyed high quality steel demands e.g. a lot of fine tuning in the cutting equipment (where the bars are cut to link size) to maintain productivity. In fact even the difference between two charges of the "same" steel quality is often enough to necessitate changes in the parameters which control welding and heat treatment.

"(…)the learning capacity at Ramnäs has compensated for the lack of basic education and formal training."
on the tradition of Fleck, Mary Douglas, in her recent study on organizational thinking, developed the concept thought world as a tool for understanding the cultural framework or context for knowledge formation (Douglas, 1986).

With the conceptual apparatus of Douglas we can interpret and describe the learning and knowledge formation processes at Ramnäs. The absorption capacity is not only a question of simple application or diffusion of externally produced R&D results obtained in the research laboratories of the steel makers or welding-technology research institutes (cf. Rogers, 1962). In fact the diffusion concept puts the phenomenon of industrial competence into a black box where it becomes protected from a deeper understanding (Rosenberg, 1982, chpt 7 & Nelson, 1993, chpt 1). Adopting the diffusion concepts assumes that the knowledge is already created, that the main intellectual work is done, and what is left is only a spread out. Our understanding of absorption ability and learning capacity is not that passive.

From the Fleck/Douglas perspective this process is more like a confrontation between different spheres of knowledge, i.e. from different thought worlds. What is a fact and what is of relevance in one thought world is not so in another. That makes the transformation from one thought world to another a cognitive process, basically collective in character, of learning and relearning in a new context. The problems for two cultures to communicate and to integrate knowledge from one thought world into another are thus large and easily underestimated.

In our Ramnäs case we identify a transformation of knowledge from one thought world which may be called “scientific” into new knowledge in another thought world which may be called “industrial”. In the small shipyards on the Swedish west coast, which are highly competitive on the international market, I have found (in an ongoing miniproject) similar confrontations between knowledge formation based on traditional craftsmanship and more “modern” industrial thinking. In a recent dissertation deep-going cultural confrontations were found between design engineers and manufacturing engineers within the mechanical industry (Karlson, 1994, pp 158 ff.). We also have reasons to believe that a study of the pharmaceutical industry would provide a different picture with a more important role for sciences (biomedical and chemical).

This confrontation between thought worlds may change over time as the importance of different types of thought styles may shift in the industrial development process. The outcome of this confrontation process, rather than the degree of “scientification”, lays the foundation for the industrial competence. Competitiveness and excellence can thus be created in industries characterized by high R&D-intensity as well as in industries with low R&D-intensity; it can be created in industries which are young as well as maturing and in “old” technologies like chain manufacturing as well as in “new” technologies. A priori we cannot postulate that there is a strong relation between a high R&D intensity and high industrial competence.

Compared to many other industrial activities like paper and pulp production (also classified as low- or middle-tech) and airplane manufacturing (classified as high-tech) chain manufacturing is simple and unsophisticated. Still, and when looked upon in detail, it reveals a complexity which, if mastered, makes the production process difficult to imitate.

This complexity manifests itself at different levels. In the Ramnäs case we have found it more or less on the shop floor, in a series of incremental innovations. In other industries we can imagine that the complexity of importance for the industrial competence occurs at other levels. We can, e.g. in the case of airplane manufacturing, identify systems of integrated production, the maintenance of which necessitates a high degree of organiza-
tionally based coordinating competence (cf. Eliasson, 1994). But not even this is the same as R&D.

And in process industries a recent thorough case study on how process operators in an oil refinery and a pulp-plant manage their tasks has revealed a professionalism, a systems knowledge and an "art of the operator" which on the one hand is independent of scientific knowledge but on the other is competent to fine tune highly computerized and complex production processes (Perby, 1995).

We have in this study shown that much of knowledge formation in a low tech company - even a highly competitive one - is more or less independent of science.

There are industrial traditions and non-trivial knowledge formation of importance for competitiveness which we have labelled industrial competence. This industrial competence grows and develops in specific industrial districts and companies. It is passed over from one generation of workers to another. Often - although Ramnäs is not a good example of this - this competence is also traditionally formed and transferred in vocational training and in industrial schools in the neighbourhood. The vocational training systems can thus, on the one hand, transfer, develop and confront industrial experience from different firms and on the other confront this industrial knowledge with the scientific thought world.

In line with the S&T perspective there is - in this era of fierce international competition - a strong emphasis put on science in the curricula for all industrial schools and training programmes. Of course all people working in industry must have basic knowledge in the relevant scientific disciplines: in fact even my study showed that the theoretical base at Ramnäs today probably is too narrow.

It may be argued that in general a highly educated labour force - which Ramnäs has not - will find it easier to transform its competence into new processes and products. Ramnäs shows excellence in a very specialized form of heavy welding and forging. If there is a shift away from floating platforms in the petroleum industry or if mooring technology substitutes wire and synthetic fibre for chains the very specialized industrial competence at Ramnäs is threatened.

It may also be argued - which we in another context have shown in 16 case studies (basically in middle and low tech firms) - that there is a large potential of creativity and for learning which can be mobilized among even lowly educated employees in traditional industries. In particular this seem to be the fact if training is combined with advanced changes in the organization of production, e.g. organizing teams around collective tasks and drastically reducing the layers of foremen (Hannngren, Laestadius & Odhnoff, 1995).

The problem, however, is whether the present “scientification” of industrial education and training neglects these forms of knowledge formation and industrial competence analyzed in this article. The challenge for lower and middle level industrial education programmes in their present restructuring is to handle and develop this confrontation between “the two cultures” of scientific knowledge and industrial competence. This challenge was also noticed some years ago in the well-known study Made in America (Dertouzous, 1989, pp 77 ff.).

To stay competitive it is important not to sacrifice traditions of industrial creativity, innovative spirit, practical skills, industrial craftsmanship and organizational knowledge on the altar of science. Industry lives on doers and practical problem solvers with a knowledge base related to a specific industrial context and only occasionally on the deep and general understanding of science.
References


Vocational education and at-risk youth in the United States

Educationally disadvantaged youth in the United States have great difficulty finding steady jobs providing real training and advancement opportunities. In October 1994 only 43 percent of the young people who had dropped out of high school the previous year were employed. Of recent (previous spring) graduates who had not gone to college, only 64 percent were employed (BLS 1995). Those who obtained employment accepted jobs paying 10 to 15 percent less than in 1980.

Greater investments in the human capital of these workers are needed. But what kind of education/training should get priority-generic academic skills or occupation specific skills? The Economist (March 12 1994) argues that occupation specific education should be dropped and generic skills should be taught instead:

Economists have long argued that the returns on general education are higher than those on specific training, because education is transferable whereas many skills tend to be job-specific. Today this case is becoming more compelling still as jobs become less secure, the service sector expands and the life-cycle of vocational skills diminishes and the market puts an even greater premium on the ability to deal with people and process information.

This policy recommendation, however, is based on three false premises
- academic skills are good substitutes for occupation specific skills
- accelerating skill obsolescence has reduced the payoff to occupational training.
- rising job turnover has reduced payoffs to occupational training by schools.

Let us examine what research tells about each of these issues.

Evidence that occupational skills are essential

In most jobs productivity derives directly from social abilities (such as good work habits and people skills) and cognitive skills that are specific to the job, the occupation and the occupational cluster: not from reading, writing and mathematics skills. When the small and medium size employers who provide most of the new jobs in the American economy are asked which skills they look for when hiring, they cite work habits and occupational skills ahead of reading and mathematics skills. In 1987 the owners of small and medium size businesses who were members of the National Federation of Independent Business were asked "Which abilities influence hiring selections the most?" Forty percent ranked 'occupational skills (already has them)' number 1 and another 14 percent ranked them number 2 (see table 1).

By contrast, only 6 percent of these American employers ranked 'reading, writing, math and reasoning ability' number 1 and another 13 percent ranked them number 2. Leadership and people skills were also seldom ranked at the top. The trait that most directly rivaled occupational skills was work habits. 'Work habits' were ranked most important 29 percent of the time and ranked number two 36 percent of the time. Only 3 percent of the employers ranked them #5 or #6. Clearly, good work habits are an important hiring criterion for just about every job.

There is more disagreement about the importance of already developed occupational skills. For 20 percent of the jobs, previous occupational skills ranked #5 or
#6. These tended to be the jobs requiring less skill-service and clerical workers, operatives and sales clerks. In these lower wage jobs, work habits were the number one consideration, ‘ability to learn new occupational and job skills’ was number 2 and already developed occupational skills was number 3. The ranking of ‘reading, writing, math and reasoning’ was last in the more highly skilled jobs and second from last in the less skilled jobs (Bishop 1995).

As a result, American high school graduates who are good at reading and mathematics do not get better jobs than their less accomplished peers in the years immediately after graduation (Bishop 1992). The best jobs tend to go to the graduates who took vocational courses and/or worked part-time during the school year (Bishop 1995).

### Success on the Job

Once hired, which abilities predict success on the job? The NFIB survey also provides insight into this question. The owners supplied information on the background and on-the-job success of two employees (A and B) who had recently occupied the same job. After the two employees had been at the firm for a year or more, the employers were asked “Which of the two employees (A or B) proved better on each of the following: ‘occupational and job skills’, ‘ability to learn new occupational and job skills’, ‘work habits and attitudes’, ‘people skills (teamwork, appearance, getting along)’, ‘leadership ability (organize, teach and motivate others)’ and as a group ‘reading, writing, math and reasoning ability.'” They were asked to evaluate whether A was “much better”, “better” or “no different” than B or whether B was “better” or “much better” than A. Since the firms were so small, the owners had contact with each worker, so judgements were probably quite well informed. In most cases owners perceived important differences in ability between their employees. In 78 percent of the cases the occupational skills of one of the two workers were judged to be “better” or “much better” than the other. Reading, writing, math and reasoning skills were judged different 58 percent of the time. Generally those who were strong along one dimension of ability were strong along other dimensions as well.

Which trait contributes most to overall job performance was determined by regressing relative starting wage rate, current (or most recent) wage rate and global ratings of relative productivity of worker A and B on their ranking on each of the six different worker abilities while controlling gender, ethnicity and marital status. Current wage and productivity reports for the date of the interview which was an average of about one year after hiring. For separated employees the productivity report is for “two weeks before leaving the firm” and the wage report is for “at the time of separation.” The results for all three labor market outcomes are presented in Figure 1. The bars in figure 1 represent the percentage differential in wage rates or productivity that results from one worker being ‘much better’ than another along one of the six ability dimensions while holding other abilities, tenure, ethnicity, gender, and marital status constant.

Ex-post assessments of relative occupational skill, learning ability, work habits and people skills all had significant positive relationships with relative global productivity ratings at approximately one year of tenure (the black bar in figure 1). Employer assessments of a worker’s academic skills and leadership ability, by contrast, had no relationship with current overall job performance ratings. Holding demographics and employer evaluations of

### Table 1: abilities sought when hiring

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ability</th>
<th>Percent ranked</th>
<th>Mean rank by skill</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Occupational/job skills (already has them)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>2.36 3.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to learn new occupational and job</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>2.96 2.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>skills</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work habits and attitude (trying hard,</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.79 3.49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enthusiasm, punctuality)</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People skills (teamwork, appearance,</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>5.16 5.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>getting along with others)</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership abil.(organize, teach &amp;</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>motivate others/solve problems)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading, writing, math and reasoning ability</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5.65 3.83</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1) The 500,000 members of the National Federation of Independent Business (NFIB) were stratified by employment and large firms over sampled. Salaried managers in charge of subunits of large publicly owned corporations are not eligible for membership in NFIB, so the sample does not contain data on employment outcomes at large multi-establishment firms. A four page questionnaire was mailed to approximately 11,000 firms, and after 3 follow up waves, 2599 responses were obtained. The survey focused on a single job - the job “for which... you hired the most people over the last two or three years.”

2) After a series of general questions about the character of the job and the worker qualities that were sought when filling that job, the manager was asked to select two individuals who had been hired for this job and answer all future questions specifically with reference to those two workers. The selection was made in response to the following question: "Please think of the last person hired for this job (job X) by your firm prior to August 1986 regardless of whether that person is still employed by your firm. Call this individual person A. The individual hired for job X immediately before person A is called person B. Do not include rehires of former employees.” Information of varying degrees of completeness was obtained on 1624 person A’s and 1403 person B’s.
other traits constant, workers thought to have ‘much better’ occupational skills were judged to be 10.7 percent more productive after about a year on the job.

The impacts of occupational skills on relative wage rates are even more striking. Occupational skills were the only ability that had large positive effects on relative wage rates. Workers thought to be ‘much better’ in occupational skills started with a 12 percent better wage and were making 14 percent extra after a year or so on the job.

Academic skills had no significant effects on wage rates. People skills also had no effects on wage rates. Leadership had modest positive effects on wage rates and initial productivity but not on productivity a year later. The two abilities with the largest impacts on productivity a year later - ex-post assessments of work habits and the ability to learn new occupational and job skills - had significant negative relationships with wage rates (Bishop 1995).

Correlations between job knowledge and job performance

A third way to assess the importance of occupational skills is to measure them directly and then examine their correlation with ratings of overall job performance. Meta-analyses of the hundreds of empirical validity studies have found that content valid paper and pencil job knowledge tests are good predictors of job performance. Dunnette’s (1972) meta-analysis of 262 studies of occupational competency tests found that their average correlation with supervisory ratings was .51, higher than any other predictor including tests of generic reading and mathematics skills. Vineberg and Joyner’s (1982) meta-analysis of studies done in the military came to similar conclusions. Tests assessing job knowledge are also considerably better predictors of ratings of overall job performance than measures of the personality constructs associated with good work habits (Leatta Hough 1988).

When paper and pencil tests of occupational knowledge appropriate for the job compete with reading and mathematics tests to predict supervisor ratings of job performance, the job knowledge tests carry all of the explanatory power; the reading and mathematics tests none. When judged performance on a sample of critical job tasks is the measure of job performance, the beta coefficient on the job knowledge test is 2 to 4 times larger than the beta coefficient on a basic skills composite (Hunter, 1983).

To summarize, in almost all jobs productivity derives directly from social abilities (such as good work habits and people skills) that are generic and cognitive skills that are specific to the job, occupation or industry: not from reading, writing and mathematics skills.

“(...) in almost all jobs productivity derives directly from social abilities (such as good work habits and people skills) that are generic and cognitive skills that are specific to the job, occupation or industry: not from reading, writing and mathematics skills.”

Skill obsolescence and the demand for training

Skills are becoming obsolescent more rapidly than in the past. But those who ar-
gue that this implies a reduced need for occupation specific skill development have it exactly backwards. Obsolescent occupational skills must be replaced by new occupational skills. If old skills become obsolete more rapidly, then new skills must be learned more frequently. This implies a greater overall need for occupational training, not a reduced need.

Skill obsolescence is greatest in fast changing fields close to the frontier of knowledge such as computers. It is in precisely these fields where the payoff to skill development is the greatest. People who use a computer at work are paid 10 percent more per hour than those who do not, even when industry and occupation are held constant. Alan Kruger’s (1993) survey of temporary help agencies firms found that most provide free training in word processing to people seeking temporary clerical jobs through the agency. He concluded that, “The fact that temporary help agencies find it profitable to provide computer training to the workers they place suggests there is a substantial return to computer skills (1993, p.47).”

While high rates of obsolescence mean the payoff period is short, they also mean that the supply of workers with the new skills is small because previous generations of trainees did not learn them. Thus graduates of training programs which impart the latest skills have something which is in short supply and which will therefore be well rewarded. The labor market responds to high rates of skill obsolescence by paying a higher premium for the skill.

**Job turnover and incentives to provide training**

Has the need for expanded recurrent training been fully met by employers? Probably not. High rates of job turnover are a major disincentive for employers considering training investments. The job turnover of American workers has increased over the last 25 years, making it more costly for firms to provide training. The proportion of the work force with fewer than 25 months of tenure at their company rose from 28 percent in 1968 to 40 percent in 1978 and has remained high since. Average tenure of male workers fell 5 percent between 1963 and 1981 (holding age composition constant) and then fell another 8 percent between 1983 and 1987 (Bishop 1995).

The Economist cites the high rates of job turnover as justification for scaling back school based occupational training. Here again they have it exactly backwards. The social returns to occupational training are influenced by occupational turnover, not job turnover. Occupational mobility rates in the United States have moved in the opposite direction from job mobility. Occupational mobility fell by 13 to 20 percent between 1978 and 1987 (Markey and Parks 1989) and this has raised the social returns to occupational skill development. Since the rise in job turnover rates has reduced employer willingness to finance training, the need for school based occupational training has never been greater.

**Should schools stop offering training in occupation specific skills?**

A good case can be made that American workers would be better off if employers took over from schools a greater share of the responsibility for providing occupational training. When employers provide training, trainee time costs tend to be minimal and productivity increases tend to be large and immediate. There is a high probability that the trainee will use the training in her job and be rewarded for doing so. Incentives to keep costs (including trainee time costs) down, to select effective trainers and training strategies and to learn the new material are strong and well aligned.

Most of the costs of employer sponsored training are paid by employers; not by employees in the form of lower wages during training (Bishop 1994). Nevertheless, trainees receive substantial wage increases after such training. This training is a super deal for the worker. The sum of the benefits of training accruing to employers, employees and others in society (eg. the social benefits) are quite large compared to social costs (Bishop 1995).
“Since costs are high and turnover substantial, most American employers pursue a ‘just-in-time’ training strategy where training is only in the skills needed in the current job.”

The problem with employer training is there is too little of it. The major beneficiary of training – the worker – is often poorly informed about costs and benefits and lacks the resources and access to capital markets necessary to pay for it. Employers pay most of the costs of the training provided at work places; but many of the benefits accrue to others - the worker and future employers of the worker (Bishop 1994). Because trainees are generally paid while receiving training and trainers frequently interact with trainees one-on-one, hourly costs are very high. High costs also result from most employers being too small to achieve economies of scale and specialization in providing training. Finally, public subsidies are generally not available when occupational training is provided by an employer.

Since the hourly costs of providing training in occupational skills are very high for employers, they quite naturally seek to have others – schools or other employers - do it for them. They prefer to hire already trained and experienced workers. When such workers are unavailable, they select relatives and family friends for trainee positions to reduce turnover and fulfill family obligations. This, of course, means that young people who are not part of social networks that include small business owners and managers are unable to get their foot in the door. Since costs are high and turnover substantial, most American employers pursue a “just-in-time” training strategy where training is only in the skills needed in the current job. Training is undertaken only when it is expected to quickly yield very high returns.

When making training investment decisions, employers are comparing the costs they incur to the increase in productivity (net of resulting wage increases) of the workers expected to remain at the firm. Benefits received by other employers or the worker will have zero weight in their calculation. The result inevitably is underinvestment (from society’s point of view) in employer training that develops general skills.

If school-based training were eliminated: what would happen?

If schools were to withdraw from the occupational training market, employers would become the sole provider of occupation specific training. Since separation rates are high for most American companies, employers would not be willing to take over this task without some inducement. Government could offer employers training subsidies, but such a scheme would be difficult to administer and would probably cost more than the current school-based occupational training system. In the absence of massive subsidies of employer training, shortages of skilled labor would develop and wage premiums for occupational skills formerly learned in school would rise. Lacking immediately useful skills, school leavers would find it more difficult to get work and have to accept lower wage rates. Some employers would substitute less skilled workers for the now more expensive skilled workers and let the quality of the service they provide deteriorate. Others would find ways to substitute machines for people or arrange for workers located in other countries to do it (e.g. many American companies now have software writing subsidiaries in Bulgaria, Russia and India). Eventually, the scarcity of skilled workers would become so severe and the wage differential between unskilled and skilled workers so large, that employers would find it has now become profitable to provide occupational skills training. In the new equilibrium, however, the society would have fewer skilled workers, a lower standard of living and a more unequal distribution of earnings.

Summary: The Economist made its case for general rather than occupation specific education on a priori grounds. The a priori argument is unconvincing, however. In societies with high rates of job turnover such as the United States, employers cannot be expected to pick up the entire burden of teaching occupational skills. Schools and colleges need to be a part of the occupational training picture.

But, mounting effective occupational training programs is not an easy task. The rapid obsolescence of occupational skills makes it more difficult to keep curricula, equipment and teaching staff up to date. Graduates of vocational programs are often unable (or choose not) to get jobs in the occupation for which they prepared. This is apparently the price one pays for allowing students to select the occupa-
tion for which they will prepare, rather than having employers select who will receive training as occurs in apprenticeship systems. Is the price paid too high? How successful are American vocational technical education programs in preparing young people for skilled work? In particular, how well do they serve at-risk youth?

How effective are American vocational-technical schools/colleges?

What has research taught us about the effectiveness of vocational education in the United States? This summary of that research is organized around 8 questions. The questions and corresponding findings are listed below:

a) Does high school vocational education lower dropout rates of at-risk youth?

YES. Kulik’s (1994) review of the literature concludes that the option of participating in vocational education lowers drop out rates.

b) How large are the economic benefits of postsecondary vocational education?

In 1992, 25 to 34 year-old full-time full-year workers with two-year associates degrees earned 21 to 28 percent more than high school graduates. Those with some college but no degree earned 14 to 15 percent more than high school graduates (U.S. Bureau of the Census 1993, Table 30). Percentage impacts were generally larger for blacks and females than for white males. Seventy percent of associates degrees and 98 percent of other non-baccalaureate diplomas are awarded in vocational lines of study (NCES 1993 p. 245). Workers who report that training from a two year college helped them qualify for their current job earned 13 percent more in 1991 than other workers with the same amount of schooling, tenure and potential work experience (Bowers and Swaim 1992).

c) How large are the benefits of government sponsored vocational training programs targeted on high school dropouts and other economically disadvantaged youth?

Solid evidence on the impact of government training programs on dropouts under the age of 22 comes from studies with strong randomized designs. During the 2.5 year follow up period, young men with arrest records prior to entering JTPA training earned $6800 less than arrestees who were randomly selected not to receive JTPA training. Subsidized on-the-job training lowered the earnings of those without an arrest record by $578 for women and $3012 for men. The only positive finding for JTPA youth was a 9 percent increase in the earnings of women receiving classroom training. The stigmatizing character of the programs may be one of the reasons for their failure. While JTPA training fails to help young people, adults benefit substantially. For adults payback periods were generally less than two years. The second-chance government training programs that work the best are the ones that focus on teaching occupation specific skills (integrating any basic skills teaching with the occupational training) and which are well connected to the labor market.

d) How large are the economic benefits of secondary vocational education?

Graduates of vocational training programs in secondary schools are not as well paid as those who have completed post-secondary diplomas and associates degrees. Nevertheless, they earn substantially more than other high school graduates who do not go to college. Altonji (1988) found that four trade and technical courses substituted for a mix of academic courses raised wage rates by 5 to 10 percent depending on specification. Kang and Bishop (1989) found that in 1981, one year after graduation, males who completed four trade and technical courses earned 21 to 35 percent more than those who took academic courses only. Young women with four credits of business and office courses earned 40 percent extra. The benefits of high school vocational education diminish with time. Hispanics receive larger benefits form the vocational education they receive than Blacks and non-Hispanic whites (Campbell et al. 1986). The fact that high school vocational

Note from the editors
NCES: National Center for Education Statistics
JTPA: Job Training Partnership Act (1982)
Education is successful with an age group that second chance programs are unable to help suggests that priority needs to be given to keeping educationally disadvantaged youth in school where they can benefit from mainstream vocational training programs.

e) Do the benefits of getting a vocational education depend on getting a training related job?

YES. Both of the studies (Campbell, et al. 1986; Rumberger and Daymont 1982) that have examined this issue found that economic benefits were zero if a training-related job was not obtained. Effects were particularly positive for those who enter the field they trained for and stay in that field. Campbell et al (1987) found that graduates of high school vocational programs who spend 100 percent of their time after high school in the field for which they trained earned 31 percent more than those who never had a training related job. Training programs for sales clerk jobs were the exception. Graduates of distributive education programs earned less if they obtained training-related sales jobs. Much of the benefit of vocational education comes from the access it confers to higher wage occupations. This suggests that school based vocational education programs should avoid training young people for low-wage, low-skill jobs even when high training-related placement rates can be guaranteed.

f) To what extent are occupationally specific skills learned in school being used in the labor market?

Forty-three percent of the employed graduates who completed two or more vocational courses in a specific field had jobs at the time they were interviewed in 1985 that matched his/her field of training (Campbell et al., 1987). Using a similar procedure of matching training fields against jobs, Mangum and Ball (1986) found post-secondary institutions do only slightly better. The proportion of male (female) graduates who had at least one job in a related field was 52 (61) percent for vocational-technical institutes, 22 (55) percent for proprietary business colleges, (59) percent for nursing schools, and 47 percent for military trainees who completed their tour of duty. Employer sponsored training had higher rates of utilization: 85 (82) percent for company training and 71 percent for apprenticeship. German apprenticeship training is also more likely to lead to relevant jobs. Six months after completing their training, 68 percent of those with civilian jobs were employed in the occupation for which they were trained (much more narrowly defined) (Federal Institute for Vocational Training, 1986). These results suggest that one way to increase training related placement rates is to have employers cooperate with schools in the delivery of training. Other ways to increase the proportion who work in the occupation for which they train is to improve career guidance, offer training in expanding occupations and upgrade the quality and relevance of the training.

g) Does studying occupationally specific skills in school lower achievement in the academic arena?

At the end of high school the gap between vocational and academic students is about one standard deviation or about 3.5 grade level equivalents. Much of this gap, however, preexisted the student’s entry into vocational education (Kulik 1994). Indeed students who have difficulty with academic subjects often seek out vocational courses precisely because they offer a different setting and different modes of learning. Kulik (1994) concluded that “80% of the difference in test scores of academic and vocational students at the end of high school is due to the difference in aptitude of the students who enter the programs (p. 47).” The keys determinant of learning is the rigor of the courses taken, not the total number of academic courses or the total number of hours spent in a school building during a year. Thus, vocational students learn less mathematics and science than many academic students primarily because they take less demanding academic courses, not because they take fewer academic courses.

h) How many occupationally specific courses should high school students not planning to attend a four-year college take?

Vocational education in the United States is modular. In high schools the basic
A modular unit is typically a one year course containing about 150 hours of classroom or shop time. Students need not complete a full program of four or more vocational courses to benefit from the occupation specific education. Among graduates not attending college, those who took just two vocational courses in upper secondary school earned 36 percent more in the year following graduation than those who took no such courses. Those who took 4 vocational courses earned 16 percent more than those who took 2 courses and those who took 6 or more vocational courses earned 6 percent more than those who took 4 such courses (Kang and Bishop 1989). These results suggest that (a) just about every student without definite plans to attend college full time should take at least 2 (4 appears to be best) vocational courses before graduating and (b) that vocational students should be counseled against taking an excessive number of vocational courses in high school. For occupations which require more than 600 hours of classroom/shop time to attain desired levels of proficiency, tech-prep programs integrating high school instruction into a post secondary program will generally be necessary.

**Summary**

Knowledge is exploding and new skills emerge every day. We have become completely dependent on the expertise of others. Because of this dependence, we are willing to pay good wages to people who have skills and expertise that we lack. Rewards for specific skills are determined by the law of supply and demand. Abundant skills tend to be poorly rewarded. Scarce skills tend to be well rewarded. New skills in growing demand receive the highest compensation.

Most of one’s educational career is spent learning generic skills such as reading, writing and arithmetic that are in abundant supply. Success in developing these skills does not, however, make one a highly competent worker or ensure a well paid job. As Emerson tells us: *The things taught in colleges and schools are not an education, but a means of education*. These generic skills are tools for developing the scarcer skills and expertise that determine productivity in particular jobs and which are, therefore, well rewarded by the labor market. **It is unwise to devote one’s entire education to learning things that everyone else already knows. One must select a vocation for which one has talent and for which there is market demand and then pursue expertise and excellence within this niche. Expertise and excellence are impossible without specialization.**

Since individuals cannot achieve excellence without specialization, an education system that does not accommodate and indeed encourage specialization becomes a barrier to real excellence. People have diverse interests, diverse talents and diverse learning styles. The labor market is similarly diverse in the skills and talents that are sought. A “one size fits all” upper secondary education is bound to fail the majority of students.

Occupational knowledge is cumulative and hierarchical in much the same way that mathematics and science is cumulative and hierarchical. Everyone must start at the bottom of the ladder of occupational knowledge and work their way up. The spread of information technology and of high performance work systems is forcing workers to learn new skills, but the new skills are generally additions to, not replacements for, old skills. While learning a new skill is easier when the worker has good basic skills, a foundation of job knowledge and occupational skills is more essential. At some point every individual must start building his/her foundation of occupational skills. For the great majority of youth who do not have an uncle willing to take them on as an apprentice for a well paid occupation, the foundation building should begin at least two years before the individual plans to leave school.

At-risk students who dislike and do poorly in academic classes should not be forced or advised to load their schedule up with academic classes during their final years in high school. Since they are unlikely to pursue a bachelors degree and are at risk of dropping out of school before graduating, at-risk students should be advised to start building their foundation of occupational skills and knowledge while they are still in school.

*A 'one size fits all' upper secondary education is bound to fail the majority of students.*
This short paper summarizes research that received support from many sources. Included in the list are grants to Cornell’s Program on Youth and Work from the Pew Charitable Trust, grants to the Center on the Educational Quality of the Workforce, agreement number R117008011-91, as administered by the Office of Educational Research and Improvement, U.S. Department of Education, grants to the National Center for Research in Vocational Education at Ohio State University from the U.S. Department of Education, grants from Cornell’s Center for Advanced Human Resource Studies and by a grant to Cornell from National Association of State Directors of Vocational Technical Education Consortium. The findings and opinions expressed in this report do not reflect the position or policies of the Office of Educational Research and Improvement or the U.S. Department of Education. This paper has not undergone formal review or approval of the faculty of the ILR school. It is intended to make results of research, conferences, and projects available to others interested in human resource management in preliminary form to encourage discussion and suggestions.

References


Campbell, Paul B; Basinger, Karen S; Dauner, Mary Beth; and Parks, Marie A. (1986) "Outcomes of Vocational Education for Women, Minorities, the Handicapped, and the Poor." Columbus: The National Center for Research in Vocational Education, The Ohio State University.


The Council of Europe’s “Permanent Education” project

In the period 1967 - 1979, the following two concepts went through a radical process of transformation:

1. The concept of the education system in terms of its objectives, its integration into social realities, its structures, its methods and the distribution of the role of social players within this system.

2. The objectives and methods of European cooperation relating to educational policies.

A priori, these two fields - the elaboration of new guidelines for educational policies and the conditions of European cooperation - may seem far removed, requiring distinct analysis as two independent fields of reflection or areas whose points of similarity are merely accidental.

This is far from true since it is in fact a question of subtle dialectics; the nature of the challenges to which the Permanent Education concept attempted to offer a response concerned a method of elaborating guidelines which called for a wider approach, an opening up of frameworks of thought and an analysis of the main trends in European society (societies). This approach implied recourse to a location, an institutional framework which, without denying the importance of the socio-political realities and legitimacies of European states, permitted the analysis of their problems from a wider perspective.

The development of the framework and objectives of European educational cooperation

The purport of the Permanent Education project cannot be understood without some reference to the development of educational cooperation in Europe since the Second World War.

In 1970, the Council of Europe published a collection of 15 studies entitled “Permanent Education” as the result of a series of reflections initiated in 1967 within the framework of the Council for Cultural Cooperation. A document entitled “Contribution to the development of a new educational policy” containing the three main texts drawn up within the framework of the “Permanent Education” project was published in 1981. This project, implemented by a steering group chaired by Bertrand Schwartz from 1972 to 1979, was formally ended with a summary symposium, held in Sienna in June 1979.

Since then, a series of projects - principally in the field of adult education - have sought to translate the principles and foundations of the Permanent Education concept into educational strategies adapted to the social, economic and cultural development of the signatory states of the European Cultural Convention. An excellent and detailed study of this overall approach can be found in the 1994 publication: “Adult education, at the Council of Europe - challenging the future (1960-1993)”, edited by Gérald Bogard (Council of Europe Publications, 1994, Strasbourg).

It should first of all be recalled that the Council of Europe was set up in 1949 in the historical context of the aftermath of the war. The Congress of Europe in The Hague of 1948 laid down two fundamental objectives which were an expression of the concerns not only of the attending governments, but also the majority of the political, social, cultural and economic players whose presence was informal, yet politically significant.

The first step was to create an area or framework for negotiation and pacific cooperation between the reconciled states of Europe.

However it was not enough for would-be members of the new organization to be European; a further objective was to promote the memory, defence and development of the fundamental values of democracy, the principle of the state based on the rule of law and human rights. The 1930s and World War II had

1) Permanent Education, Council of Europe, Strasbourg, 1970
2) Contribution to the development of a new educational policy, Council of Europe, Strasbourg, 1981
"The "Permanent Education" project was then set up within a new context of rapid development - the Golden 60s."

"The events of 1968 - albeit in extremely varied form from country to country - expressed very deep imbalances between educational systems and a changing social demand, without its content being precisely established (...)

It was the combination of these two objectives which gave the Council of Europe its specific historic and political character in the framework of European cooperation alongside the other institutions created since (or just before, e.g. the OECD).

It is therefore no coincidence that education and culture in general have in one way or another been included in the work programme of the Council of Europe since the early 1950s. The European Cultural Convention, signed in December 1954, remains, forty years on, the legal basis of the organization’s action in this field.

The objectives and methods of educational cooperation have significantly adapted to the development of European society and its priorities over the years.

The 1950s were above all dominated by activities related to the teaching of history and more specifically schoolbooks to combat stereotypes, prejudices and mutual ignorance; it is interesting to note that these activities have been relaunched on a large scale since the accession of central and eastern European countries from 1989 onwards.

In the early 1960s, these activities were extended to include the development of reciprocal information programmes on the traditions, specific characteristics and structures of national education systems.

This type of cooperation - involving both information and comparisons - reflected in the publication of descriptive monographs, probably corresponds to a sociological reality: the relative functional equilibrium between social demand and the methods, structures and objectives of educational systems gradually set up since the more or less recent emergence of nation states.

The "Permanent Education" project was then set up within a new context of rapid development - the Golden 60s.

For those who recall the prospective studies and hypotheses on industrial society of the late 1960s, it will be easy to understand that the development of the main trends characterizing all western European societies during this period had a significant impact on educational policies which widened, rather than denied, the purely national bases of reflections on educational policies.

In this context, a form of educational cooperation based on mere reciprocal information gave way to a new concept of cooperation.

What could its basis be?

The events of 1968 - albeit in extremely varied form from country to country - expressed very deep imbalances between educational systems and a changing social demand, without its content being precisely established - unpredictability moreover being the most commonly recognized characteristic at the time.

How could profound educational reform be designed with the need, as unanimously admitted after 1968, that it should not be a mere adaption of the existing system in a changing social context?

As long as the development of social demand seemed to lead towards obscurely circumscribed terra incognita, reforms therefore had to be envisaged without full knowledge of what the medium- and long-term objectives would be.

Many designers, decision-makers and educational policy researchers were therefore greatly tempted to find sources of information for the reforms to be accomplished "elsewhere" than merely within the frame of reference of national traditions.

Thus they sought to learn from other historical experiences, other concepts of educational policy and the results of experiments conducted elsewhere to stimulate the imagination of all those involved in reforming each specific educational system.

It was against this background that the concept, principles and philosophy of Permanent Education were shaped - and for the first time within a European organization:
by a very widely-based European group of national experts collaborating on an ongoing basis over a period of ten years;

- on the basis of the field analysis of several dozen pilot projects implemented not only in the field of adult education, but in all the sectors of the education system;

- as general guidelines opposed to hard and fast rules. It was not a question of designing supranational reform, but of pooling and if possible consistently processing the achievements, experiments, questions and conclusions of the various efforts.

This process of design was certainly not a linear operation devoid of conflict or tension. The very need for concept design was even called into question by those in favour of a purely empirical approach.

Nevertheless, the Permanent Education concept, as it stands in the final documents, in particular in the Sienna programme which emerged from the final symposium, is clearly a product of intergovernmental European cooperation and, to our knowledge, the first example of such an effort.

Evidently, given certain limits to its coherence, the degree of vagueness of some of its definitions and, more importantly, the fact that it was not followed up to the same extent at the various national levels, this concept is characterized by its production conditions and the diversity of the frames of reference and the value systems of its designers.

The Permanent Education concept as a framework for the reform of educational systems

Consideration of the final summary text issued by the concluding Sienna symposium immediately shows that although the document reflects the search for a coherent implementation of a new educational policy, it is at the same time paradoxical.

It should be recalled that the Permanent Education project was originally - i.e. in the late 1960s - based on the long-term perspective of the optimistic assumption that the period of economic growth in Europe at the time would continue. Although the social and cultural consequences of this growth were profound, triggering imbalances and tensions, there seemed to be no doubt that these phenomena were part of a continuous process of development of the social fabric which would ultimately lead to a better situation and new balances, expressing a generalized "better-being" as the basis of the harmonious development of both collective and individual creative potentials.

When the word "break" is used, it concerns a past, values and practices inherited from tradition and not a conflictual disintegration of the global social system.

By the end of the project, in the late 1970s, it was already clear that the situation had changed considerably. The economic crisis had arrived, both in reality and in people’s minds. After repeated hopes of "light at the end of the tunnel", that economic growth would pick up at the same level as before and mop up the effects of the crisis, it was realized that the consequences of the economic crisis required analysis in structural as opposed to cyclical terms and that a solution had to be proposed.

This is the paradox of the Permanent Education concept: established within an optimistic and linear perspective, it gradually became a framework for actions in response to the advent of a situation of crisis, change, instability and questioning.

The conclusions of the project could then have been considered either as irrelevant - since based on a social utopia surpassed by events - or inconsistent.

Surprisingly, neither was the case; on the contrary, the proposals of the Sienna symposium - in 1979 - were strikingly topical.

These proposals which, in view of the unpredictable turn of events, could have torn the entire concept to pieces, are on the contrary marked by a continuity between the initial hypotheses - on the pur-
pose of the educational system and its capacity to participate in the development of a framework of fundamental values - and the recommendations stemming from the cooperation process which produced them.

Our hypothesis therefore is that despite the wish to derive the Permanent Education concept from the empirical reality of the 1960s, it is in fact the expression of a much wider socio-political and historic vision in which determinism plays a much more important role than a mere adaptation to the socio-economic developments of the time. From this point of view, it is of no decisive importance whether these factors are cyclical or structural.

As a frame of reference for educational policies, the content of the Permanent Education concept could be summarized as follows:

- Education is a continuous, lifelong process marking all stages of life.
- Education is a permanent process of development of knowledge, know-how and social skills.
- The acquisition of knowledge and skills is only really meaningful if linked to experience, achievements and practice.
- The educational process is a factor of development and the expression of a project, not merely limited to the reproduction of the past.
- The educational process is naturally a whole over time but it also encompasses the entirety of needs, roles and functions of an individual at a given moment of his/her history.
- Individual needs and collective necessities (social, cultural, economic) in the field of education must not be in opposition but, on the contrary, converge.

The educational policies resulting from this framework would thus be characterized by:

- a major degree of openness to the social, economic, political and cultural environment of the school with an anchor in the territory in question;
- a high degree of flexibility in their processes, structures and operational modes;
- the importance attached to structures of negotiation, analysis and evaluation;
- an ongoing process of concerted change.

By extension of our hypothesis, can it be stated that the Permanent Education concept is merely the product of pure theory, the expression of a generous and optimistic determinism whose roots go back to humanism and the philosophy of the Enlightenment?

Or, on the contrary, is the reproach sometimes made not true that it is the expression of a type of educational engineering, itself the product of the development of technocracy, principally concerned with tension and conflict management?

Judging from the fate of the Permanent Education concept since 1979, probably neither of these statements is true.

**From Sienna to 1995: The current relevance of the Permanent Education concept**

At the level of the history of cultural cooperation in educational matters, it can be observed that the development described above - reconciliation, recognition and reciprocal information, design and strategic elaboration - has continued since then by the increasingly significant presence in cooperation programmes of projects aiming at pooling the problems, reflections, achievements and experience of the various parties involved and, more recently, by the development of action programmes (focused above all on teacher training) and experts' missions. The convergences of which this development is the indicator nevertheless remain far removed from any regulatory process in a field in which national sovereignty is particularly sensitive.

From this angle, the “Permanent Education” project has marked a milestone by
providing methodological developments which were subsequently confirmed.

Numerous reforms implemented in the 1970s and 1980s can in fact be easily described on the basis of the project's fundamental principles.

Although there are few explicit references to the work of international organizations to be found in the numerous legislatory texts adopted at national level throughout these years - and the reasons for this are manifold and complex - the influence of the concepts and guidelines described above is relatively clear either in the texts defining the objectives and purposes of the reforms or in the inspiration of the authors of these reforms at national level.

Admittedly, in a context of crisis and profound social and political change, these results do not lend themselves to rigorous evaluation. For some, Permanent Education managed to wear so well on account of its deep-seated optimism. The orientations it advocated nevertheless remain surprisingly relevant in the modern context and, on due reflection, could it not be said that they are still seem as fresh as a daisy?

The opinions expressed in this work are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the official policy of the Council for Cultural Co-operation and the Council of Europe.

“Education for Democratic Citizenship”:
Short presentation of 4 workshops carried out by the Council of Europe on this issue.

The last long term Project of the Council of Europe in the field of Adult Education, “Adult Education and Social Change”, came to an end with a final conference in 1993. This conference produced a number of recommendations for the Council of Europe, one of which exhorted the Organisation to focus future activities on “the fundamental role of adult education in the promotion of democratic citizenship and the strengthening of democratic values”.

The recommendation was a logical conclusion to the analysis, argument and interrogative work of the Project “Adult Education and Social Change” which had sought definition of adult education in the context of the new reality of a global economy. But as a point of departure for work on citizenship, the “social change” Project was inchoate. The profound ramifications of economic transformation, at the level of the legal and political relations of civil society still had to be addressed. Exploration of the new social or cultural forms, that constitute the human dimension of citizenship in the era of a global economy, was considered the necessary next step as preparation for a new activity.

With the decision that the initial approach should be tentative, a two year period, 1994/1995, has been given over to critical reflection. To this end, under the general title, “Education for Democratic Citizenship”, a number of issues, considered key to the notion of citizenship and adult education, are being explored through five, three-day workshops. The first four workshops have already been carried out on the themes of: work/employment; community; development; and multicultural society. Space does not permit me to elaborate all the arguments developed. Instead, I will present the initial concerns and objectives of each workshop and, on the basis of the discussions, some

The Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe’s member states asked the Council of Europe “to begin working on drafting a protocol complementing the European Convention on Human Rights in the cultural field by provisions guaranteeing individual rights, in particular for persons belonging to national minorities”.

Madalen Teeple
Administrator, responsible for the Adult Education Work Programme, at the Council of Europe, School and out of School Education Section

Since the Vienna Summit in 1993, the Council of Europe has had a mandate to consider, and develop protection for specific cultural rights.* The Directorate of Education, Culture and Sport, sensitive to the extremely delicate nature of the exercise that developing rights to culture involves, has explored the issue through many of its cultural projects. The Direction has been committed to elaborating a moral discourse which inherently links cultural rights to democratic culture. Rights which provide for personal autonomy, freedom to participate etc. are considered indivisible from the principles which are the foundation of liberal democracy. The watershed project “Adult Education and Social Change” brought the work in adult education within the ambit of this moral discourse, now felt to be the battleground for democracy itself.

*The Heads of State and Government of the Council of Europe’s member states asked the Council of Europe “to begin working on drafting a protocol complementing the European Convention on Human Rights in the cultural field by provisions guaranteeing individual rights, in particular for persons belonging to national minorities”.
conclusions which could be drawn regarding the focus of future work.

**Workshop 1 (Strasbourg, 21.-23.9.94) Employment, Work and Citizenship: moving towards new key qualifications through general adult education and vocational training for adults?**

Economic transformation has brought about a change in productive relations which have had a direct effect on a number of forms of participation commonly associated with liberal democracy. In the past, participation through employment and wage earning were key areas through which identification with the political community was established. Today, the labour intensive production of the post war period has been replaced by new and automated processes in which computer applications and robots progressively substitute manual labour. It is a factor which contributes to a condition of serious structural unemployment. The lack of a participatory role in the creation of value, undermines identity with the value creating community. Alternative loyalties are being established across a spectrum of sometimes aggressively exclusive communities.

This workshop considered, from a number of angles, the nature of the new technologies, and the changed work and political relations which they imply. It considered the role that adult education will play in defining individual identity and how it is not essentially related to paid employment. At the same time, it was recognised that an issue which must be more fully addressed is the degree to which the control and development of the new technologies have the potential to lead to the permanent economic exclusion, which may result in cultural exclusion, of a significant percentage of citizens. While the right to employment has never been more than an ideal, the right to fully develop one's capacities has always been a guiding ethical principle of liberal democracy. Implicit in this principle is the right to work and to be engaged in the creation of cultural meaning.

**Workshop 2 (Strasbourg, 7.-9.11.94) Participation, democracy and development: are there new strategies for adult education?**

Liberal democracy assumes that the free market will be ultimately controlled by political decisions which dispose of power in an ethical way, that is, decisions which reflect a compromise between the individual and specific and the collective and general. However, with globalisation, the structures that provide for political participation at the level of the national state are becoming progressively obsolete. National governments may now deliberate on national issues with reference either to other jurisdictions, or competing extra-nationally based, national claims. At the level of substance the political discourse has been de-nationalised. This said, re-appropriation of the discourse or bringing relevance to its formulation at the jurisdictional level which now disposes of political meaning, is, now more than ever, a task of adult education.

The quest in this workshop was to ascertain how, both in its overall strategy and methods, adult education can both promote participation by all, and also develop the necessary partnerships between all the institutional and informal actors which now constitute the fabric of democratic life.

**Workshop 3 (Strasbourg, 29.11.-1.12.94) A new concept of development of, through and for the community in an evolving democracy?**

Distributive justice or the ethical/political basis for the allocation of certain goods/services, has always, in some form, had an association with the regime of private property. The increasing sophistication in the organization and interrelationship of communities had seen an increased political role for citizen participation in defining the goods of distributive justice, and in ensuring access to them.

Keynesian economic policies, which guided national economic organisation during the period of late industrialisation, made possible broad participation in the decision making process regarding distributive justice. However, the tripartite compromise between labour, capital and the state, which brought about investment in the project of social reform which came to be known as the welfare state, is defunct. Trade unions, which have remained largely national organisations, cannot claim relevance as bargaining partners in global capital enterprise, and the state machinery which once mediated these
interests at a national level, is considered to be a fetter on the free market.

The economic policy of the global economy reflects a different form of productive relation between capital and labour. The political and social representation of this relation will have its own form, its own specificity. Similarly, the nature of distributive justice and the forms of participation which are construed of as its goods, will have their own specificity. This workshop examined the question of whether the participation which is made possible by the new economic and social relations should find its definition in a far broader approach to development than that which formerly existed. It examined the possibility of the concept of development as a process; a process which engages the citizen in a political participation which is not simply defined by an economic relation. It examined adult education in relation to this process.

**Workshop 4 (Strasbourg, 12-14.12.94)**

**Cultural pluralism, minorities and migration: how to learn to live together in cultural diversity?**

The global economy is now reality. An internationalised property regime now challenges the structures of nationally organised property regimes. The new technologies assume a redefinition in the nature of the rights, and their corresponding regimes, which is coherent with this. Similarly, cultural pluralism is now a reality which challenges traditional relations between ethnic groups, nation, state, cultures. The social expression of this challenge is increasingly manifest in forms of violence directed against minority cultures or those which represent the multicultural reality. This seminar considered how adult education could offer the individual and the group the means to experience cultural diversity as a common enrichment, rather than as a cause of confrontation. Considerable attention was given to the role of the media and the need to ensure proper representation of the multicultural reality of European society.

**Conclusion**

The last of the exploratory activities, to be carried out in this period of reflection, will be a seminar on legislative and policy issues in the field of adult education. This seminar will explore the new relationship through which rights to adult education or training can, or may be realised, and the policies which inform or make accessible such rights. As with the first four workshops, the participants to this seminar will represent a broad range of political cultures, geographic regions and roles in the field of adult education.

The conclusions of all of the exploratory activities were considered at the time of a restricted intergovernmental meeting in December 1995. It is hoped that these conclusions will indicate general trends at work in Europe to-day, and also set out the general themes which could constitute the elements of a new project for 1996.

**References**


Bogard, G. Adult Education and Social Change: stages in a project. DECS/AE (93)29

Gelpi, E. Employment, Work and Citizenship. DECS/AE (95) 1

Gelpi, E. Partnership and Participation. DECS/AE (95) 2

Gelpi, E. A New Concept of Development of, by and for the Community in a Changing Democracy. DECS/AE (95) 3

Gelpi, E. Cultural Pluralism, Minorities and Migration: how to learn to live together in Cultural Diversity. DECS/AE (95)4

Gelpi, E. Synthesis Report. DECS/AE (95) 5

The opinions expressed in this work are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the official policy of the Council for Cultural Co-operation and the Council of Europe.
The market, standards and the community, or new education

Annie Vinokur
Lecturer at University Paris X, Nanterre,
Member of CERED - Centre d’Etudes et de Recherches sur le Développement, FORUM, ura, CNRS 1700

In his introduction to the work of the programme “Education for democratic citizenship”, Ettore Gelpi asks us to consider the education of adults for democracy and development as “learning resistance to the violence to which one is subjected or which are proposed”. However in the 1950s Hannah Arendt wrote: “Insofar as it is distinguished from the act of learning, it must be possible to assign an end to education...In politics, one always deals with those who are already educated. Anyone proposing to educate adults is in fact suggesting him/herself as a tutor...because one cannot educate adults...one claims to educate whereas in actual fact one merely wants to constrain without using force”.

Any determined project in the field of the education of adults for democracy and development must therefore take account of this contradiction and thereby first of all identify the dimensions of educational violence and constraint of our societies which must also be combated.

The hypothesis put forward in this article is as follows: in its current process of change, contemporary society itself also carries a tutorial project which is however indifferent to age and based on generalized procedural education.

“In modern society, focused on accumulation, one’s age is the age assigned by the changing needs of the job market.”

“(...) the supernumerary or obsolete worker falls back on the traditional sector which, moreover, ensures his/her reproduction at minimal cost.”

An end to “ages”

In traditional society (domestic and small-scale market production), focused on reproduction, one becomes an adult when one is ritually declared able to participate in the renewal of generations biologically, physically and culturally, i.e. when one has sufficiently assimilated the knowledge and rules which guarantee the survival and perpetuity of one’s group.

In modern society, focused on accumulation, one’s age is the age assigned by the changing needs of the job market. If child labour is valued, one may be too old at the age of 18; on the contrary, one may be retained in the childhood phase for an increasingly long period of time (endless “occupational transitions”), and become obsolete increasingly earlier (definitive unemployment and early retirement). The economy therefore holds a specific “lesson” which teaches individuals their “age” and “value” at any time. This “education” is just as “permanent” as learning processes.

One aspect of this negation of “ages”, both in societies in which the exploitation of child labour is developed and in those in which the working lives of both genders is concentrated (in time and intensity) on the fifteen or twenty years during which adults must also carry out their biological reproduction and the socialization of their young, is the negation of the needs of reproduction.

Reproduction, an obstacle to accumulation

As long as the accumulation process remains enclosed within traditional society, events take their course as if its human (and its natural) resources were abundant, almost free (the only cost being their extraction and processing) and reversible: the supernumerary or obsolete worker falls back on the traditional sector which, moreover, ensures his/her reproduction at minimal cost. However if human resources produced and educated in the traditional sector are to present themselves ready for use at the factory door with their physical and nervous resistance and moral values, they must be incited/forced to do so, i.e. the destruction of the traditional sector (the impossibility of their reproduction) must oblige them to do so. The cost of extraction of human resources from the traditional sector is therefore both very low in the short term, but potentially very high in the long term. The exploitation of golden eggs kills the hen which laid them. It is the destruction of this sector which generates “the disruptions in our relationship with nature, not only external nature, the ecological systems of our environment, but also the internal, biophysical and psychic nature of humankind... The problems encountered today regularly emerge when these resources, regarded as “free for all” in the

1) Note from the editors: The following is a paper presented to Workshop III: “A new concept of development of, through and for the community in an evolving democracy?”, organized by the Council of Europe (see previous article by Madalen Teeple).
The problems encountered today regularly emerge when these resources, regarded as "free for all" in the post-war period, become scarce (...)

What seems to be emerging (... is a generalized form of education based on procedure rather than content and supported by two institutional pillars: the market, insofar as this is possible, and the community in those cases in which market penetration is not possible.

Market education

The market is a reward/penalty system with two advantages:

- it is "neutral", anonymous and uses the constraint of incentive rather than force;
- it has the appearances of democracy (albeit with a franchise based on property), insofar as demand may be presented as a "vote" expressing individual preferences.

Thus the collapse of "real socialisms" and the non-development of the less advanced countries may appear to be the result of a "democratic deficit", i.e. as the failure of authoritarian, centralized and bureaucratic forms of education, of accumulation. Structural adjustment programmes are thus initially presented as indirect forms of education of rationality by the introduction or reintroduction of procedural conditions of competition: elimination of protectionist measures and over-valued exchange rates, the opening up to the world market, the elimination of subsidies and controlled prices to reestablish real prices and wages, less state influence state and privatizations... These measures are aimed at promoting the production sector to the detriment of protected sectors, restoring external competitiveness, restructuring and diversifying supply, relaunching savings and investment... and inciting individuals to manage their human and physical resources as a function of the changing price signals.

However there are places at which social conditions of accumulation are reproduced where the market cannot operate directly, or alone, as an incentive system. Whenever possible, a "quasi-mercantile" pedagogy of rationality is set up by the establishment of rules and standards in addition or as a substitute to the market. Examples:

In the firm

The firm is, by definition, "a system within which resources management depends on an entrepreneur, i.e. one or several persons taking the place of the price mechanism in the management of resources in a competitive system" (Coase, 1937, p. 339). However the "despotism" of employers and hierarchical control will tend to meet the resistance of workers led to "opportunism", the more information from the entrepreneur in post-tayloristic forms of labour organization is limited. In the firm "one cannot expect perfectly effective control from individualized market competition" (Alchian-Demsetz, p. 781). A substantial part of human resources management therefore consists of substituting the
“There nevertheless remain sectors of human reproduction in society within which neither the market nor its substitutes can fulfill their educational function: the family, solidarity, social relations.”

“authority relationship” by the “democratic alternative” of the “principal/agent-type” incentive systems aimed at boosting productivity by reducing the “moral hazard” and “malingering” behaviour.

At school

To rechannel the funding of post-compulsory education to households, as advocated by the principal international organizations, is to incite individuals to behave as rational managers of their human capital as a function of market signals and therefore: (a) reduce the “social waste” of “school inflation”, (b) introduce competition to the production of educational services, (c) stimulate and direct effort as a function of the changing needs of the economy, i.e. reduce the independence of the educational system from the system of production.

However, on the one hand, smooth market operation implies a product quality information system and, on the other, the market cannot regulate the production of knowledge itself, which implies a relationship of authority. This therefore entails the introduction of a system of complementary standards:

- The international standardization of tests and diplomas under way must allow the homogenization of the job market at global level, facilitating rapid delocations.

- In societies in which families have lost the cultural values not transmitted by school, school-based assessment replaces (and prefigures) market prices to teach students to permanently wait for an external indication of their “value”.

- The downstream steering of evaluation standards (a) eliminates “useless” knowledge: the content of knowledge is defined by the rules of its control, (b) imposes this content on teachers without recourse to direct constraint.

- The standardization of the product of education (a) promotes taylorization and standardization, i.e. the “industrialization” of its production (cf. e.g. the introduction of ISO 9000 standards in European training establishments), (b) contributes to a process of individualization conducive to the penetration of information industries in the non-mercantile sector.

“Community” education

There nevertheless remain sectors of human reproduction in society within which neither the market nor its substitutes can fulfill their educational function: the family, solidarity, social relations...

The reproduction of humankind within the family implies a minimum of security. All the institutions of traditional societies are centred on the need to combat the fatal threats posed to this reproduction by material insecurity (climatic fluctuations in domestic production, market shares in small-scale market production). In the course of this century, the destruction of these institutions has in some countries historically led to the (slow and difficult) construction (via social struggles and negotiation) of capitalism’s only innovation in the field of reproduction: “employment”, defined as the combination of holding a job (working activity regulated by labour legislation) and a “wage”, a resource defined by a scale (a) including a contribution giving the right to benefits in proportion to the direct wage, (b) administered on the basis of social partnership according to the principle of a certain geographical area. Employment, which can liberate the individual from community links and give the worker access to the public sphere, is an extremely innovative construct, guaranteeing security independent of property and the introduction of an original social relationship at national level.

Today, against the backdrop of the globalization of the economy, we are witnessing the deconstruction of employment, a process commonly ideologized by the affirmation (criticizable in every respect) that the “welfare state” is “a luxury our societies can no longer afford”.

The polarization of incomes and the impoverishment and de-securitization of an increasing proportion of the population means that, in the words of Reich (with respect to the United States but this is generally applicable), “Americans are no longer in the same boat”. It can no longer be maintained that “what is good for General Motors is good for the United States” because General Motors no longer needs American workers to build or buy its cars. The maintenance and reproduction of dis-
"Today, against the backdrop of the globalization of the economy, we are witnessing the deconstruction of employment, a process commonly ideologized by the affirmation (...) that the "welfare state" is "a luxury our societies can no longer afford".

The problem therefore remains of guaranteeing social peace at minimal cost. In this perspective, certain institutions of traditional societies, with the advantage of guaranteeing both basic solidarity and moral order, are currently being revitalized. Etzioni’s “communitarianism”, with the objective “of channelling all the institutional forces so that people can be forced to do what is necessary” (D’Antonio,1994) sums up this process:

- Return to traditional family and moral values, thus recuperating the dimension of resistance to the modernity of “fundamentalisms” and indiscriminately mobilizing the fundamentalisms of all religions at global level.

- The application of the principle of "subsidiarity": “responsibility for any situation is first and foremost in the hands of those most closely affected. It is only if the individual does not manage to find a solution alone that it is up to the family to act. If the latter can do nothing, it is up to the local community to act. And it is only if the problem is too much for local community that it must turn towards the state” (Etzioni 1994). “Responsibilization” implies (a) the negation of “rights”, (b) solidarity of the poor among themselves and the rich among themselves, (c) the conditionality of recourse to national solidarity, i.e. “educational charity”: “social workers dealing with these groups tend to vindicate all the lifestyles they meet. They have to change their attitude and return to their role of societal agents, contributing their fundamental values to persons who would be out of reach without them. They must set themselves up as judges and unambiguously defend healthy and responsible lifestyles. Soft penalties are justified for all those who fail to meet the demands of society” (Etzioni, 1994).

- "Local" democratic participation, restricted to small units of reproduction: the family, the neighbourhood, school, the parish... i.e. at those points where democracy is most likely to reinforce moral order and repress deviance. It is not a question of democratic participation in decisions on production and employment objectives: the “market” is presented as an external constraint and when the power to decide on the life of individuals and communities agrees to be personified by an individual, this individual is inaccesible (cf. Michael Moore’s film “Roger and Me”).

The market and the community thus emerge as implicit and explicit forms of education at the service of the transfer of insecurity to families, i.e. the imposition of the short-term constraint of accumulation on the long-term scale of human and social reproduction.

The opinions expressed in this work are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the official policy of the Council for Cultural Cooperation and the Council of Europe.

References


A particular history is taken to illustrate the topic of “democracy and training”. The history in Italy of the relationship between trade unions and training after the 1968 protests by workers and students, focusing on the links between a review of economics and sociology *Inchiesta* edited in Bologna (published by Dedalo in Bari) and the trade unions of Bologna and Emilia Romagna over the last twenty-five years.

This article looks at the features of the union’s training policy when most use was being made of the 150 hours (the number of courses reached a peak in the mid-1970s) and the features of current union training policies in Emilia Romagna at a time when the use of the 150 hours is declining.

The interpretative models common to the review and the trade unions at the outset can be identified from the debate in *Inchiesta* (which had a circulation of 80,000 in the 1970s and was sold at newsstands) and the particular position of its editor who became officially responsible for the FLM’s education office in Bologna (and then in Emilia Romagna). During the 1970s, however, the limits of the interpretative model adopted by the unions were pinpointed by *Inchiesta*, although the unions were very reluctant to accept these limits.

Following the end of trade union unity in the early 1980s (ending my direct experience as FLM education officer) and in the intervening years, union policy has changed as regards the problems raised by both regional development and workers’ training. Still following the debate in *Inchiesta* (with a circulation of 5000 and sold only in bookshops in the 1980s and 1990s) it is interesting to examine the questions that are being raised (about trade unions and training in particular) and pinpoint those questions that are receiving the best answers from the unions.

Training policies for workers in the early 1970s: practices and interpretative models

In order to understand the training policies of the Italian unions in the 1970s, two aspects need to be borne in mind. In the first place, the 1968 protests by workers and students and the trade union achievements of the early 1970s were followed by a boom in union membership: membership of the Italian General Confederation of Labour CGIL alone increased from 2,461,000 in 1968 to 4,528,000 in 1978. In the 1970s, the Italian unions, in particular the FLM, were very attractive not only to university students but to university teachers as well. The 1968 protests by workers and students had a substantial impact on researchers in social and economic fields and paved the way for an organic alliance between trade unions and intellectuals.

My personal history illustrates this situation. As a teacher of sociology at the University of Bologna and editor of the review Inchiesta I began to work with the FLM in Bologna, initially on union research to protect workers’ health and then as coordinator of the 150 hours at the University of Bologna, working as director of the FLM’s education office from 1975 to 1983 (the education office closed down when trade union unity came to an end).

Action by the FLM in Emilia Romagna in the 1970s, in the area of the links between trade unions and training, took four main directions:

a) training schemes following the achievement of the 150 hours. The 150 hours were used to complete compulsory education (increasing in Emilia Romagna from 42 courses in 1973-74 to a peak of 202 courses in 1976-77 and then decreasing to 106 in 1980-81). Short courses held in parallel at the university followed the same trend (a peak in the mid-1970s and then a gradual reduction in subsequent years) and covered a variety of topics ranging from courses on economics and trade union history to courses for women workers and teachers focusing on the status of women at work and outside work.

b) action on the compulsory education system. In the 1970s a number of issues of the Bologna FLM’s journal Impegno Unitario looked at selection in compulsory education and the fact that compulsory education textbooks presented the rural and working world in a ridiculous way. These issues of the journal were disseminated and discussed with workers in heavy engineering factories both as parents of sons and daughters attending State schools and as people making use of the 150 hours to gain knowledge from a working class point of view.

c) measures to protect workers’ health with research and action in factories coordinated by works doctors using the consensual validation method. People working in a particular department had to pinpoint harmful physical and mental factors and draw up a consensual report which was then used by the union for company bargaining. The overall training strategies introduced in the various departments were designed not just to pass on knowledge but to create a climate of trust between workers in order to promote an awareness of the hardships of factory work; attempts were then made to overcome these hardships psychologically bearing in mind that people had to carry on working.

d) research and action coordinated by the Education Office both on the shopfloor and among white-collar workers to find out about information paths and flows of materials in order to pinpoint different ways of organising the factory and pave the way for production conferences and factory disputes.

In the early 1970s, trade union action and the research conducted on behalf of the union by university staff was based on a common interpretative model of conflict and social classes which ran counter to the technocratic-functionalist model.

“Under the technocratic-functionalist model social change is shaped by technological innovation which (changes) the content and organisation of the various occupations (...).”
“Under the model of conflict and social classes social change is shaped by the struggle entailed in the conflicts between the various social classes in a situation where the dominant class is always attempting to reproduce its power base.”

The interpretative model that considered large enterprise to be the only protagonist was therefore called into question.

“Under the model of conflict and social classes social change is shaped by the struggle entailed in the conflicts between the various social classes in a situation where the dominant class is always attempting to reproduce its power base.”

The interpretative model that considered large enterprise to be the only protagonist was therefore called into question.

Under the model of conflict and social classes social change is shaped by the struggle entailed in the conflicts between the various social classes in a situation where the dominant class is always attempting to reproduce its power base. Combatting inequality is the primary aim of this interpretative model just as defending the status quo is the aim of the technocratic model.

In Italy, the reference point for this model is a book written by a priest Lettera a una professoressa (Letter to a woman teacher) by Don Milani (1967) which highlights, using the official statistics, the fact that educational selection almost exclusively affects those from working class families and the fact that textbooks and teachers pay no heed to these problems and the actual situation of the working class.

As a trade union and working class achievement, the 150 hours were shaped by this interpretative model and curricula for the 150 hours therefore placed considerable importance on content and not just on the formal achievement of qualifications. Courses for the completion of compulsory education by workers were therefore organised on the basis of content by the unions and people who ran courses for them. Inchiesta, which worked closely with the unions to ensure the successful outcome of their plan for the 150 hours, published economic and sociological materials which were ideologically oriented from the point of view of the working class (and it is this close link that explains the review’s high circulation figure in the 1970s).

The limits of this interpretative model of conflict and social classes used by the trade unions began to emerge in the debate in Inchiesta in the 1970s and were only partly accepted by the trade unions of the Emilia Romagna region and even less by the national unions.

The first limit was that in Italy (and not just in Italy) the trade unions, when using the interpretative model of conflict and social classes, focused almost exclusively on major mass-producing enterprises and considered the Taylorist-Fordist type of labour organisation to be predominant. At the beginning of the 1970s in Italy, both the national and the regional unions (even those in regions without major enterprises) tended to see Taylorism-Fordism as the predominant organisational model of capitalist societies with the result that small enterprises were not considered to be very important: no more than a “decentralisation” of large enterprises.

Inchiesta documented, however, different types of regional development in Italy and paved the way for research that began to identify a different kind of industrial development, remote both from the development of the regions of northern Italy based on large-scale enterprises and the lack of development of the southern regions. The review thus helped to highlight the existence of a “third Italy” (which was the title of a book written in 1977 by Arnaldo Bagnasco) between these two areas in which subsystems of flexible small and medium-sized enterprises produced specialist machinery for industry in response to the demand from customers. The review discovered that regions such as Emilia Romagna had a range of small specialist enterprises whose owners had had experience of skilled manual work and had set up on their own. The interpretative model that considered large enterprise to be the only protagonist was therefore called into question. These reservations were accepted by the unions of the Emilia Romagna region but not by the national unions which continued to see large enterprise as the almost exclusive focus of trade union action.

These analyses of small enterprises organised in specialist subsystems, documented in Inchiesta, highlighted a second limit in respect of the interpretations used in the 1970s by the unions and many of their outside collaborators. Perceiving Taylorism-Fordism as the predominant organisational model made it necessary to see the link between industrial development and training policies in a particular way. If the starting point was a large mass-producing factory, the conclusion was that
industrial development was possible with a small number of specialists (engineers and highly skilled technical staff) who were felt to be perfectly able of coordinating large numbers of manual workers carrying out only manual tasks.

The advancement of people with diplomas and degrees was perceived in a negative way overall because it was considered that industrial development based on the large Taylorist-Fordist enterprise needed few such people. In the United States, books such as those by Ian Berg (1970) and R.B. Freeman (1976) with the emblematic titles Education and Jobs: The Great Training Robbery and The Over-educated American were thus published in the 1970s. Continuing to study to degree level was felt to be a fraud: young Americans were too educated.

This interpretative model was also popular in Italy where the percentage of young people attending the final years of upper secondary education was around 30% at the end of the 1960s and the attendance rates forecast in the document, well known at the time, Progetto '80 (edited by intellectuals close to the industrialists' associations) were around 50% for the 1980s. The point to be stressed is that this figure of 30% was already causing people to talk about long-term schooling and university for the masses; articles in reviews such as Inchiesta, representing the first analyses of educational sociology in Italy, viewed these figures and forecasts with great concern. Why were they viewed in this way?

The explanation was to be found in books such as that by Marzio Barbagli (1974) entitled Disoccupazione intellettuale e sistema scolastico in Italia (Intellectual unemployment and the education system in Italy). It was felt that the form that the Italian industrial system was taking (like most other industrialised societies) would inevitably lead to the unemployment of intellectuals. It was felt that the form that the Italian industrial system was taking (like most other industrialised societies) would inevitably lead to the unemployment of intellectuals.

This explains why, in the 1970s, the trade unions formulated training strategies aimed in particular at the completion of compulsory education or training strategies paving the way for trade union policy action on health protection or for enterprise and regional disputes. The worker profile taken as a basis was chiefly that of the worker with few skills linked to the Taylorist-Fordist model and much less attention was paid to the vocational training of workers.

Perception of this second limit was much slower to come about, even in Inchiesta, and is was only in the 1980s and 1990s that attitudes in the review and in the regional and national unions changed.

A third limit to be found very clearly in the 1970s was the fact that the unions focused almost exclusively on male workers. Even the basic book of those years, Lettera a un professoressa, is a book which feminist research nowadays rightly assesses as a book whose only protagonists, whether positive or negative, are male.

This limit began to be perceived in Inchiesta in the 1970s with the publication of research that specified the mechanisms of regional industrial development from the point of view of women’s work. The work of sociologists such as Laura Balbo, Renate Zahar, Maria Pia May, etc., pinpointed the role of women within the official economy and within the informal monetary and non-monetary economies. This provided a much more problematic and complex framework for the work of economists and sociologists on homeworking and women’s work not included in statistical surveys. This is evident from the titles of the special issues of Inchiesta 25 (1977), 28 (1977), 32 (1978 and 34 (1978) which dealt with the following topics: the status of women; family, work and welfare state capitalism; dual role and the women’s labour market; women, double work and discrimination.

The review, as we will see, included many feminist contributions which examined this issue in depth even though it was not or only very slightly accepted by the national and regional unions in the 1980s and 1990s, despite the presence within the unions of feminist trade unionists who managed to gain a foothold in the regional
secretariat (of the FLM in Emilia Romagna) and, in the 1980s and 1990s, even in the national secretariat of CGIL.

A fourth, very important, limit is the overall underestimation of the differences between people, starting from the differences between women and men, which the unions have not managed to address.

At the end of the 1970s, I was commissioned to carry out a study of the 150 hours in Emilia Romagna whose findings were interesting because they were unexpected. It was thought that people registered for such courses for one of two reasons: either they chose the 150 hours for individual reasons of a pragmatic type (career advancement, obtaining a better qualified job, etc.) or for collective reasons in order to obtain better political and union know-how as regards their work and to be able to exert more control over capitalist strategies in the workplace.

It was found, however, that people's decisions were not shaped by either of these alternatives. People registering for the 150 hours say that they have done so in order to be able to achieve individual cultural goals, i.e. goals not shaped by pragmatic individual choices or based on collective motivations. People join collective trade union action in order to find answers to their own individual needs and aspirations.

The findings of the studies carried out at the end of the 1970s in response to the demand from workers for flexible working hours pointed in the same direction. Any strategy on working hours that the union proposed to workers received very different answers. Individual projects are always very different.

The interpretative rigidity of the social class model that proposes collective solutions came up against the different identities and plans of the men and women making up the wide-ranging world of manual and white-collar work. At the end of the 1970s a question was therefore passed on to the trade unions of the 1980s and 1990s: is it possible to achieve a collective trade union strategy (for training and not just for training) that takes account and makes the most of individual differences (...).

At the end of the 1970s, I was commissioned to carry out a study of the 150 hours in Emilia Romagna whose findings were interesting because they were unexpected. It was thought that people registered for such courses for one of two reasons: either they chose the 150 hours for individual reasons of a pragmatic type (career advancement, obtaining a better qualified job, etc.) or for collective reasons in order to obtain better political and union know-how as regards their work and to be able to exert more control over capitalist strategies in the workplace.

It was found, however, that people's decisions were not shaped by either of these alternatives. People registering for the 150 hours say that they have done so in order to be able to achieve individual cultural goals, i.e. goals not shaped by pragmatic individual choices or based on collective motivations. People join collective trade union action in order to find answers to their own individual needs and aspirations.

The findings of the studies carried out at the end of the 1970s in response to the demand from workers for flexible working hours pointed in the same direction. Any strategy on working hours that the union proposed to workers received very different answers. Individual projects are always very different.

The interpretative rigidity of the social class model that proposes collective solutions came up against the different identities and plans of the men and women making up the wide-ranging world of manual and white-collar work. At the end of the 1970s a question was therefore passed on to the trade unions of the 1980s and 1990s: is it possible to achieve a collective trade union strategy (for training and not just for training) that takes account and makes the most of individual differences (differences which are not just inequalities but different aspirations), starting from the difference between men and women?

 Training policies for workers in the early 1990s: practices and interpretative models

Trade union policy and the relationship between unions and universities have undergone considerable change in the 1980s and 1990s. Italian trade unions, with their unitary policy in the 1970s, continued to increase their membership. In the 1980s trade union unity came to an end causing the regional and provincial unions to lose power as the national unions became the main protagonists and the unions distanced themselves overall from the world of research and thought, even though individual links and cooperation continued.

Technological change and changes in labour organisation brought about by the spread of the new electronic and computer technologies have also been vast and have led to a crisis in the links between unions and their members that is changing the link between unions and training.

From the point of view of members, the membership of CGIL, CISL and UIL fell from 7 225 000 to 6 065 000 between 1977 and 1987 and this downward trend is continuing even though there have been some signs of recovery in recent years.

The links between unions and training are changing; the following developments can be pinpointed from changes in the training policies of the unions of Emilia Romagna in recent years:

a) There is less interest in both the 150 hours and compulsory State education. Any thought about the content and values passed on by the school system has been abandoned and the 150 hours are no longer used by the unions for general education courses. Where possible, vocational training courses are offered. The 150 hours are now being used by people who have yet to enter the working world or who are in precarious forms of work;

2) See Capecchi and others (1982).
young people (men and women) who have failed to complete compulsory education and adult women who wish to return to work.

b) Increasing interest in vocational training managed directly by unions in response to technological change. Interesting experiments on the codetermination of vocational training courses are therefore being conducted in some medium-sized enterprises or under bilateral agreements with small business associations. A bilateral agency (EBER) has been established to formulate methods for vocational training organised under agreements between trade unions, public training facilities and company managements. These agreements are voluntary: enterprises can accept or reject this codetermination of training routes. It should be borne in mind that Italy does not have French-style legislation that makes it compulsory for enterprises to spend a percentage of their wagebill on vocational training.

c) Importance is still attached to research in the form of both case studies and systematic research (the latest in 1995 is on small enterprises and many specialists have been involved in the evaluation of the research findings). The link between trade unions and researchers is, however, of a consultancy type. The stable and very close links of the 1970s are a thing of the past.

d) A think-tank for ecological issues connected to a centre formulating strategy on the health protection of factory workers has been established. These two centres, together with initiatives for immigrants and emigrants and initiatives for the homeless, are now the focal point in the trade union for people who worked on the most innovative experiments of the 1970s. Within the union, however, these people have very little power.

The technocratic model is gaining ground and becoming ever stronger and, even in Emilian unions, any experiments which make it possible to acquire expertise in the new technologies are considered to be positive irrespective of the values passed on.

The model of conflict and social classes is therefore losing ground both as a result of the emerging technocratic model and because of its internal limits, which were starting to become evident as early as the late 1970s and which the union failed to address. Very few women, in particular, are to be found in present-day union structures.

Italian trade unions (including those of Emilia Romagna) have rejected the new interpretations put forward by women researchers in Inchiesta and elsewhere. These interpretations represent an epistemological break and women’s views, increasingly covered in the review, are at the core of the new culture of gender difference formulated by Luce Irigaray and pose far-reaching questions to male researchers and trade unionists that expose the extent to which the technocratic and social class models converge in practice on a basic point: they are both male-oriented and have the same internal logic of neglect/assimilation of the female gender.

In Inchiesta an article by Elda Guerra and Adele Pesce provides a detailed reconstruction of the innovations resulting from research by women over the last twenty years with reference to the relationship between cognitive processes, work and gender difference. These are far-reaching theoretical innovations with possible repercussions from the point of view of policy measures.

The Italian trade unions, whether national or regional, have not set any store by these interpretations. The predominant interpretative model of the unions changed in the 1980s and 1990s from a model of conflict and social classes to a model of reduced conflict in which the differences between the classes are considered to be of less and less significance and in which the basic approach is considered to be one of codetermination with employers. This has provided an interpretative model of reduced conflict and new cultural aspects, such as some ecological issues and some defences of the “welfare state” have become consolidated while the needs and aspirations of individuals receive little attention and the differences between men and women receive no attention at all.

Vocational training has become the focus of the link between trade unions and train-

3) See the two issues of Inchiesta entitled Sesso e generi linguistici (No. 77, 1987) and Il divino concepito da noi (No. 85-86, 1989) edited by Luce Irigaray. For an analysis of the economic development of Emilia Romagna making classification by sex see Adele Pesce (1990). Capecchi (1990a) makes an analysis of the relations between school and work in this respect.

“Vocational training has become the focus of the link between trade unions and training (...) the trade unions prefer to go along, often uncritically, with the technocratic model.”

The main question of the 1990s: (...) at a time of profound technological change and globalisation, how is it possible to achieve, in the various regions, development that is both technological and social (...).”

5) For these topics examined by Inchiesta see Capecchi Pesce (1993b, 1994).
Bibliography


Paid Educational Leave in Belgium: is legislation slipping off the track?

First of all it would be fitting to say a few words about our social and cultural background as the authors of this article. The Mouvement Ouvrier Chrétien (MOC - Christian Workers Movement) in which our activities are located, is made up firstly of social organizations such as the Christian Trade Union (CSC) and Christian mutual assistance organizations, and secondly, of cultural and educational organizations such as Vie Féminine, Equipes Populaires, Jeunesse Ouvrière Chrétienne and the Christian Cooperatives in the French-speaking part of Belgium.

As far as paid leave for education is concerned, the MOC mainly focuses its attention on the extension and consolidation of the cultural rights of the workers. It mostly organizes long-term training for this purpose but is fully aware of the vital need for training of a more professional nature.

We are taking this opportunity of explaining the amendments in legislation on paid educational leave in Belgium for three reasons: firstly, this law is important for workers in Belgium because the arbitration which it sanctions enables the development of a true cultural right of workers which we strongly advocate; secondly, this law is the first of its kind in Europe - at least to our knowledge - because it enables workers to acquire an individual right to training, a right which they can use to upgrade their professional knowledge and skills, to undergo vocational retraining, or simply to improve their knowledge in a field of their interest, or, for some workers, to mobilize their capacity for action as citizens or active members of society.

Finally, this remarkable legislative tool is in jeopardy today because the features which most strongly support the development of cultural rights, are progressively being undermined.

We will first give a résumé of the salient figures points of the law on educational leave (which dates from 1985) and then briefly review the sequence of events which led to this law and present the key issues upheld by the various involved; we will then explain why the present trend seems to lead to a dangerous track (in terms of the cultural rights which the legislation of 1985 acknowledged and which had gained recognition after a long historical process) and is, in our eyes, the wrong solution.

The law on paid educational leave in Belgium (1985)

This law permitted workers to take leave of absence from their work in order to receive training without any loss of salary and without additional costs for the employers because the financing was shared. Let us take a look at the scope of this law.

The beneficiaries of this law were full-time workers in the private sector. In comparison to the number of workers in the private sector (which also has part-time workers) the figure for those who really benefit from the system was a little above 2% (in actual fact 2% of salaried employees and 2.5% of the workers - the figures for 1990-1991) and the total number of beneficiaries was slightly above 50,000 persons per year. This meant that this system excluded part-time workers (where, as we know, 85% are women) and all persons employed in the public sector where a good number benefitted from a specific system of educational training.
leave with a narrower scope than the system for workers in the private sector.

A survey of the beneficiaries shows that there were a larger number of workers than salaried employees; half of them were aged 20 to 30, but more than 20% were in the above-40 age-group. In terms of break-down by sector, more than half came from the metal industry, one of the reasons for this being the well-developed training organized in this sector. Finally, over 60% worked in companies with more than 500 employees.

The training followed was defined by the law or was the subject of agreement on the basis of a dossier presented to a joint approval commission. Training courses of a general nature were almost exclusively organized by worker organizations (trade unions) and made up some 15% of the total number of training courses attended, but with less than 10% of the costs because these courses were relatively short.

The vocational training mainly consisted of:

Training courses organized as part of social advancement.
These courses were organized by the public authorities and were originally intended to offer workers a second chance through evening courses. This received a new impetus through a recent reform, even though budgetary constraints in the field of education in general prevented the implementation of all the planned objectives of the reform. It was possible to attend courses which led to the acquisition of diplomas equivalent to those in ordinary (secondary and higher) education, but also to attend more specific courses such as languages or computer technology.

In most cases the training courses were selected by the worker and were generally not of immediate relevance for the employer. The primary objective of this legislation was to raise the level of education of the working population and not to respond to employers’ needs.

Almost 55% of the beneficiaries of this law attended social advancement courses; in 1990-1991 this implied a number of 27,000 persons.

Training courses for middle class enterprises
The “middle classes” include self-employed persons and small enterprises. Here apprentice training and further training was organized; this training included the right to educational leave of the second category, which meant that these were vocational training courses (construction, accounting, tax system, management, electronics, etc.). 7,000 persons, or 15% of the beneficiaries, attended such courses in 1990-1991.

Sectoral training, organized almost exclusively by the metal industry via a training institute whose directors represent both sides of industry. This is the type of training where the rise in the number of beneficiaries was most spectacular: almost five times more within five years to reach a figure of 7,700 beneficiaries in 1990-1991 (15% of the total). In the following we will show that the introduction of these training courses unbalanced the whole system and, at the least, raised the question of refinancing because of the risk of excessively emphasizing training courses with an immediate professional usefulness to the detriment of the more global training of workers.

Finally, other types of training were proposed such as training courses at university or equivalent level, or training courses accepted by the approval commission, for instance, the training organized by the MOC - Mouvement Ouvrier Chrétien - (graduate degree in social labour sciences from the Institut Supérieur de Culture Ouvrière, a diploma recognized by the Faculty of Notre Dame de la Paix in Namur) and by MOC in collaboration with the Catholic University of Louvain (degree in Political, Economic and Social Sciences from the Faculté Ouverte de Sciences Politiques, Economiques et Sociales).

The social conditions of access to the training courses are set out in detail in the law; the worker continues to receive his salary throughout the training period; it is forbidden to dismiss him except for reasons which have nothing to do with paid educational leave. The joint labour/management committees in the companies have to reach an agreement which takes into consideration both the inter-
ests of the workers concerned and the needs of work organization through what the law called "collective planning". The salary to be paid is subject to a ceiling which at present is 65,000 francs per month gross salary.

The duration of the training was fixed up to 1 September 1995 (before the new provision which will be discussed later); the maximum period was 240 hours per year (equivalent to 30 8-hour working days) for vocational training courses and 160 hours per year for general education and training. The minimum has been fixed at 40 hours a year.

The State is responsible for the financing of the system as far as general education and training is concerned (whereas before 1985 the burden was divided between the State and the employers). Half of the salaries paid during training are subsidized by the State and the other half is paid from a special levy imposed on all employers in the private sector irrespective of whether their workers make use of the right to educational leave or not. This levy amounts to 0.04% of the payroll.

What assessment can be made of this law after ten years of operation?

There has been little evaluation of this measure. It is significant to note that the only assessment in ten years was inspired by budgetary considerations and was conducted by the Court of Audit.

In terms of quantity, the system has without doubt increased the number of beneficiaries (from 20,000 before 1985 to a little over 50,000 today). But it is still very marginal (2% of all persons employed in the private sector).

One of the stated objectives was to raise the level of formal education; however, no evaluation has been undertaken to ascertain the importance and the orientation of the acquired diplomas and certificates. It may be assumed that the university-level courses and a part of the social advancement courses resulted in a significant rise in the level of education.

On the other hand, the sectoral training courses (over 90% in the metal sector alone) have certainly improved the professional adaptation of the beneficiary workers, but in this case some justifiable doubts arise as to the legitimacy of making all employers share these costs (for the one-half contributed by the employers as the other half is paid by the State), whereas more than 90% of the persons trained attend courses provided by the training institute of the metal sector.

In general terms one may say that the very fact that education/training is an individual right (i.e. a choice made by the individual), that it involves a considerable effort on the part of the worker (just mere attendance of the course is not enough, the content has to be assimilated, examinations have to be prepared, etc.) probably entails a substantial improvement of the worker's knowledge. Otherwise, why all this effort? Other grey zones should also be mentioned: it is not possible to evaluate the impact of this legislation on work processes as a whole (better skills, better integration in the work organization) or on employment; if the fact of having a large number of workers in training leads to the assumption that at least some of these workers will be replaced, there is not much probability of this happening unless a sufficient number of workers are away on training and the company is not undergoing a recession.

In brief, all that remains is the effect of the training on the individual worker plus the implication that no collective impact (in terms of employment or the collective handling of work organization) can be identified unless the scope of the measures is broadened. But, recent decisions have not taken this path. In order to have a better understanding of the issues at stake, it will be useful to present a brief summary of the historical background.

The right to paid educational leave: historical review and the issues at stake today

Historical review

In the 19th century and at the beginning of the 20th century movements for the education of the people developed
within the Christian and socialist labour movements. They were to become the spearhead for the demand for the right to education. In 1936 the JOC urged the integration of evening courses into the workday by means of credited working hours.

**The law of July 1963** on social advancement granted educational leave for a maximum period of 1 week per year for the general and social education of young workers (below the age of 25).

From 1963 to 1973 3,000 to 6,000 workers benefitted from this measure. For adults too, social advancement allowances were introduced (bonuses to be paid when evening class courses were concluded with success) plus the right to credited working hours for purely vocational courses, provided there was a sectoral agreement.

This law led to the emergence of some key features: the reservation or lack of reservation of training for certain target groups and the limitation of the contents: recognized but limited general education for youth and vocational training for adults.

**The law on credited working hours** of 1973. Given an amenable social and cultural context, various legislative stages appeared in Europe and in Belgium: the 150 hour system in Italy, the law on lifelong learning in France. In Belgium, the interprofessional agreement of 1971 envisaged educational leave for trade union delegates; the law on political leave was passed in 1976.

The preparation for the 1973 law on credited working hours revealed the different concepts pursued by the employers and the trade unions.

The employers wished to limit the right to education to vocational training alone, to make the number of hours dependent on the decision taken by the joint commissions, to limit the right to leave to a period assessed by the employer in a dialogue between the employer and the individual worker, and to fix the maximum number of hours per enterprise.

The trade unions wished to extend the right to education to general and social education, to ensure the individual right to education, to make the provisions for granting of leave dependent on the Works Council or a collective agreement. In brief, everything was set up in such a way that... nothing happened. In the meanwhile the then Ministers of Labour (Ernst Glinne in 1973 and Alfred Califice in 1974) were preparing - each in his own way - to assume the role of mediator.

The law on credited working hours was similar to the law on paid educational leave mentioned above, however with a few differences. It limited access to training to persons below 40 and set up a progressive system of eligibility (25% of time for training in the first year, 50% in the second year, and 100% in the third year). It was not available for sectoral training. The current system has no age limit and has replaced the different percentages with 100% time for training but with a ceiling of 240 hours for vocational training and 160 hours for general training.

But, most important, the law on credited working hours set up a financing system (half by the State and half by the employers) which was intended to remove some obstacles.

The Royal Decree of 1974 extended the credited working hours to cover general education in order to promote the economic, social and cultural advancement of the workers. This was an important recognition of the legitimacy of general training as a complement to training which is essentially vocational. In an integral training system these two aspects can be combined to advance the overall promotion of potential and the personal and professional development of the workers.


In global terms, the law did not achieve the target. A mere one-half percent per year of employed workers actually benefitted, plus another 2 to 3 percent of full-time salaried employees over a period of 10 years.

A survey carried out at that time in 1977 by M. P. DELEPINE under the direction of Professor DAUCY for the Ministry of La-
bour and Employment showed that at least one-third of the workers who ordinarily had a right to credited working hours did not make use of this benefit, mainly because of fear of the reactions of their employers or, to a lesser degree, of their colleagues who would have a higher workload through the absence of the beneficiaries of paid educational leave.

However, one of the explanations for the limited use of this right is to be found in the limitations of the law itself: the age-limit of 40 years, the ceiling fixed on salaries, the limited provision of training, the apathetic interest of the employers. The incessant economic crisis accentuated the usefulness of a closer link between training and the needs of the enterprise.

For all these reasons the law on credited working hours was sent back for further consideration and led to the law on Paid Educational Leave (see above).

What are the key issues today?

Throughout, whatever the concrete modalities, the key issues always centred on five problems:

The target groups with a right to training. At first the intention was to restrict general training to youth and vocational training to adults. Thus, credited working hours were only granted to persons below 40. Also, the whole process only affected full-time workers in the private sector with the exclusion of part-time workers (who were mainly women) and workers in the public sector. Where would one be if a voluntary shift to part-time work were to be encouraged and subsidized? On the other hand, it was also quite clear that the extension of flexible working hours would exclude a larger number of workers (above all, women) from access to training.

The content of training. Within the Workers Movement there is a clash between those whose main preoccupation is vocational training and those who wish to lay more emphasis on the general training of workers. On the other hand, the employers’ representatives have always wished to restrict credited working hours, at first, and educational leave later, to vocational training courses.

However, despite these internal differences of opinion the Workers Movement never thought of dissociating the vocational and technical training and advancement of workers from their general, political, social and cultural education and advancement. This is perhaps one of the specific features of the laws on credited working hours and paid educational leave in Belgium as compared to other countries, a specific feature which has always been questioned and which has become the subject of conflict, as we shall see later.

The right to training is an individual right of the worker and cannot be inhibited by company considerations of work organization or by the desire to impose certain training contents on the worker.

This issue is obviously linked to the former issue: the further the training pursued recedes from professional necessities, the more the person who asks for access to this training must enjoy a true individual right not limited by any imperatives other than those of his own aspirations and his own interests.

The provisions for the exercise of this right should be the subject of negotiation in the joint bodies set up for this purpose and should not be left to the individual employer-worker relationship within a disproportionate power structure.

The financing of the system should make a difference between the respective contributions of the State and the employers according to the respective importance of general and vocational training.

This issue induced the legislator to precisely define what is meant by vocational training and what is meant by general training within the context of the same legislation, in order to subsequently define the respective contributions of the State and the employers (via a shared contribution from employers).

This list of relevant issues shows that it is erroneous to think that issues relating to cultural rights contain less seeds of conflict than others, even if the necessity of training is accepted by all parties and is the subject of ostensibly consensual discussion.
1995: a bad year for the cultural rights of Belgian workers?

In 1991 the Court of Audit was requested to conduct a management audit of the application of the law on paid educational leave. As indicated above, the original reason for this request was related to the budget. Indeed, the deficit which had accumulated after the scope was enlarged in 1985 (abolition of the age-limit, access to training organized by the sectors) reached more than 3 billion Belgian francs, and the annual deficit amounted to 600 million Belgian francs.

The analysis undertaken by the Court of Audit showed that the number of the beneficiaries of general training had risen by 37% in 5 years (1985-86 to 1990-91) but that this growth rate amounted to 305% for training in middle class enterprises and 246% for sectoral training which was virtually to be found in the metal sector alone. There was therefore a significant increase of training courses with purely professional goals. But these training courses are characterized by their brevity: for instance, we could establish that the courses for workers and salaried employees in the institute for post-school training in the metal sector did not exceed 120 hours per year, at least for 90% of the students.

The report presented by the Court of Audit raises one fundamental question: it asks whether it is economically justifiable for the financial authorities to assume one-half of the internal costs of custom-made internal or sectoral training courses! We calculated that the new training courses which were introduced after 1985 account for more than half the annual deficit of 600 million francs.

This means that the limit on the maximum number of hours only affects long-term courses, i.e. those where the worker has to put in the most effort, and does not touch the sectoral courses, 90% of which are below the new annual ceilings; but it is precisely the increase of these courses which accounts for more than half the annual deficit! In other words, it is the workers’ right to training which is adversely affected because the new ceilings for hours per year risk discouraging the workers from going in for long training courses. Two years after excluding the possibility of attending certain courses which were termed “hobby” courses, a new obstacle was raised.

If it is recalled, on the other hand, that 40% of the funds earmarked for paid educational leave are transferred to employers in the metal industry, in actual fact to a very small number of enterprises, and that the metal sector alone accounts for 90% of the sectoral training acquired within the context of educational leave, and if it assumed that other sectors will progressively enter the system, as the food sector, the garment and clothing industry and the chemical sector are starting to do, there are fears that new restrictive measures affecting the whole system may be imposed. However, another approach could also be taken, i.e. to make this an argument to re-design the cultural rights of workers by broadening the financing arrangements! It is not a question of disputing the dynamism of a sector, in this case the metal sector; on the contrary, this sector is characterized by a long tradition of joint labour/management efforts in the field of training and genuine participation by trade unions in training policies. But the extension of this dynamism to other sectors inevitably leads to a problem, to which the response is either sufficient refinancing or new restrictions with the risk that priority will be given to long and less specifically vocational training courses. It may be hoped that in future a more substantial contribution from the

“The analysis undertaken by the Court of Audit showed (...) a significant increase of training courses with purely professional goals (...) characterized by their brevity (...)”
Secondly, it is a response to the deficit of social, cultural and political participation, most spectacularly manifest in the rise of rightist extremism and the current apolitical attitude of people. More so than in the past it would now be absurd to separate the need for vocational training and adaptation to technological innovations from participation in social, cultural and political life. The high level of unemployment, however, compels the trade unions to attach more weight to vocational training courses, and the important issue here is to ensure real trade union control so that control of the processes is not left to the employers and their organizations. The historical stand of the workers’ movement of not dissociating vocational training and general training, within a framework of a general right of workers to training, is as legitimate today as it was yesterday.

It should therefore be possible to design new perspectives for an extension of the cultural rights of workers and, in this context, priority should be given to social interprofessional and professional negotiations, in order to achieve both the objectives of employment and the extension of cultural rights.

The issues outlined above which were more or less affected by the compromises of the past, recede into the background vis-à-vis another issue, that of the scope to be given to the right to education and the volume of financing. Consequently, the solution is not to reduce workers’ rights to training to one brief week for purely budgetary reasons, but to extend this right, together with adequate financing arrangements, in order to satisfy economic, social and cultural needs at the same time.

What new perspectives exist for the cultural rights of workers?

The desire to extend cultural rights was not always self-evident in the workers’ movement. Almost 40 years passed between the JOC’s “Journal for the unemployed” and the law on credited working hours. As indicated above, the belief in this struggle only spread gradually. But there are now excellent reasons to reopen the debate, because the demand for an extension of the right to paid educational leave has assumed new dimensions.

Firstly, it is one way of fighting for employment. Some large companies arranged educational leave for more than 1000 persons on their payroll in 1990-91. If the use made of educational leave is of such dimensions, then there is reason to believe that it will have a real effect on employment, either by the replacement of workers in training, or by reducing technical unemployment. Rather than taking measures to cut down the system, would it not be better, on the contrary, to make the right to paid educational leave one of the levers of employment policy, by providing vocational or general training through which more workers could be recruited, either because of a reduction of working hours or a reduction of labour costs?
The role of education and training in local democracy

A local politician’s considerations on education and training must be prefaced by some reflections on the meaning of democratic practice as it is understood today, since its implications can only be fully evaluated in a new socio-political context.

Democracy, in its literal sense authority of the people, only operates in practice by the reduction of the collective will to an individually elected people’s representative. The question of democracy in the modern context is whether the people can exert its authority without this authority having to be delegated to an elected representative or if, as suggested by the concept of participatory democracy, it can at least delegate this authority to an elected representative in the form of variable geometry - variable in space according to the subject-matter in question and variable in time according to its effect.

This is a major question confronting the French mayor, the elected representative for a set period of six years of a community of diverse interests within a defined local territory, the local administrative area of the commune.

The mayor knows he can no longer personify a population which is neither homogeneous in its aspirations nor even its relationships. In less than half a century, the catchment area in which the multiple functions of daily life took place - work, consumption, leisure, education, communication, etc. - has expanded to such an extent that the commune has completely lost its significance as a general location for daily exchange.

The borders between the local and global arenas are becoming too mobile and unclear for a local politician to be able to represent a group of citizens before another level of political representation. Whereas there has been no development in either the contours or the prerogatives of the local politician’s function for more than a century, this function is now being confronted with the necessary evolution of the role of the people’s representative and the very existence of this function is called into question if the original sense of the word “democracy” is to be retained.

My reflections as mayor on education and training in a local democracy must be seen within this existential context and, moreover, must be regarded as specific to my particular situation since they are of epistemological nature and therefore make no pretension to exemplarity.

As mayor of Parthenay (Deux Sèvres), a little town with 11 300 inhabitants in the heart of a rural region with a population of 45 000 people, the priority and urgency is to educate and train individuals to become members of the city of their time, i.e. “citizens of today”.

The individual has never had such an opportunity to escape from dependence on a transcendental order on the strength of the sum of knowledge and technological tools provided by his/her environment, or at least by the concentration of matter, energy and information sources from which s/he can draw. On the threshold of the 21st century, less related to the state, the pace of scientific and technological development is too fast to enable the relationship between space and time defined by the speed of a horse to be substituted by the speed of a car or a high-speed train.

“The role of education and training in local democracy must be seen within this existential context and, moreover, must be regarded as specific to my particular situation since they are of epistemological nature and therefore make no pretension to exemplarity.”

Michel Hervé
Mayor of Parthenay (F)
"(...) the point of education for the citizen seems to be to give him/her a sense of responsibility to induce him/her to seek harmony in the city."

"The areas of knowledge covered by school-based programmes are extremely limited compared to the multiple needs of life in harmony within the city."

of nature, s/he is becoming more of a player of history, more of a creator of the world, and is therefore not only more closely dependent on the artefacts s/he creates, but also more interdependent vis-à-vis others.

My concern is not so much whether education aims to promote the "active immanence" of the individual or whether it continues to close the individual in a "transcendency" to the pre-established ethical foundations; it is rather to make the citizen aware of the interactions and links of interdependency which s/he triggers by the very exercise of his/her personal creative power over nature and over others, a power which is gaining in strength from day to day.

Citizen of the city, player in the city, s/he must find the point of harmony between his/her own creative instinct and that of his/her fellow citizens. In a word, it is a question of assuming one's own responsibility. Relating one thing to another, communication and information feedback are an essential aspect of this search for an equilibrium.

Rather than being a player, the mayor therefore becomes a communication facilitator - one could even say a mediator - all the more so on account of his/her elected office, s/he is invested with a power displaced from the person in the street which forces him/her to self-limit his/her own power and assume a greater degree of responsibility.

In clear terms, the point of education for the citizen seems to be to give him/her a sense of responsibility to induce him/her to seek harmony in the city. The subsequent analysis of the educational mechanisms leading to this objective would be a matter for specialists if it were not for an evident corollary: one only becomes conscious of the link of interdependence with the environmental milieu by an act disrupting the equilibrium within this milieu.

Consequently, if the citizen is to assume his/her own responsibility, he/she must be helped to be enterprising, active and a player in the city. In this context, democracy consists of facilitating the conditions under which the citizen can be enterprising to be able to understand the links of interdependency with his/her milieu and therefore to learn to limit his/her own power of action.

Perhaps we could dispense with our own active experience if we were to accept belief in the theory confirmed by the experience of others - but this is only valid in terms of its own context and, as everyone knows, this context is developing at an ever-increasing pace.

The field open to educational action is therefore becoming incommensurable: it is multi-dimensional in its functions, it covers all areas of life and it takes account of all the dimensions of time (history, the present, the future). This new position within the social arena means that educational processes must be reformed on the basis of two "axioms".

**Axiom no.1: Decompartmentalization of areas of knowledge.**

The areas of knowledge covered by school-based programmes are extremely limited compared to the multiple needs of life in harmony within the city. For example, my first intrusion into the field of education as mayor was to create a municipal post with responsibility for road education on the fringe of primary education. My assumption in introducing this measure was that the driver's responsibility is an unavoidable reality of the modern city, the urgency of the issue being manifested by the annual incidence of fatalities and casualties on European roads.

In more general terms, what are the vast majority of people actually taught about health? At most a smattering of hygiene and dietetics; but nothing on medicine to enable people to ask the specialists the right questions. What about the environment and regional planning? Where is image culture taught to prevent manipulation by images? When is economics dealt with at school, although we are closely moulded by its thoughts? Who is taught about the methods and processes of production of the objects surrounding us in our daily lives? Have disciplines such as consumption, law, architecture, strategies, sociology, psychology, ethics, epistemol-
ogy, anthropology, the history of ideas, myths and beliefs and science been granted the “freedom of the city” in schools? No, they remain the preserve of specialists, although they make a fundamental contribution to city life.

**Axiom no. 2: Learning to learn.**

The volume of knowledge is increasing so rapidly and updating to such an extent that it is impossible to learn such a mass of information or concepts. We must therefore learn to manage knowledge and be on the look-out for potential sources of knowledge. Modern-day education should therefore not so much dispense factual knowledge as methods of appropriating knowledge.

The citizen needs to be in possession of methods to access, select and judiciously mobilize information and evaluate its relevance. S/he needs to acquire the attitudes of curiosity, a critical mind and self-knowledge. To be enterprising, innovative and to do things differently, s/he needs to accept differences, be in a minority or even marginal position and to revise his/her judgements. To live in a world of change, s/he needs to bring his/her frames of reference into perspective, extend space and deepen his/her relationship with time.

The citizen must learn to go beyond linear reasoning, use recursive analyses and multi-dimensional analogical approaches and develop his/her intuitive capacity. S/he must manage contradictions, paradoxes and conflicts. S/he must give priority to the dynamics of a process rather than its objective, which must be made absolutely provisional.

In this type of training, games play a leading role in view of their capacity to simulate and design. For this reason Parthenay set up the first games festival in Europe 10 years ago to disseminate the game spirit among all the target groups of the city. Similarly, the establishment of a reciprocal knowledge exchange network has facilitated the ongoing acquisition of knowledge by its interactive process, not so much because the citizen learns from others, but because s/he teaches others.

In view of the evolution of science and technology, the advent of new communication technologies, the utilization of information to optimize action processes, cultural, demographic, ecological shocks, the conceptual self-transformation of humankind in terms of identity and position, is it not necessary to abandon the model which recognizes school as the only place of education and childhood as the privileged time for this education?

In order to become a responsible player in a developing world, we must diversify educational locations, make training a life-long process and turn the city into the key location and link of learning.

In this context, the deepening of democracy and the dehierarchization and de-specialization of decision-making, action and creative centres can only serve to increase individual and collective needs in this field.

The people’s representative confronted with this dual demand for training and democracy necessarily becomes the organizer of a vast educational gathering at the level of his/her constituency. His/her task is to make the citizen feel concerned, give him/her the will to learn, encourage effort, amplify the conditions of the issue in question and bring forward new frames of reference. At the end of the road, a new, generalized form of education should take over from the school, revealing autodidactics and a new citizen: a responsible and philosophical being.
Reading

This section lists the most important and recent publications on developments in training and qualifications at an international and European level. Giving preference to comparative works, it also lists national studies carried out as part of international and European programmes, analyses of the impact of Community action on the Member States and national studies seen from an external perspective. The Section, "From the Member States", lists a selection of important national publications.

Europe - International

Information material, studies and comparative research

European Research Directory. A file of current vocational training research projects
Clarke, F.A.; Hayman S.; Brugia M.
European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP)
Berlin, CEDEFOP, 1995, multiple pages, paper and diskette version
ISBN 92-826-9899-8
EN, FR

The idea of preparing this first directory of current research on vocational training was formulated at a CEDEFOP Forum of research and development institutions. The objective of the directory is to make information available to research personnel, research institutions and all parties involved in research in this area, so as to facilitate cross-border cooperation. This first edition covers only research projects commissioned by public authorities, but later editions will be extended to include other types of research as well as transnational projects arising from Community programmes and initiatives. The directory consists of a list of research projects - on paper and diskette - accompanied by a methodological research guide and an index. The projects are classified according to country; for each project there is a description of objectives, methods and expected products. Also listed are the name of the institution in charge of the project, the commissioning institution, the budget and the duration of the project.

Coherence between compulsory education, initial and continuing training and adult education in Norway
Skinningsrud, T.
European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (CEDEFOP)
EN

In response to a request from the Commission, the Centre undertook the analysis of the educational and vocational opportunities in 10 Member States, Norway and Sweden, comparing their ability to forge links and interfaces between the means, content, duration and place of learning, in order to facilitate access to the lifelong learning process. The report has chapters detailing: the regulation of initial and adult education and training in Norway; public sector provision, comprising compulsory education, upper secondary and higher education; the relatively small private sector; the voluntary sector of adult education associations and labour market measures and training schemes. Organizational innovations to coordinate local delivery of education and training are also described.

Pays de l’OCDE. Le passage de l’école à la vie active
Freyssinet J.
in: IRES Chronique Internationale, no 33, Noisy-le-Grand, 1995, p. 3-6
ISSN 1145-1408
FR

This report is the follow-up of a round table seminar organized by OECD and the National Center on Adult Literacy (University of Pennsylvania) on 2 and 3 February 1995 in Paris, where experts from fourteen countries compared modes of transition from initial training to employment and examined the types of changes taking place in the countries involved. Participants tried to discover common tendencies and identify four contrasting models characterizing the solutions adopted in the various countries. The contributions to this seminar have been published in a special issue of the IRES journal, spring 1995.

Reviews of national policies for education - Sweden
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
ISBN 92-64-14380-7
EN, FR
As testimony to the wide interest in the Swedish experience in educational policy, a third OECD review has been released to assess the relationship between the quality of education and equal opportunity. The difficulties encountered in reaching this objective have led to a new policy that aims at more emphasis on competition strategies and decentralisation. As some of these recent changes have yet to be implemented, the report raises some essential questions about their significance and relevance, notably by focusing on the process for mapping policy, its institutional impact, the uncertain future of adult education, and the reforms in post-secondary education.

**Evaluation and the decision making process in higher education: French, German and Spanish experiences**

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)


ISBN 92-64-14303-3

EN, FR

Interest in evaluating higher education is growing in OECD countries today. This report focuses on evaluation as an essential element of an institution’s decision-making processes aimed at improving the quality of activities. It reviews higher education evaluation in France, Germany and Spain, three countries with a common tradition of strong government authority in higher education. The situation is currently changing and the debates on evaluation development demonstrate a common concern that evaluation should be integrated in and enhance the autonomy of higher education institutions. Developments in these countries, as described in an OECD seminar in May 1993, are assembled in this volume.

**Measuring the quality of schools / Mesurer la qualité des établissements scolaires**

Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Paris, OECD, 1995, 240 pages

ISBN 92-64-04355-1

mixed version: EN/ FR

How can the quality of a school be recognized and measured? In an attempt to provide an answer to this question, this publication examines how human resources, decision-making processes, teaching programmes, and organizational and teaching methods in schools can be expressed on the basis of comparable indicators. In order to better grasp and compare various countries’ school systems, the book looks at how these indicators are selected, their usefulness for public authorities, their empirical justification, their advantages and drawbacks.

**Education and employment - Indicators of education systems / Formation et emploi - Indicateurs des systèmes d’enseignement**

Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Paris, OECD, 1995, 160 pages

ISBN 92-64-04357-8

mixed version: EN/ FR

Teaching and training may be indispensable factors to ensure broad participation in a high-salary, high-productivity strategy aiming at the creation of lasting jobs, but they are not always ideally adapted to employment markets. This publication describes how international indicators have been used to elucidate the link between training and employment and their social and economic impact. The indicators are well-selected and useful to explain the passage from school to active life; they also allow a comparison of the internal yields of educational investment and an evaluation of the efforts on the part of various countries to favour ongoing vocational training, and show the influence of the differences in boys’ and girls’ educational routes and the respective advantages of these paths.


Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)

Paris, OECD, 1995, 247 pages

ISBN 92-64-04361-6

mixed version: EN/ FR

The educational statistics compiled in this publication are the basic data used to establish the indicators of teaching published in Regards sur l’éducation re-
VOCATIONAL TRAINING NR. 6 EUROPEAN JOURNAL

port, which this publication is intended to complete. This book examines the evolution of teaching systems between 1985 and 1992, covering the economic and social contexts of education, educational spending, human resources, pupil/student flows (total numbers, new registrations per level, certificates achieved) and the relationship between teaching and the employment market.

The OECD Jobs Study - Taxation, Employment and Unemployment
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
ISBN 92-64-14400-5
EN, FR

How do taxes affect the level of employment? What reforms could help create more jobs? This book analyses the evolution of labour taxation from 1978 to 1992, lessons about the impact of taxes on labour force participation, supply and demand, and the merits of policy options for the future.

OECD in figures: statistics on the member countries
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
EN
OECD, 2 rue André-Pascal,
F-75775 Paris Cedex 16

This brochure, published annually, aims to give a picture of the economies of the OECD member countries and the extent of structural adjustment within them. The overview of education includes public expenditure on education as a percentage of GNP, numbers of pupils/students and teachers in education.

World labour report 1995 (8 ed.)
International Labour Organization (ILO)
ISBN 92-2-109447-2 (en)
EN, ES, FR
International Labour Office, Publications Branch,
CH-1211 Geneva 22

Each year the Report devotes a chapter to each of five main areas: employment, labour relations, social protection, working conditions and the rights of working men and women. The 1995 Report focuses on: 1. controversies in labour statistics; 2. ageing societies and older workers; 3. privatization, employment and social protection; 4. public authorities and the other social partners; 5. retraining and return to work. This final chapter is concerned with the retraining and returning to work programmes which governments are targeting at unemployed workers and young school-leavers. It looks at the various options that exist and the latest developments in this area.

Internationales Handbuch der Berufsbildung
Lauterbach, U.
Deutsches Institut für Internationale Pädagogische Forschung
Baden-Baden, Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, Schriftenreihe der Carl Duisberg Gesellschaft e.V., n° 9, 1995, multiple pages
ISBN 3-7890-3730-3
DE

The Carl Duisberg Gesellschaft’s decision to produce a systematic description of the training systems in Europe and the major industrialised nations was taken to facilitate the international orientation of training, which is already evident. As isolated, national, decision-making in this area is becoming rare, this handbook is aimed at training experts, schools, enterprises, administration chambers and associations requiring information on the international context. An introductory chapter discusses the complexity of comparative vocational training research and the problems of comparing the systems. This is followed by a uniform chapter for each country which describes the training structure and how it relates the national political and economic systems. The handbook is presented as a loose-leaf binder which will be updated regularly. Descriptions of 20 countries are included and work is in progress on 15 more.

Construire la formation professionnelle en alternance
Poupard R.; Lichtenberger Y.; Luttringer J.-M.; et al.
Paris, Editions d’Organisation
1995, 217 pages
ISSN 2-7081-1838-2
FR
This publication presents four topics summarizing the main questions asked in France on the issue of alternance training. The first part, written by a member of an employers’ association, attempts to clarify the concepts involved and lays down the conditions for successful alternance training. The second part analyzes the relationship between alternance and vocational qualification, while the third examines the legal aspects involved. The final section investigates the alternance training programmes being used in various European countries and demonstrates that there are several types of alternance, each closely tied to the context in which it has evolved.

Vocational Training in the Federal Republic of Germany and the United States
Frenzel-Berra R.C.
Federal Institute for Vocational Training (BIBB)
Berlin/Bonn, BIBB, 1995, 72 pages
ISBN 3-7639-0550-2
EN

This study is the result of a one-year research stay by the American vocational training expert Robert Frenzel-Berra at the Federal Institute for Vocational Training (BIBB) in Berlin. After an introduction stating the reasons and methods of his research, he presents a number of selected case studies demonstrating the essential elements of German dual system training (chapters 1 to 4). In the fifth chapter he points out outstanding features of the system and compares it with the American system of vocational training. The publication ends with an extensive set of notes and a bibliography.

La formation supérieure des ingénieurs et cadres
Böhme H.; Curien H.; Decomps B.; et al.
Paris, Edition Jean-Michel Place
1995, 156 pages
ISBN 2-85893-254-9
FR

On the threshold of the twenty-first century, the figure of the engineer has come a long way since Jules Verne’s hero. Ongoing technological change and the globalization of production and exchange systems have revolutionized his fields of activity. On the occasion of the bicentennial of the Conservatoire National des Arts et Métiers and of the Ecole Polytechnique, well-known personalities in the corporate and research world were asked to examine the training of engineers and managers at a Unesco colloquium. Taking a look at the cultural roots of the profession, the convergences and divergences of the French, German and American training systems and their impacts on the economy, in particular with regard to innovation, the various authors propose a reflection on the relationship between science and technology, on the engineer’s responsibility as an inventor and a citizen, and point the way towards the development of a training system which would satisfy modern needs.

Training for employment in Western Europe and the United States
Shackleton, J.R. with Clarke, L.; Lange, T; et al.
ISBN 1-85278-863-1
EN

This book explores the economic analysis of training and relates it to the differing systems found in Western Europe and the United States. After an examination of the theoretical basis for increased emphasis on training, the authors present a comparative analysis of the different systems employed in Germany, France, the United Kingdom and the United States. A number of common issues and problems are discussed, such as the relationship between schooling and training, the role of continuing training, retraining for the unemployed, and the position of women and disadvantaged groups in the labour market. A central theme is the differing policies pursued by governments. While recognizing the common concern with potential market failure in training, the authors also draw attention to the poor record of government-funded training in practice and to the dangers of excessive intervention as a result of pressure group activity.

The match between education and work. What can we learn from the German apprenticeship system?
den Broeder C.
The Hague, Centraal Planbureau, Research
This report, examining the Dutch and German training systems, starts with a comparison between the two countries in terms of information on participation in various forms of training. This is followed by a closer investigation of the apprenticeship system in the two countries. And finally, the report describes the strengths and weaknesses of the German dual system and the lessons to be drawn from this for the Netherlands.

Schooling as a preparation for life and work in Switzerland and Britain
Burghoff, H.; Prais, S.
National Institute for Economic and Social Research (NIESR), Discussion Paper n° 75, 1995, unpaged
EN
NIESR, 2 Dean Trench Street, Smith Square, UK-London, SW1P 3HE

A comparative study of Swiss and British schooling, which states that there are many more low attaining students in Britain than in Switzerland. This has a direct effect on the quality of recruits into industry and consequently on national competitiveness.

Forecasting the labour market by occupation and education
Heijke, H.
Research Centre for Education and the Labour Market (ROA)
EN

This book brings together the papers presented at a symposium on the occasion of the fifth anniversary of the Research Centre for Education and the Labour Market (ROA). It was used as a platform to place the results achieved by this young institute alongside those of two more established European institutes, the Institute for Employment Research, Warwick, and the Institute for Labour Market and Occupational Research, Nuremberg. The goal was to get a better understanding of the approach employed by each institute in drawing up labour market forecasts differentiated by occupation and types of training. The symposium also served the mutual exchange of ideas, insights and concrete labour market information. Each institute provided a contribution for each of the three topics dealt with: the methods and techniques they use in making labour market forecasts; discussion of labour market forecasts which the institutes have made; and justification of and reflections on the approaches used in making their forecasts, regarding both the scientific side and the applications in policy terms.

DEVS - Development of Estonian vocational education system. Final report of evaluation
Harrebye, J.B.; Hemmingsen, L.; Nielsen, S.P.; et al.
Statens Erhvervspædagogiske Læreruddannelse (SEL)
EN
SEL, Rigensgade 13, DK-1316 Copenhagen K

A major Danish-Estonian development project during 1993-95 has now been completed. The aim of the project was threefold: to create a modern curriculum system for the Estonian vocational education and training system, based on management-by-objectives principles; to train curriculum experts at central level and at the same time train teachers at strategically selected vocational schools to use the new system and to develop schools, so that they can function in a market economy. In this final report, an overall description and evaluation of the DEVS project is presented.

Reorganisation der Arbeitsmarktpolitik. Märkte, politische Steuerung und Netzwerke der Weiterbildung für Arbeitslose in der Europäischen Union
Schmid G.
Social Science Research Center Berlin (WZB)
Berlin, WZB, 1994, 111 pages
ISSN 1011-9523
DE
The past few years have witnessed thorough reforms of employment market policies among some of the members of the European Union; in other countries, these reforms are currently being carried out or under discussion. What they have in common is a reorganization of employment market policies in an effort to increase competition and broaden the basis of responsibility structures so as to improve efficiency on the job. This study presents an analytical framework for the evaluation of these organizational reforms (chapter 1), applies this framework to the situation of employment market policies in selected countries (Denmark, Germany, Great Britain and the Netherlands) and, in the third section, discusses the theory behind the organizational conditions for successful ongoing training for the unemployed.

**New patterns of recruitment and training in German, UK and French banks. An examination of the tensions between sectoral and national systems**

Quack S.; O’Reilly J.; Hildebrandt S.
Social Science Research Center Berlin (WZB)
Berlin, WZB, 1995, 41 pages
ISSN 1011-9523
EN

This report is the authors’ contribution to a comparison of national models of industrial organization based on the example of the banking sector in Germany, France and the United Kingdom. The authors examine the changes in German, French and British banks’ recruitment and training policies in the field of private customer business. The study shows that market pressure has led to considerable change in the banking sector in each of the countries examined, but that different results have been arrived at. It demonstrates, for instance, that hiring and training strategies are not influenced exclusively by national training institutions, but that these institutions themselves are subject to transformation processes which have affected the job situation in the banking sector.

**European Union: policies, programmes, participants**

**Towards a European area for vocational qualifications. European Forum on Vocational Training, Brussels, 8-10 November 1993**

ISBN 92-826-8821-6 (fr)
EN, FR

Organized jointly by the European Commission, Belgium as President of the Council, the European Parliament and the economic and social committee, this first European forum on vocational training gathered the various participants - Community institutions, the social partners, Member States - around the issue of heading “towards a European area for vocational qualifications”. This report includes the papers presented by the various participants, their ideas, experiences and proposals.

**Partenaires pour les emplois et les formations de demain. Actes du colloque 13-14 juin 1994 à Paris**

Thierry D.; Perrin C.
Ministry of Labour, Employment and Vocational Training; Commission of the European Communities
Paris, Vocational training delegation, 1995, 22 pages
Délégation à la formation professionnelle, Immeuble le Mercure 1, 31 quai de Grenelle, F-75015 Paris

This paper presents a summary of the discussions on each of the four major topics included in this colloquium: - the impact of planned sectoral studies on the development of training for wage and salary earners; - developmental assistance from the French government to enterprises making a special effort in the field of training; - classification of activities on sectoral and national levels; - the consequences of European thoughts and activities with regard to the development of training.
Individual portfolio. Pilot project final synthesis report
National Council for Vocational Qualification (NCVQ)
London, NCVQ, 1995, 68 pages + annexes
EN
The summary of this synthesis and the recommendations are available in DA, DE, EN, ES, FR, GR, IT, NL, PT
NCVQ, 222 Euston Road,
UK-London NW1 2BZ

Following the Council resolution of 3 December 1992 on the transparency of qualifications, a working group consisting of representatives of Member State governments was established in 1993. The group has proposed the model of an individual portfolio containing information on the training, certificates, qualifications, professional experience, etc. of job seekers within the European Union. This synthesis presents the results of the pilot project to test the feasibility of the individual portfolio, together with the comments of the social partners, and proposes recommendations.

The puzzle of integration. European yearbook on youth policy and research
Circle for Youth Research Cooperation in Europe (CYRCE)
ISBN 3-11-014565-0
EN
CYRCE is an autonomous group of professionals, not part of any institution, national or European. It acts as a kind of “think-tank” and as research and policy consultancy for youth affairs and related questions on a transnational and intercultural basis. Its first yearbook introduces a biennial series providing a forum for transnational networking in European youth policy, research and practice. The main objective of the Yearbook is to inform on current trends and to foster the development of interdisciplinary and intercultural initiatives aimed at constructing a young citizens’ Europe.

The aim of the Vademecum is to explain the content of the LEONARDO programme’s policy objectives and operational principles. The Promoters’ Guide is intended for any parties involved in vocational training seeking trans-national partnerships and wanting to make proposals in 1995 for Community funding within the LEONARDO da VINCI programme d’action pour la mise en œuvre d’une politique de formation professionnelle de la Communauté (Council decision 94/819/CE of 6 December 1994 - JO L340/8 of 29 December 1994). Part A reviews questions likely to be raised by promoters interested in presenting a project. Part B describes pilot projects and placement/exchange programmes and the general elements (promoters, areas of application, target groups) of these two types of measures. It also describes selection and eligibility criteria and procedures applying to each of the sections involved. Part C lists details of Community measures for each of the sections.

Training, development and jobs. Six European initiatives
Lawson, G.; Hynes, B.; Sandrock, M.; et al.
ENTER: European Commission Directorate General V
EN
ENTER, 1, rue de la Verrière,
Les Baladines, F-06150 Cannes La Bocca

The six case studies examine: training and jobs in three large companies in the United Kingdom, regional development and company development through training in Ireland, training and local job creation in Denmark, the success of training development and employment in telecommunications in Germany and in tourism in France, and developments in the national approach to training in Spain.
With the LEONARDO programme and other new Community initiatives now being implemented, how can a trans-national project be characterized? What guidance tools are necessary to operate such a project? What is, in fact, its value added? After seven years of operation with the aim of developing vocational training for young people in Europe, the results of the PETRA programme can contribute to better preparing the future on the basis of the experiences of the past. This is the objective of this publication from RACINE, realized with the active participation of the PETRA projects with the assistance of the vocational training delegation.

**From Petra to Leonardo: European cooperation in initial vocational training: a Dutch perspective**
Fara T.; Meijers F.
‘s-Hertogenbosch, Centrum Innovatie Beroepsonderwijs Bedrijfsleven (Centre for Innovation Vocational Education Trade and Industry) (CIBB)
CIBB-studies, no. 5, 1995, 176 pages
ISBN 90-5463-056-6
EN, NL

This study maps the results of the PETRA programme. The aim of the PETRA programme was to contribute to an improvement in the quality of vocational education by creating structural cooperation links between vocational training structures from the various Member States of the European Community. The questions discussed include what the PETRA programme has contributed to the quality of Dutch vocational education, but also what key factors there are for the good functioning of internationalization programmes.

**Programa Petra - Estudo sobre as estratégias para aumentar e melhorar a progressão dos jovens na formação profissional inicial - Portugal**
Azevedo J.; Castanheira M.E.
Ministry of Education - Department of Secondary Teaching (ME-DES)
Lisbon, ME-DES, 1994, 85 pages
PT

This study, proposed by the European Union, shows the strategies followed by the various Member States to increase access and improve the progress of young people in initial vocational training. Its objectives are to study training policies and the transition of young people to active life, as well as to assess the success of activities carried out to increase the opportunities of young people with special difficulties in initial vocational training.

**The Youth for Europe Programme. Annual Report 1993**
European Commission
COM(95) 195 final, 11.05.1995, 12 pages
Luxembourg, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities,
ISBN 92-77-88347-2 (fr)
ISSN 0254-1491
DA, DE, EN, ES, FR, GR, IT, NL, PT

**Actes de la conférence finale d’impact du Programme FORCE.**
8-9 décembre 1994 Rueil-Malmaison
Centre d’Etudes de Formation d’Animation et de Recherche (CEFAR) - Délégation à la formation professionnelle
Paris, CEFAR, 1995, 89 pages
FR
CEFAR - Réseau France ASFO,
4 rue Quentin Bauchart,
F-75008 Paris

The French operators of the FORCE programme, together with the Task Force on human resources, education, training and youth, organized a final conference to examine the impact of the four years of activity of the FORCE programme. The topics covered at the conference and in this report include the impact of FORCE on training systems and activities, stock-taking, the implementation of the new LEONARDO da VINCI programme and liaison with the ADAPT Community initiative programme. The publication also includes a summary of workshops on transmission of skills in enterprises, quality and organization of work, and industrial change.
Análisis de la política contractual en materia de formación profesional continua en España
Duran G.; Alcaide M.; Flórez I.; et al.
Madrid, Centre of publications, Ministry of Labour and Social Security, 1994, 383 pages
ISBN 84-7434-851-X
ES

Prepared within the context of the FORCE programme, this publication presents a broad panorama of vocational activity and describes the structure of the education system, also covering the transformations introduced by the education reform. One major chapter covers the organization and main training activities of ongoing vocational training, all of this prior to the signing of the agreements on ongoing vocational training in December 1992.

La Formacion Profesional Continua en España
Duran F.; Alcaide M.; Flórez I.; et al.
Madrid, Centre of publications, Ministry of Labour and Social Security, 1994, 281 pages
ISBN 84-7434-849-8
ES

This report, which describes the current state of ongoing vocational training in Spain, was prepared under the FORCE programme. The first part, after describing the main characteristics of the recent evolution of the economy and the employment market, concentrates on the vocational training system planned under the National Vocational Training Programme. The analysis of ongoing training is based on data gathered from the main sources of statistical information and on the legal framework in which this type of training takes place. This section includes a major reference to the agreement negotiated between the trade unions and the employer associations: “National Agreement on Ongoing Training”, and to the agreement between both of them and the Government: “Tripartite Agreement regarding the Ongoing Training of Employed Workers”. The report examines the management, development, and guiding principles of these agreements as well as the bodies in charge of their operation, control, follow-up etc. Other aspects covered by the report are: financing of ongoing training, access to and participation in training, and planning, quality and vocational certification. The second part describes the activities undertaken in Spain to implement the guidelines contained in Article 5 of the Action Programme for the Development of Ongoing Training (FORCE).

Effectiviteitsmeting van bedrijfstoppleidingen (Anderlecht, Brussels, Constant Vanden Stock Stadion, 27 Mei)
Flemish Employment and Vocational Training Service (VDAB), International Relations Service (DIR)
Brussels, VDAB/DIR, 1994, 35 pages + annexes
NL
VDAB/DIR, Keizerslaan 11, B-1000 Brussels

This study day, organized within the framework of the FORCE European Action Programme, followed an earlier workshop on “Training plans for small and medium-sized enterprises”. The meeting focused on the importance of assessing the effectiveness of training with regard to increased competitiveness in small and medium-sized enterprises, with the aim of encouraging these businesses to implement training plans.

Rapportage Benelux ontmoetingen 1994 conferentie 20 en 21 oktober 1994 - Veldhoven Nederland
FORCE and EUROTECNET in cooperation with DG XXII - Education, Training and Youth ‘s-Hertogenbosch, Centrum Innovatie Beroepsonderwijs Bedrijfsleven (Centre for Innovation Vocational Education Trade and Industry) (CIBB)
1995, 103 pages
FR, NL
CIBB, Pettelaarpark 1, Postbus 1585, NL-5200 BP’s-Hertogenbosch

Report of the two-day conference, stating, among other things, its aims and target groups. The publication then includes the presentations held on the first and second days with reprints of the various papers read.

A wider vision
IRIS - A European network of training projects for women
Brussels, Reflections on women’s training, IRIS, 1994, 72 pages
This report is the first in a new IRIS series, under the title "Reflections on women’s training", on the issue of training for women in the current socio-economic context. This first publication investigates issues such as work and leisure, flexibility, télétravail and globalization of the economy from the point of view of the equality of the sexes.

Telematics for education and training: proceedings of the telematics for education and training conference Düsseldorf/Neuss, 24-26 November 1994
Held, P.; Kugemann, W. (eds)
ISBN 90-5199-223-8
EN

The education and training sector is undergoing a major change: the focus has shifted to learning rather than teaching, the individual learner is becoming a networked learner, the "learning organisation" with just-in-time knowledge provision is replacing large training departments and the development of personalized curricula instead of fixed training blocks is taking place. Telematic services for learning are playing a key role in these processes. The Telematics for Education and Training Conference provided an overview of the most advanced "state-of-the-art" telematics systems for learning, in terms of both technological and pedagogical innovation, in an European and global context. The concrete results of the research and development projects supported by the European Programme "Telematic networks and services applied to flexible distance learning (DELTA)" within the 3rd Framework Programme are presented here. Moreover, the Conference looked ahead to the initiatives of the 4th Framework Programme and the new Telematics for Education and Training subprogramme.

From the Member States

Handbuch der Berufsbildung
Arnold R.; Lipsmeier A.
Opladen, Leske + Budrich, 1995, 535 pages
ISBN 3-8100-1201-7
DE

This handbook on vocational training attempts to present the current stand of academic discussion on issues and problems of vocational training in concentrated form. From the perspective of practice-oriented teaching, vocational pedagogic categories can be postulated which are of basic significance for the design, concept and implementation of vocational training. The seven main chapters of the handbook consist of a number of essays and discussion contributions by various authors, supplemented by an extensive index of persons and subjects. The main chapters cover the areas (1) didactic activity in vocational training, (2) addressing target groups in vocational training, (3) skills and qualifications in vocational training, (4) teaching/learning contents of vocational education, (5) transfer and acquisition processes in vocational training, (6) frame conditions in vocational training and (7) research in vocational training.

Fichas para la Orientación Profesional
Ministry of Education and Science
Madrid, Ministry of Education and Science, 1995, 2 volumes, unnumbered pages
ISBN 84-369-2558-0
ES

Directed primarily at vocational guidance personnel, this publication presents information on the offer of vocational training and a concrete description of the most important vocational profiles along with the training involved and the social and employment market configuration which characterizes them.
Interim report of the Task Force on Long-Term Unemployment
Office of the Tanaiste: Task force on Long-Term Unemployment
EN
Government Publications Sales Office, Sun Alliance House, Molesworth Street, IRL-Dublin 2

This Task Force was established to examine and assess the recommendations in the National Economic and Social Forum's (NESF) report "Ending Long-term Unemployment" and to develop practical proposals that would improve the job prospects of the long-term unemployed. The Task Force examines how the considerable range of state services and resources can be better co-ordinated and developed into a coherent package of measures to be delivered at local level. It concludes, as the NESF recommended, that there is a need to provide a comprehensive, integrated, locally-based employment service for the long-term unemployed incorporating an intensive guidance and placement service. At local level, in areas designated as disadvantaged, the service will be managed by a local management committee under the auspices of the Area Partnership and in other areas by a management committee representative of state agencies, social partners and community-based groups. A final report, reviewing the implementation of its recommendations on the local employment service and addressing in more detail the proposals of the NESF in regard to increasing employment opportunities for the long-term unemployed, will be submitted to government later in 1995.

Occupational employment forecasts 1998
Canny, A.; Hughes, G.; Sexton, J.
Training and Employment Authority (FAS); Economic and Social Research Institute (ESRI)
ISBN 0-7070-0157-9
EN

This report, which contains occupational employment forecasts for 1998, is the fourth in the joint FAS/ESRI publication series concerned with analysing and forecasting occupational change in the Irish labour market. It looks at the likely growth over the period 1991-1998. An overall expansion of 115,300 jobs or 10.2% is expected. The results indicate rapid growth for managers/proprietors, professional, associate professional, and security workers with increases of between 20 and 23% forecast. Sales and service workers represent the next biggest forecast group - up to 20%. The number of employees in skilled maintenance will increase, at approximately twice the increase forecast for other skilled workers and semi-skilled operatives engaged in core industrial activities. The biggest decline will be for agricultural workers and there will be a lesser decline in the number of unskilled labourers. The upward trend in female employment is expected to continue as is the trend towards part-time employment, in which category women form a large majority.

Charting our educational future. White Paper on Education
Department of Education
ISBN 0-7076-0450-8
EN

This White Paper is the culmination of a lengthy process of consultation on the future of Irish education among all the major partners in education. Devolution of the powers of the Department of Education to 10 new regional education boards and a change in the management structure of the primary schools are the most fundamental changes proposed. A new Further Education Authority will provide a framework for vocational education and training outside the third-level sector, as well as for adult and continuing education. It will liaise with TEASTAS, the Irish National Certification Authority, whose function will be to develop and regulate certification programmes in these fields.

Routes beyond compulsory schooling
Payne, J.
Policy Studies Institute (PSI)
Sheffield, Employment Department, Youth Cohort Series, n° 31, 1995, 111 p.
Qualifications between 16 and 18
Payne, J.
Policy Studies Institute (PSI)
Sheffield, Employment Department, Youth Cohort Series, n° 32, 1995, 77 p.
Research Strategy Branch, Room W441, Employment Department,
Moorfoot, UK-Sheffield, S1 4PQ

These two reports by the Policy Studies Institute (PSI) are part of a programme of analysis which uses the England and Wales Youth Cohort Study (YCS). The YCS surveys young people three times after the age of 16, asking them about continuing education, training and transition into the labour market. So far, six cohorts of young people have been tracked in this way. The two new reports consider the options open for young people post 16. The reports map out the routes young people follow, the courses taken, institutions attended and the type of job and training taken up. They analyse qualifications gained, pass rates by gender, institutional differences on courses, influence on examination results and employment opportunities.

L’homme gaspillé. Enquête aux sources du chômage et de l’exclusion
Huberac J.-P.
ISBN 2-7384-2999-8
FR
Community programme of study visits for vocational training specialists

The Community Study Visits' Programme was established in 1985 following a Council Resolution (13 July 1983) and the Commission of the European Communities has entrusted CEDEFOP with the management of the Programme. Since the Council Decision of 6 December 1994, establishing the LEONARDO da Vinci Programme, the Study Visits' Programme is included in its strand III.

CEDEFOP acts in cooperation with a network of National Liaison Officers (NLOs). The NLOs are officials, formally nominated by the government authorities; their task is, in an autonomous manner to implement the guidelines and organizational procedures which have been fixed in agreement with CEDEFOP. The NLOs are in charge of distributing information on the Programme within their own national contexts. They liaise with the various parties involved in the realization of the Programme: social partners, enterprises, public authorities, vocational training organizations, research institutes, other Community programmes, etc. The NLOs are also in charge of the annual registration procedures and of the selection of the candidates who will participate in the Programme.

Programme objectives

The Programme's aim is to activate information flows in the area of vocational training among specialists from the Member States of the Community or from other countries associated to the programme.

Programme users

The programme is addressed primarily to vocational training specialists (public national or regional decision-makers, social partners at national and Community level and managers and planners of vocational training policies and programmes). It tends to favour persons who are in a position to spread the information received during the visit and to influence political decisions.

Some visits are tailored to special groups of users.

The visits

The visits last three or five working days and always have a specified topic. Groups of up to 12 persons are formed.

Visits are carried out according to a model which alternates information and reflection sessions and sessions of contact with the various parties involved in vocational training: enterprises, schools, documentation centres, research project coordinators, trainers, pupils, social partners, guidance officers, etc.

Financial aspects

CEDEFOP provides grants to contribute to participants’ travel and accommodation expenses.
Network of the Study Visits’ Programme National Liaison Officers

B (nl) Freddy Tack
Ministerie van de Vlaamse Gemeenschap
Departement Onderwijs
Dienst Europese Projecten
Koningsstraat 93 - Bus 3
B-1000 BRUXELLES
Tel.: +32-2-227 14 11
Fax: +32-2-227 14 00

B (fr) Maurice Bustin
Ministère de l’Education, de la Recherche et de la Formation
Cité Administrative
Bureau 4542
Boulevard Pachéco, 19 - Bte. 0
B-1010 BRUXELLES
Tel.: +32-2-210 56 43
Fax: +32-2-210 58 94

DK Mette Beyer Paulsen
Undervisningsministeriet
Erhvervsskoleafdelingen
H.C. Andersens Boulevard 43
DK-1553 KØBENHAVN V
Tel.: +45-33-92 56 00
Fax: +45-33-92 56 66

D Peter Thiele
Bundesministerium für Bildung, Wissenschaft, Forschung und Technologie, Referat 123
Heinemannstr. 2
D-53170 BONN
Tel.: +49-228-57 21 09
Fax: +49-228-57 36 03

GR Epaminondas Marias
Organisation for Vocational Education and Training (OEEK)
1, Ilioupolis Ave
GR-172 36 ATHENS
Tel.: +30-31-971 05 02
Fax: +30-31-973 02 45

E Isaías Largo Marques
Instituto Nacional de Empleo
Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social
Servicio de Relaciones Internacionales Conesa de Venadito, 9
E-28027 MADRID
Tel.: +34-1-585 97 56
Fax: +34-1-585 98 19

F Pierre Le Douarson
Délégation à la Formation Professionnelle
31, Quai de Grenelle
ImHerr Mercure I
F-75738 PARIS CEDEX
Tel.: +33-1-44 38 38 38
Fax: +33-1-44 38 33 00

IRL Patricia O’Connor
International Section
Department of Education
Floor 6, Apollo House
Tara Street
IRL-DUBLIN 2
Tel.: +353-1-873 47 00
Fax: +353-1-873 49 05

IS Ágúst H. Ingthorsson
Research Liaison Office
University of Iceland
Technology Court
Dunhaga 5
IS-107 REYKJAVIK
Tel.: +354-1-569 49 00
Fax: +354-1-569 49 05

I Sabina Bellotti
Ministero del Lavoro e della Previdenza sociale
Ufficio Centrale O.F.P.L. Div. II
Via Vicolo d’Aste 12
I-00159 ROMA
Tel.: +39-6-46 83 42 44
Fax: +39-6-46 83 42 32

L Jean Tagliaferri
Ministère de l’Education Nationale et de la Jeunesse
29, rue Aldringen
L-2926 LUXEMBOURG
Tel.: +352-47 85 139
Fax: +352-47 85 264

NL Hanneke Hiemstra
Ministry of Education, Culture and Science
Dept. BVE-K&O
Postbus 25 000
NL-2700 LZ ZOETERMEER
Tel.: +31-79-323 48 82
Fax: +31-79-323 23 20

NO Lars E. Ulsnes
Kirke-, utdannings- og forskningsdepartementet
P.O. Box 8119 DEP.
N-0032 OSLO
Tel.: +47-22-24 76 63
Fax: +47-22-24 27 15

P Idalina Pina Amaró
Instituto do Emprego e Formação Profissional; Direcção de Serviços de Formação de Formadores
Rua Xabregas, 52
P-1900 LISBOA
Tel.: +351-1-868 47 58
Fax: +351-1-868 75 05

SE Jonas Erkman
Swedish EU-Program Office for Education, Training and Competence Development
Box 77 85; S-103 96 STOCKHOLM
Tel.: +46-8-453 72 17
Fax: +46-8-453 72 01

UK Dave Skillen
EC Education and Training Division; Department for Education and Employment, Moorfoot
GB-SHEFFIELD S1 4PQ
Tel.: +441-142-59 41 17
Fax: +441-142-59 45 31

CEDEFOP
No. 3/94 The role of training in building the European Union

- European vocational education and training policy judged by its impact on the labour market and the construction of Europe (Alain d’Iribarne)

Community policies and programmes
- The vocational training policy of the European Union (Antonio Ruberti)
- Community vocational training programmes. Thirty years’ cooperation, action, concertation (Patrick Clemenceau)
- Investing in people. European Social Fund policy and priorities (Antonio Kastrissianakis)

The opinion of those involved
- The snarls of the market economy for future training policy: beyond the heralding there is a need for denunciation (Riccardo Petrella)

FSE assessment: the issue, an example
- The complexities of assessing ESF performance: some specific examples (Jordi Planas, J. Casal)
- The Community Initiatives “HUMAN RESOURCES” Experience and results of new cross-border programmes to promote vocational education and training and employment (Erwin Seyfried)

Transnational activities and projects
- Training in Europe grows closer - PETRA projects successfully completed (Uwe Lorenzen)
- Binational training of young foreigners (Werner Lenske)
- European Local Authority Interactive Network on Ethnic Minority Policies (Maria José Freitas)

From comparative research to decision making
- The Reform of Technical Education and Training in Great Britain. A comparison of institutional learning in Europe. (Arndt Sorge)

No. 4/95 The new Member States: Austria, Finland, Sweden

Trends in Nordic social “models”
- The difficult metamorphosis of the social “models” of the Nordic countries (Sweden, Norway, Finland, Iceland) (Janine Goetschy)

The education and training systems
- The Swedish training system - future expectations on its integration (Eugenia Kazamaki Ottersten)
- Features of vocational education in Finland (Matti Kyrö)
- Boom in apprenticeship training in Finland (Henry Vartiainen)
- Vocational training in Austria (Gerhard Riemer)
- Reforms in the vocational education and training systems of the Nordic countries (Pekka Kämäräinen)

The Nordic countries: an integrated labour market
- Experiences from the integrated Nordic labour market (Per Lundborg)

The new Member States: some data ...
- Statistical data
- Bibliographical data
- Useful addresses

No. 5/95 The production of competences in the company

A view of the debate in France
- Qualifying organisations and skill models: What is the reasoning behind them? What learning is involved? (Philippe Zarifian)
- Organizational learning, coordination and incentive (Louis Mallet)
- Organizational learning and mobility. Operations engineers in the chemical industry (Myriam Campinos-Duberret)
- Classification and new forms of work organisation: what links are possible? (Thierry Colin; Benoît Grasser)
Changing the design of the apprenticeship process
• Work-based learning in organisational change in the process industry (Jeroen Onstenk)
• Occupational learning against the background of in-plant innovation processes - Implications for vocational education and training (Gisela Dybowski)

Innovation in training models: the case of the motor vehicle repair sector
• Innovative continuing training concepts as a response to challenges in the European motor vehicle service sector (Georg Spöttl)

In-company training compared to the training system: the case of Rover in the UK
• In Pursuit of Lifelong Employability: priorities for initial formation (John Berkeley)

The occupational qualification and socialization systems: a comparison between Germany and Japan
• Education and Starting Work in Japan. Impressions from a comparison between Japan and Germany (Ulrich Teichler)
Members of CEDEFOP's documentary network

B
FOREM (Office communautaire et régional de la formation professionnelle et de l'emploi)
CIDOC (Centre intercommunautaire de documentation pour la formation professionnelle)
Jean-Pierre Grandjean
Bd. de l'Empereur 11
B-1000 BRUXELLES
Tel. 322-506 04 62/60
Fax. 322-506 04 28

C
VDAB (Vlaamse Dienst voor Arbeidsbemiddeling en Beroepsopleiding)
ICODOC (Intercommunautaire documentatie-centrum voor beroepsopleiding)
Frederic Geers
Philip de Smet
Keizerlaan 11
B-1000 BRUSSEL
Tel.: 322-506 04 58/63
Fax: 322-506 04 28

DK
DEL (The National Institute for Educational Training of Vocational Teachers - Danmarks Erhvervspædagogiske Læreruddannelse)
Soren Nielsen
Merete Heins
Rigensgade 13
DK-1316 KOBENHAVN K
Tel. 4533-14 41 14 ext. 317/301
Fax. 4533-14 42 14

E
INEM (Instituto Nacional de Empleo)
Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social
Isías Largo Marqués
Maria Luz de las Cuevas
Condesa de Venadito, 9
E-28027 MADRID
Tel. 341-585 95 82/585 95 80
Fax. 341-377 58 81/377 58 87

FIN
OPH (Opetushallitus/Utbildningsstyrelsen/National Board of Education)
Matti Kyrö; Leena Walls;
Arja Mannila
P.O.Box 380
FIN-0033 HELSINKI
Tel. 3580+77 47 72 43 (L. Walls)
Fax. 3580+77 47 78 69

IRL
FAS - The Training and Employment Authority
Roger Fox
Margaret Carey
P.O. Box 456
27-33, Upper Baggot Street
IRL-DUBLIN 4
Tel. 3531+668 57 77
Fax. 3531+668 26 91

I
ISFOL (Istituto per lo sviluppo della formazione professionale dei lavoratori)
Alfredo Tamborlini
Colombo Conti
Via Morgagni 33
I-00161 ROMA
Tel. 396-44 59 01
Fax. 396-44 25 16 09

L
Chambre des métiers du G.-D. de Luxembourg
Ted Mathgen
2, Circuit de la Foire internationale
B.P. 1604 (Kirchberg)
L-1016 LUXEMBOURG
Tel. 352+42 67 671
Fax. 352+42 67 87

NL
CIBB (Centrum Innovatie Beroepsonderwijs Bedrijfsleven)
Gerry Spronk
Ingrid de Jonge
Pettelaarpark 1
Postbus 1585
NL-5200 BP’s-HERTOGENBOSCH
Tel. 3173+680 08 00
Fax. 3173+612 34 25
Associated organizations

**Institut für Bildungsforschung der Wirtschaft (ibw)**
Monika Elsik
c/o abf-Austria
Rainemasse 38
A-1050 Wien
Tel.: 431+545 16 71-26
Fax: 431+545 16 71-22

**European Commission**
Directorate general XXII/B/3 (Education, Training and Youth)
Charters d’Azévedo
B7, 04/67
Rue de la Loi, 200
B-1049 Bruxelles
Tel.: 322+238 30 11
Fax: 322+295 57 23

**Research Liaison Office**
Arnason
University of Iceland
Technology Court
Dunhaga 5
Iceland - 107 Reykjavik
Tel.: 354+5254900
Fax: 354+5254905

**SICT (Servicio de Información Científica e Tecnica)**
Isaías Largo Marquès
FatimaHora
Praca de Londres, 2-1° Andar
P1091 LISBOA Codex
Tel. 3511+849 66 28
Fax. 3511+80 61 71

**EURYDICE (The Education Information network in the EC, Le réseau d’informa-
tion sur l’education dans le CE)**
Luc Pepin
15, rue d’Arlon
B-1050 BRUXELLES
Tel.: 322+238 30 11
Fax: 322+230 65 62

**NCU Leonardo Norge**
Halfdan Farstad
P.O. Box 2608 St. Hanshaugen
N-0131 OSLO
Tel.: 4722+865000
Fax. 4722+201802

**The Swedish EU Programme Office for Education, Training and Competence Development (SEP)**
Jonas Erkman
Box 7785
S-10396 Stockholm
Tel.: 468+453 72 17
Fax: 468+453 72 01

**ILO (International Labour Office)**
BIT (Bureau International du Travail)
Jalesh Berset
4, route des Morillons
CH-1211 GENEVE 22
Tel.: 4122+799 69 55
Fax: 4122+799 76 50

**IPD (Institute of Personnel and Development)**
Doug Gummery
Barbara Salmon
IPD House
35 Camp Road
UK-LONDON SW19 4UX
Tel. 44181+971 90 00 (D. Gummery)
Fax. 44181+263 33 33

**Department of Education and Employment**
Julia Reid
Moorfoot
UK-SHEFFIELD S1 4PQ
Tel.: 44114+275 32 75
Fax: 44114+59 35 64